

**A Comparative Study on Quality Management in the Brazilian and
the Scottish Prison Service**

Marcelo Milano Falcão Vieira

Ph.D. in Business Studies

University of Edinburgh

1996



Declaration

I am responsible for composing this dissertation. It represents my own work and where the work of others has been used it is duly acknowledged.



Marcelo Milano Falcão Vieira

**To Clóvis L. Machado-da-Silva for
enlightenment, support, and friendship.**

**To Carlos Falcão Vieira Valente who
became one more reason for seeking new
and better forms of organisations.**

"If you think... that anything like a romance is preparing for you, reader, you are never more mistaken. Do you anticipate sentiment, and poetry, and reverie? Do you expect passion, and stimulus, and melodrama? Calm your expectations, reduce them to lower standards. Something real, cool and solid lies before you; something unromantic as Monday morning, when all who have work wake with the consciousness that they must rise and betake themselves thereto." (Charlotte Brontë: Prelude to Shirley - cited in the novel "Nice Work" by David Lodge)

Acknowledgements

During the last eight years I have been involved in the study of organisations, first as a M.A. student and later as a research fellow at the Federal University of Santa Catarina. In that period, I had the great pleasure to share experiences with many interesting people. Some of them had particular influence on my decision to pursue my studies. They are Dr. Clóvis L. Machado-da-Silva, to whom this thesis is dedicated, Rosimery Carvalho, Cristina Carvalho, Eloise H. L. Dellagnello, Valéria Silva da Fonseca and Dr. Erni J. Seibel. For them, many thanks.

I am very grateful to Dr. Patricia Findlay and to Dr. James Hine who, as my supervisors, gave me the support to develop my ideas.

I wish to thank CAPES - a Brazilian Government organisation, for sponsoring my study, and specially Vanda Lucena who competently dealt with the specific administrative issues.

I also wish to thank many people and organisations that helped me in different stages of the research. Professor Stewart Clegg put me in touch with Quality Scotland Foundation, an organisation that provided the initial contacts for the development of the fieldwork in Scotland. In Brazil I had the great support of the Group for Research in Organisations at the Federal University of Santa Catarina. Mr. Marcos Hoffman was responsible for establishing the initial contact for the development of the fieldwork in the Brazilian Prison Service - Santa Catarina State. Governors, technicians and prison officers in the four prisons studied, and in the respective headquarters, were kind enough to give their statements on the many issues raised by myself about their work. In the Department of Business Studies at the University of Edinburgh, Kit Gardner and Lorraine Edgar helped me with kindness to deal with the operational and formal procedures of the doctoral programme. Ms. Lyn Simpson corrected my English.

In Scotland I had the opportunity to meet many friends with whom I shared great moments. Some of them were kind enough to listen to issues related to my research, even without understanding very much about the subject. They became, in some sense, my Scottish family. These friends are Manoel Cláudio da Silva Jr., Tânia Sanaïotti, Nancy Freeman, Marcelo Navas, Alberto and Goretti Castro, Mônica Decanini, Rogério Gribel and Maristerra Lemes (also Pedro and Daniel), Ildney Cavalcanti and Marcos Vermelho, Mônica Wachowicz, Marcelo Nascimento and Dora Vilela, Sonia Albores, Maria Pinotti, Rubi Carasco, Martha Baur, Alexandra and Apoema Salgueiro, Christina Barth and Volker Murr, Ida Lúcia Cypriano, Mário César de Pinho Oliveira, Carla Palácio, Cícero Péricles de Carvalho (also Daniel and André), and Eduardo and Denise Lopes.

In the final stages of the doctoral programme I got an academic position at the Federal University of Pernambuco - Brazil. My new colleagues were supportive enough to give me a leave of absence so that I could finish writing up the thesis.

Finally, my great gratitude goes to my parents Eurípedes and Cila, and to my sister Eleonora, who always gave all the unconditional support needed.

Abstract

This study identifies and compares quality perceptions and initiatives between the Scottish Prison Service (SPS) and the Brazilian Prison Service - Santa Catarina State (BPS-SC). The two organisations have specific approaches towards quality management. The SPS is involved in a formal quality management programme, whereas in the BPS-SC quality is determined at a more abstract level. In the case of the SPS the impact of the quality management programme on the job structure (design and satisfaction) in different organisational levels, and in organisational control, is analysed in depth. In the case of the BPS-SC, significant structural aspects that determine quality perceptions and initiatives are identified and discussed. The study also considers the influences of the institutional environments in which each organisation operates in the shaping of quality perceptions and initiatives. Four case studies were conducted: two in Scotland and two in Brazil. The research strategy adopted is mostly qualitative, although some basic quantitative analysis is used. The case studies conducted were exploratory and descriptive. Data was collected by means of open-ended interviews, documentary analysis, informal interviews and participation in training sessions. The analysis of the data was conducted on a qualitative basis, and subjected to triangulation techniques. Clustering process techniques for qualitative data were also used in some cases. The results indicate that quality cannot be regarded as an universal concept. Quality definition and initiatives vary among and within organisational groups in the same context, as well as within the same organisational groups in different institutional contexts. In terms of the impact of the introduction of a formal quality programme on the job structure and control process of the SPS, the results demonstrate that quality management can provide a degree of job enrichment and can also contribute to a re-skilling process. Although this contributes to the increase in job satisfaction, the general work

environment is not necessarily improved. A tendency to establish output measures of control as a substitute for the more personal and behavioural ones was identified. The results also suggest that quality management can act as a cultural control device when a strong and well defined human resources management policy is established. The results of the SPS case, and particularly those of the BPS-SC case, indicate the importance of considering organisational groups and objectives in the analysis of quality perceptions and initiatives in organisations. Finally, the study also presents evidence that the variation in quality perceptions and initiatives among different organisational contexts are, to a certain extent, determined by the characteristics of the institutional environment in which the organisations operate.

Resumo

O presente trabalho identifica e compara percepções e iniciativas em relação à administração da qualidade entre o Serviço Penitenciário Escocês (SPE) e o Serviço Penitenciário Brasileiro - Estado de Santa Catarina (SPB-SC). As duas organizações adotam diferentes abordagens em relação à administração da qualidade. O SPE está envolvido em um programa formal de administração da qualidade. No SPB-SC a preocupação com qualidade é determinada em um nível mais abstrato. No caso do SPE o impacto do programa de administração da qualidade na estrutura de trabalho (desenho e satisfação no trabalho) em diferentes níveis organizacionais, bem como no controle organizacional, é analisado em profundidade. No caso do SPB-SC aspectos estruturais significativos na determinação das percepções e iniciativas em relação à administração da qualidade são identificados e discutidos. O estudo também considera a influência do ambiente institucional onde as organizações operam na formação das percepções e iniciativas em relação ao gerenciamento da qualidade. Quatro estudos de caso foram conduzidos: dois na Escócia e dois no Brasil. A estratégia de pesquisa adotada é qualitativa em sua maioria, apesar do uso de algumas análises quantitativas básicas. Os estudos de caso conduzidos caracterizam-se como exploratórios e descritivos. Os dados foram coletados através de entrevistas semi-estruturadas, análise documental, entrevistas informais e participação em seções de treinamento. A análise dos dados foi conduzida de forma qualitativa, com o uso da técnica de triangulação. Técnicas de análise de agrupamento foram conduzidas em alguns casos específicos. Os resultados indicam que qualidade não pode ser considerada como um conceito universalista. A definição e as iniciativas de administração da qualidade variam intra e entre grupos organizacionais no mesmo contexto, bem como em relação aos mesmos grupos organizacionais em diferentes contextos. No que se refere ao impacto da introdução

do programa formal de qualidade na estrutura de trabalho e no controle no SPE, os resultados demonstram que a administração da qualidade pode oferecer um certo grau de enriquecimento das tarefas, além de contribuir para um processo de reabilitação ou des-Taylorização do trabalho. Embora isto contribua para um aumento da satisfação no trabalho, o ambiente de trabalho não necessariamente melhora. Foi detectada uma tendência para o estabelecimento de medidas de controle baseadas em resultados, em substituição às medidas baseadas em supervisão direta. Os resultados também sugerem que a administração da qualidade pode atuar como um mecanismo de controle cultural, quando uma política de recursos humanos bem definida e direcionada é estabelecida. Os resultados relativos ao caso do SPB-SC em particular, mas também os que se referem ao SPE, apontam para a importância de se considerar grupos organizacionais e objetivos na análise do gerenciamento da qualidade nas organizações. Finalmente, o estudo apresenta evidências de que a variação nas percepções e iniciativas de administração da qualidade entre diferentes contextos é determinada, em certo grau, pelas características do ambiente institucional onde as organizações operam.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	iii
Resumo	v
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1. Field of Investigation, Research Problem, and Objectives	1
1.2. Theoretical and Practical Justification	5
1.3. The Structure of the Thesis	7
Chapter 2: Conceptual and Empirical Developments on Quality Management	10
2.1. Quality and Quality Management	10
2.2. Quality Management: from Manufacturing to the Service and Public Sectors	16
2.3. Studies in Quality Management	23
2.3.1. Organisation Studies and Quality Management: Job Structure and Control	23
2.3.2. Perceived Quality	33
2.4. The Role of Operative Objectives in Understanding Quality Initiatives in Organisations: a Proposed Approach	38
Chapter 3: Institutional Contexts and Organisations	45
3.1. Environments and Organisations	45
3.2. The Scottish Prison Service Context: Managerialism and the "New Public Service" in Britain	51
3.3. The Brazilian Prison Service - SC Context: Formalism and Patrimonialism in the Public Service	56
Chapter 4: Methodology	62
4.1. Research Questions, Key Concepts and Variables	62
4.2. Research Design	66
4.3. Fieldwork	69
4.4. Data Analysis	73
4.5. Limitations of the Study	76

Chapter 5: Quality, Job Structure and Control in the Scottish Prison Service (SPS)	79
5.1. Organisation of the Scottish Prison Service	79
5.2. Quality Initiatives Within the Scottish Prison Service	81
5.2.1. Top Management Commitment to Quality and Visible Leadership	85
5.2.2. They know their Business and Who their Customers are	89
5.2.3. Knowing and Meeting Customers Needs is a Priority	95
5.2.4. Employees are Empowered and Encouraged to Take Ownership of the Services to be Provided	96
5.2.5. Clear and Effective Communication	97
5.2.6. High Priority to Training	99
5.2.7. Set Clear Targets, Seek Continuous Improvement	101
5.3. Case Studies: Perth Prison and Dungavel Prison	104
5.3.1. General Characteristics	104
5.3.2. Quality Definition, Rationale, and Customers Identification	106
5.3.3. Quality and Job Structure: Design, Satisfaction and Control	119
5.3.3.1. The Governors and the Technicians	121
5.3.3.2. The Prison Officers	132
5.4. Discussion and Conclusions	137
 Chapter 6: Quality, Objectives and Groups in the Brazilian Prison Service - State of Santa Catarina (BPS-SC)	 142
6.1. Organisation of the Brazilian Prison Service (BPS-SC)	142
6.2. Issues on Quality in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC	144
6.3. Quality Initiatives and Structural Objectives Within the BPS-SC	145
6.4. Case Studies: Florianópolis Prison and Chapecó Prison	152
6.4.1. General Characteristics	152
6.4.2. Groups, Objectives and Quality Definition	155
6.4.2.1. The Governors	156
6.4.2.2. The Technicians	163
6.4.2.3. The Prison Officers	168
6.4.3. Rationale of Quality Definition and Customer Identification	172

6.4.4. Dynamics of Quality Initiatives:	
Objectives and Power	176
6.5. Discussion and Conclusion	182
 Chapter 7: Quality in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC and in the Scottish Prison Service: a Comparison	 185
7.1. Quality Definition, Rationale, Customer Identification, and Organisational Groups in the BPS-SC and in the SPS	185
7.2. The Overall Quality Image of the BPS-SC and the SPS: Power and Institutional Context	192
7.3. Discussion and Conclusion	208
 Chapter 8: General Conclusions and Recommendations	 211
 References	 221
Appendix 1	232
Appendix 2	233

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1. The Field of Investigation, Research Problem and Objectives

Organisations are considered an essential focus for social studies. Although there is a considerable amount of knowledge accumulated in this field, it is still a new one when compared to other well established areas of scientific investigation. As Perrow (1986) points out, a few decades ago organisation students borrowed theories from other areas of study in order to elaborate their own theories and to pursue their empirical investigation. Although organisational analysis still has a strong and important interdisciplinary nature, nowadays this nature is much more a "two way" one; that is to say that organisation studies also provide other areas of investigation with theories, data and general knowledge.

One of the major themes that has been a focus of increasing attention in the organisation studies literature for the past decade is that of quality management. When the first ideas on the subject started to be published in the form of books and scientific papers, many professionals (academics and non-academics) argued that it would be another fad predestined to oblivion. However, quality management grew in importance as a theme of investigation and, in some industrialised countries - particularly in the United States, it received the status of a social movement (Hackman and Wageman 1995).

Quality management spread from its origins in manufacturing organisations to all sorts of services and public enterprises. This is perhaps due to the fact that quality management is not an isolated phenomenon. Some authors have argued that it is an important component of a new era of economic globalisation and market relations (Hill 1991a; Hill 1991b; Piore and Sabel 1984). Increasing attention to modernisation of either national or international environments has encouraged

organisations to seek new patterns of performance. Quality management, flexible specialisation, Just-in-Time production systems, and other related concepts, are in the core of such context. Quality has been studied in the literature in a variety of ways. Some studies in the area focused on the formal methods used to achieve the final design of a product, with emphasis on flexible production systems and statistical controls (Deming, 1986; Piore and Sabel 1984; Juran 1979). Other studies focused on customers' perceptions of quality products and services, which enabled researchers to elaborate models aiming to define and measure quality as a general concept (Lewis and Mitchell 1990; Zeithaml, Barry and Parasuraman 1988; Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry 1985). Organisation studies have been mostly analysing the dimension of quality management related to the labour process. It has been aiming at investigating the impact of quality programmes on the division of labour and on the control over the production process (Sewell and Wilkinson 1992; Dawson and Webb 1989).

Most of this work was carried out in organisations that were involved in a formal quality management programme. There are, however, organisations that are not involved in formal initiatives on quality management. Moreover, in some other organisations the concept of customer, a key word involving quality related issues on managerial and marketing literature, is not a straightforward one (e.g. prisons, hospitals, asylums, military organisations). In these cases, the definition and measurement of quality through customer satisfaction is also problematic. Even a more generic definition of quality like "conformance to requirements" (also common in the managerial literature - see Oakland [1989], for example) does not seem to be applicable when one argues on the fundamental mission of an organisation, and raises the question of conflicting objectives (e.g. the constant tension between objectives of custody and rehabilitation in prisons, or objectives of education and politics and those of plain transmission of a religious doctrine in the church).

Since quality is an abstract concept and is considered to be an intrinsic characteristic of something, these kind of organisations also have, even in an implicit way, an idea of what is, or is not, quality in relation to the activities they perform.

The issue of how to analyse quality management initiatives in such organisations is rather complex, since there are no objective elements allowing specific definitions or measurements. However, if quality is ultimately related to perceptions of the "goodness" of something, organisational groups' perception of quality practices, and their related initiatives, could perhaps add useful insights to the understanding of the issue.

Different organisational groups are responsible for the running of organisational activities and they are expected to do it with some standard of quality. Since different organisational groups have different objectives it is possible to assume that their quality perceptions and initiatives will be linked, to some extent, with their objectives. The overall quality image of the organisation would then vary in accordance to the changing of the groups in the power positions in the organisation.

It can be argued that even in the case of an established formal quality management programme, one specific organisational group is imposing its quality perception on the organisation - the managers. It would be interesting then to identify how other organisational groups perceive a formal managerial programme as related to quality initiatives. It would also be interesting to compare quality perceptions among organisational groups in a context of a formal quality management programme, with quality perceptions in a context where quality initiatives are more related with an abstract concept. Some pattern could be expected to emerge from such a comparison, perhaps enabling the analysis of quality in a more general form.

Taking into consideration the importance of these related issues, this study aims at identifying and analysing quality initiatives in two organisations. One of them

is involved in a formal quality management programme, while the other is not. The following problem of research was then established:

"What is the nature of the concept of quality, and of its relationship with structural aspects of the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Service?"

Another important dimension which added to the issues that led to the investigation of the above research problem, is the cross-cultural framework. No studies have directly analysed the relationship of the introduction of quality programmes and the emergence of different forms of organisation in diverse institutional contexts, although some of them have mentioned it. The importance of cross-cultural research on the relationship between institutional environments and organisational dimensions have been claimed by authors like Scott and Christensen (1995), and Scott and Meyer (1994).

Institutional environments influence organisational forms and activities in the sense that they are cultural systems, which include normative rules and belief systems, as well as the relational network that arises in the broader societal context (Meyer and Scott 1992). It is believed that a group of shared myths and beliefs can, and will, guide organisational action because it creates a socially legitimated definition. These patterns of meaning and groups of shared beliefs and rules are reproduced in the organisations, giving them legitimacy.

The implementation of quality management programmes is more developed in industrialised countries. The United Kingdom, for instance, has a well consolidated and efficient system of quality certification for organisations. But considering the new external policy of economic and market relations in Brazil, the implementation of, and interest in, quality programmes has been increasing in the last few years. Brazil and the United Kingdom obviously have different origins and histories, which create different cultures and institutions. Some characteristics of

these different environments are expected to explain, to a certain degree, quality perceptions, initiatives and related aspects of the organisational structure of the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Service.

In order to clarify the investigation of the proposed research problem, some specific objectives were set for this study, as follows:

a) to identify significant components of quality definition and initiatives in the Scottish Prison Service (SPS) and the Brazilian Prison Service (SPS-SC);

b) to identify the rationale behind quality definition in the SPS and the BPS-SC;

c) to identify and to discuss the impact of the SPS quality management programme on structural aspects (job design, satisfaction and control) of the organisation;

d) to identify elements of the organisation of the BPS-SC that have significant relevance in quality perceptions and initiatives within the organisation;

e) to compare quality definition and initiatives between the SPS and the BPS-SC; and

f) to identify and to describe possible evidence of the influence of institutional environment characteristics on quality perceptions and initiatives in the SPS and the BPS-SC.

Due to limitations of resources and time schedules, the Brazilian case will centre on Santa Catarina State, in the south of Brazil, and will be referred to as the Brazilian Prison Service - Santa Catarina State (BPS-SC).

1.2. Theoretical and Practical Justification

It is not difficult to see the importance of quality management programmes like TQM in terms of the way in which they relate to organisational control and performance. They do this, obviously, through control over "quality", but this control

can be achieved only by higher controls over different aspects of the organisation's structure and processes. The understanding of the links between quality management practices and organisational dimensions is therefore fundamental in providing the basis for organisational practices (in all levels - from management to labour) and social action.

Since quality management has become a major subject in the literature on administrative studies in general, it is important to also elucidate aspects related to its diffusion to areas different from those where the concept originated from, like the service and the public sector. The amount of knowledge based on empirical studies in these areas is still small. Moreover, one can argue that quality was, and will always be, an important issue to be considered in the organisational activities, even before the introduction and rise of quality management as the managerial concept of the 1990s. Specialised literatures both on quality management and organisation studies do not contain much empirical information on quality practices in organisations which are not involved in formal quality management programmes or which have a problematic definition of customers.

Quality management ideas and techniques have been regarded as universal. However, there are few, if any, empirical investigations on the subject of a cross-cultural comparison. Studies of this nature would provide useful information on the subject and contribute to the development of the knowledge in the area.

The choice for the study of the prison service in Scotland and in Brazil was taken on the basis of the above statements. The suitability of the two prison services (SPS and BPS-SC) as the objects of the study for the mentioned theoretical and empirical purposes is justified as follows:

- the Scottish Prison Service was engaged in a formal quality management programme. It would then be possible to discuss its impact on some of the organisation's structural aspects. It would also be possible to discuss particular

issues related to the introduction of TQM in a public sector organisation as, for example, the use of the concept of customer;

- the Brazilian Prison Service - SC was not involved in a formal quality management programme. This would allow the analysis and discussion of quality definition and initiatives to be carried out on a different basis. It would also provide initial evidence on the suitability of the established knowledge on "groups and objectives" as a theoretical framework for the understanding of quality perceptions and initiatives in an organisation; and
- the cross-cultural nature of the research would add to the understanding of institutional influences on the construction of organisational realities in different cultures.

From a practical point of view, this study can be seen as an aid to organisations looking for new patterns of operation and performance through the adoption of quality programmes in any of its variations. Moreover, it can clarify what some of the likely effects of its implementation will be on organisational design, particularly in terms of the public sector. This is an interesting issue, especially for the Brazilian case, where the issue of quality management in the public sector is relatively new.

For this reason, a comparative study between organisations in Scotland and in Brazil is important for both the academy and the organisational practice, especially considering the effects of two different institutional contexts on how quality is perceived and how it is related to some structural aspects of organisations.

1.3. The Structure of the Thesis

The next chapter (chapter 2) provides an overview of the theoretical developments on quality and quality management. In the first and second parts of the chapter, a description of quality and quality management as managerial concepts is

presented, and the issue of the implications of applying quality management initiatives to the service and the public sector is raised. The third part describes the current studies on quality management, particularly those related to its impact on aspects of job structure and control in organisations. It also describes some studies on "perceived quality", from where the idea of the importance of considering organisational groups' perceptions and contextual influences in the understanding of quality initiatives in organisations was drawn. The final section presents a proposed alternative form of analysing quality in organisations where no formal quality management programme has been implemented and where the definition of customer is problematic, based on the concept of operative objectives (Perrow 1978) and organisational groups.

Chapter 3 presents the basics of institutional theory. It describes the theoretical framework that will enable the interpretation of the further comparison of results between the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Service. It explains why and how institutional contexts affect organisations' structure and activities based mainly on the work of Scott and Meyer (1994) and Meyer and Scott (1992). It then focuses on the institutional environment in which the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Service operate.

Chapter 4 describes the research design and the method used. It presents the research questions that guided the fieldwork, and the definition of the concepts and variables involved in the operationalisation of the research. It also describes and justifies the use of a qualitative type of research and of a case study approach. The chapter also contains a detailed description of the fieldwork, as well as explains the procedures applied to the analysis of the data. The final section of the chapter presents the limitations of the study.

Chapter 5 offers a description and analysis of data collected in the first of the cases studied, that is, the Scottish Prison Service. It presents a description of quality perceptions and initiatives within the organisation, and a discussion on its impact on

structural aspects, particularly job structure and control of the organisation, taking into consideration some peculiarities involved in the study of a public sector organisation. The final section discusses the results presented in the chapter comparing them with the results of other published studies.

Chapter 6 presents and discusses the data collected in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC related to quality perceptions and initiatives. It provides evidence of the link between quality perception and operative objectives of groups within the organisation. It also describes the interaction of some structural characteristics (particularly size and objectives) with quality perceptions and initiatives within the SPS. These results are then discussed and compared with other findings available in the literature.

Chapter 7 compares the results of chapters 5 and 6 in terms of quality definition, rationale of quality definition and customer identification. It also interprets and explains the results, through the links between some characteristics of the institutional environments and quality perceptions and initiatives in both the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Services. In the Scottish case, the change process to achieve quality seems to be explained by political and economic reasons that came from institutional pressures supporting neo-liberal ideas. It became known as "managerialism" in the public service. The Brazilian case is characterised by the distance between the formal discourse and the organisational practice. Institutional characteristics of public sector management, particularly its formalistic and patrimonialistic nature, seems to explain, to a certain extent, the organisational situation of the BPS-SC. The results are then discussed in comparison with the theoretical framework proposed.

Chapter 8 summarises the conclusions drawn from the previous chapters relating them to the main objectives of the study stated in this chapter. It also gives some suggestions for future research in the area.

Chapter 2: Conceptual and Empirical Developments on Quality Management

2.1. Quality and Quality Management

Quality Management is a form of management that first took place in Japanese companies between the 1940s and the 1950s through the work of American engineers, particularly W. Edward Deming and Joseph Juran. Much of the success of Japanese enterprises in the present day is attributed not simply from low cost competitiveness but from high and reliable quality in general terms. In order to try to achieve the same performance and compete with Asian enterprises Quality Management started to receive increased importance in western companies. According to Wilson (1992) it is difficult to find a large or medium sized organisation in Europe or United States that has not implemented some kind of quality management variation or in other words, any kind of approach to quality management. Wilkinson and Willmott (1995) state that three-quarters of companies in the United States and United Kingdom reported to be involved in some kind of quality management initiative.

Juran (1979) expressed that quality could be understood in terms of avoidable and unavoidable costs. He argued that working on prevention of avoidable costs through investment in quality improvements in production processes would increase organisational performance. Later, Feigenbaum (1983) expanded Juran's work introducing the idea of total quality control (TQC). Feigenbaum called for the idea of inter functional teams because it is impossible, he argued, to achieve a quality product if the shopfloor level has to work on quality improvements in isolation. Feigenbaum proposes that TQC implies three stages: design control, incoming material control and product or shopfloor control.

The work of subsequent so-called "gurus" of quality management have also been giving attention to refine objective means of obtaining information about the process of production (Deming 1986; Ishikawa 1985; Crosby 1984). Less attention has been given to quality as a management philosophy (Wilkinson, Allen and Snape 1991).

A new generation of gurus (e.g. Oakland 1989) have paid increasing attention to the importance of gaining commitment to quality as a strategic organisational issue. Regarding quality as a strategic issue, Garvin (1987) proposes eight dimensions or categories of quality that can serve as a framework to analyse quality strategically and compete effectively in the market: performance, features, reliability, conformance, durability, serviceability, aesthetics and perceived quality.

The importance gained by quality as a strategic issue gave rise to the implementation of programmes that take into consideration quality principles for the whole organisation and not only for those aspects related to production. Moreover, considering the diffusion of quality management approaches for service and public sectors, the definition of quality was expanded in terms of the production of products or services that conform to customers expectations with low cost. Munro-Faure and Munro-Faure (1992:2), for example, define quality as "producing output in conformance to customer requirements" or "total conformance to requirements; these requirements are total customer requirement, not just a product or service specification" (p.5). The concept of customer emerged more strongly as one of the main components of quality definition in an organisation. Garvin (1987:103), for example, says that "quality means pleasing consumers and not just protecting them from annoyances".

The most discussed and perhaps most successful strategic quality management approach is "Total Quality Management" (TQM). It is a programme of strategic change based on the principles of quality. It is quality principles applied to the whole organisation. According to Wilson (1992) TQM is a planned programme

of change towards a specific objective. TQM has its basis in "cross-functional co-operation, largely through sales and marketing interacting with production, coupled with an obsession about quality service for the customer" (Wilson 1992:93).

For Munro-Faure and Munro-Faure (1992) TQM is a proven, systematic approach to the planning and management of activities that can be applied to any type of organisation. For them "the realisation that applying quality disciplines to all activities would result in a more efficient and competitive company led to the evolution of total quality management" (p.9).

Oakland (1989:2) defined TQM as "a way of managing to improve the effectiveness, flexibility and competitiveness of a business as a whole. It is also a method of removing waste, by involving everyone in improving the way things are done, meeting customer requirements both external and internal to the organisation".

Dawson and Palmer (1993:115) define TQM as "a widely used strategy for increasing organisational flexibility and employee commitment to change..." The authors point out that the nature of the change is basically from individual based work practices towards teamwork and employee participation on the shopfloor.

Although there are many conceptual and practical programmes regarded as quality management programmes or just quality programmes or approaches, the term (quality) is an abstract concept and one difficult to define. Petelin (1992) argues that quality is a term which connotes value and it is considered to be an intrinsic and specific characteristic of something. Wilkinson and Willmott (1995) argue that because of its subjective dimension the term quality has been applied to identify all sorts of managerial initiatives. According to the authors "the appeal of the term is that it can be used to legitimise all sorts of measures and changes in the name of a self-evident good" (p.01).

The need to unify a more strategic approach that includes changes in attitude with a more technical approach to quality control of operations on the shopfloor, also contributes to the difficulty of a unique consensual definition of quality. According to

Dawson and Palmer (1993:116) what is common in these apparently different definitions of quality and quality management "is their attempt to delineate a unique methodology for the successful implementation of TQM in manufacturing and/or service organisations."

While showing the problems of quality and TQM definitions, recent studies on the area have been demonstrating some characteristics that appear to be common in most of the quality initiatives (Pollitt and Bouckaert 1995; Dawson and Palmer 1993; Binns 1993). These characteristics can be summarised as follows:

1. Integration. TQM intends to integrate all members of the organisation in an effort to improve performance through a participative environment in which the communication process could occur freely in all directions, without necessarily following the formal channels of formalised structure. It is a holistic approach leading to a corporate culture associated with strategic organisational culture change. Binns (1993:21) stresses that "on the basis of shared culture, it is proposed, employees will identify with the quality criteria and procedures at the centre of the managerial strategy that is TQM".

2. Generation of a commitment and enthusiasm for quality from the top management to the shopfloor. A total management approach towards quality improvements involves all aspects of internal operations and every employee in the company, as well as external operating practices and customer-supplier relations. Commitment to quality refers to the whole organisation, including the chief executive or similar, directors, middle managers and shop-floor workers. Oakland (1989) points out that commitment to quality is concerned with the integration of different parts of the organisation giving them the same objectives, those of quality achievement. It also refers to changing the focus of control from a directly supervised individual to a self-controlled one responsible for his or her own performance and committed to quality.

3. Commitment to continuous improvement. TQM rhetoric emphasises an ongoing process rather than seeking to remodel established working procedures, relationships and practices stabilising operating system, through instituting a new and clearly prescribed set of processes. Changes towards organisation integration, and self-controlled workers who think in terms of customers and suppliers in their own activity and who aim to achieve continuous improvement and customer satisfaction, can be provided by a strong policy on human resource management (Oakland 1989; Hill 1991a; Hill 1991b).

4. Body of techniques, especially those related to flexible manufacturing system models. As a technique TQM involves a range of production methods including changes in the layout of the production set, statistical tools to measure organisational performance, cutting costs and avoiding the things that could be done more than once because of errors in the organisational process. The basic concepts concerning the range of techniques that composes the hard side of TQM are statistical process control, just-in-time production, and documented system. Statistical process control (SPC) refers to a measurement of performance during the production process including feedback mechanisms that allow the correction of errors where necessary (Oakland 1989). It is believed that SPC prevents the interruption on the process of production caused by defective material and variations in the flow of activities, saving costs and avoiding reworking. SPC includes a set of tools attempting to clarify the problems during the production process and make corrections easier (e.g. process flow charting, histograms, cause and effect analyses, control charts and so on). Oakland (1989) argues that SPC is not only applicable for the production of artefacts but can also be used to control aspects of provision of services or the transfer of information like controlling times of delivering. He also argues that control itself is not enough to assure quality. SPC has to be embedded in a wider managerial strategy aimed at the achievement of a never-ending search for improvement in the development of organisational activities. Just-in-time (JIT)

production refers to a inventory control method with the objective of elimination or at least minimisation of waste. It is used to maintain minimum stocks and the production is processed according to orders rather than to long-term forecasts of demand. A documented system refers to the establishment of a set of rules and regulations seeking to maintain consistency in the production process and in this sense, to attend customers requirements. Two of the most famous documented systems are the International Standards Organisation (ISO 9000) and the British Standard (BS 5750). They document and set out the procedures to implement all the activities that are supposed to assure quality throughout the whole organisation.

5. A willingness to make substantial investment in training as part of a human resources policy. This aspect of TQM became more popular after the recognition that simply introducing techniques of production was not enough to assure quality. Moreover, those techniques were not applicable for the service sector in general. Juran (1979), for example, believes that quality programmes are more important and even more related to managerial systems than to those of production. Regarding the relationship between TQM and human resource management, Wilkinson (1993) argues that failures to change organisational culture and attitudes towards the implementation of quality programmes can be attributed, at least partially, to the neglect of human resource policies. He also states the importance of recognising that a well conducted policy on human resource management can assure the necessary integration for the implementation of the quality programme. Critical issues in this respect are related to education, training, selection and appraisal.

6. Transcendence from departmental and disciplinary boundaries and the use of group problem solving techniques and teamwork activities in an environment of high-trust relationships. Teamwork is a component of TQM that is believed to facilitate the process of organisational change and the achievement of employees' commitment required by the implementation of TQM programmes as a whole. It is used as a cross-functional problem solving technique that helps to improve

communication, develop interdependence among many organisational functions and built an environment of high trust relationships (Oakland 1989). It presupposes the use of an empowered and flexible multi-skilled workforce since they are supposed to have some knowledge about more than one activity. Empowerment refers to the ability of one to control, and the authority to decide, about changes in his or her own job. Hill (1991b) suggests that empowerment implies a decentralisation of authority as jobs become enlarged and enriched.

It can be noted that most definitions and characteristics of quality management in general, and TQM in particular, involve two basic sides of the issue, that is, a philosophy and a technique. As such, it comprises an objective as well as a subjective dimension which enables one to apply the concept to different kinds of organisations in diverse sectors of activity. Nevertheless, there are some concerns regarding the application of quality management programmes to services and particularly to public sector organisations.

2.2. Quality Management: from Manufacturing to Service and Public Sectors

Quality initiatives are not limited to manufacturing organisations. As Lewis and Mitchell (1990:16) point out "the importance of quality service is now well accepted and service-based organisations are addressing increasing attention to service excellence in their corporate strategy and planning, in the anticipation of achieving a differential advantage over their competitors". However, the issue of how a management philosophy and technique created to solve problems of performance and competitiveness in manufacturing companies has been applied to the service sector has not been a salient issue in the quality literature.

Rees (1992) argues that this discussion should be addressed in terms of two distinct parts. One is related to the meaning attached to the concept of quality and its

implications when related to service and public sectors. The other is the extent to which quality management techniques can be applied to those sectors.

Specialised literature on quality displays a consensus that quality refers, to a certain extent, to customer satisfaction. According to Rees (1992) it is relatively easy to identify and measure customer satisfaction in terms of a tangible product. In the provision of services, however, it can be more difficult to identify customer satisfaction. The characteristics of a service, in general, vary from tangible to intangible ones, for example, the appearance of the location where the service is provided, the degree of access and the courtesy with which the customer is treated (Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry 1985).

Analysing the financial sector, Kerfoot and Knights (1993) argue that the nature of the product and its benefits to the consumer can influence the development of quality management. They develop an argument stating that although characteristics like tangibility of the product, long-term and/or contractual nature of the product, and the importance of selling process have a distinct nature in the financial services, they also have some similarities. There is almost always a service dimension in any manufacturing product. Moreover, a manufacturing product can offer some intangible characteristics like status symbol. In not recognising the real nature of financial services many quality programmes can fail or, at least, cannot be developed to its total potential. According to Kerfoot and Knights (1993:2) "in their enthusiasm to offer a panacea to organisational ills, we believe the consultant literature fails to research fully the similarities and differences between financial services and manufacturing". The same can be said to other services such as health, prison, and education.

Discussing the issues related to the similarities and differences between financial services and manufacturing organisations, Kerfoot and Knights (1993:5) conclude that the real nature of this distinction is that "the benefits of financial service products are not as immediately obvious or self-evident as those of most

consumer durables". The validity and benefits to the clients have to be constantly reassured and for this reason to simply attempt to apply quality management techniques to the service sector is likely to fail. In this respect Kerfoot and Knights (1993) believe that quality management is directly linked with human resource management. According to the authors, a human resource policy has the potential to promote a higher degree of success of quality programmes through an understanding of the complex range of human interactions in organisations⁽¹⁾.

In the last few years quality management started to receive increased attention in the public sector. In Scotland, for example, public organisations like Strathclyde Regional Council and the Scottish Prison Service became involved in quality management programmes. In Spain the *Ministerio de Sanidad y Consumo* (Ministry of Sanitation and Consumption) is developing a total quality plan for the sanitary system in the country (Ferrándiz 1992). In Brazil the government has created the *Programa Brasileiro de Qualidade e Produtividade* (Brazilian Quality and Productivity Programme) for public and private organisations with the objective of increasing the competitiveness of Brazilian products and services in internal and external markets (Brasil, PBQP, 1990).

Rees (1992) argues that some specificities can constrain the application of quality principles in the public sector. Although quality in the public sector also refers to customer satisfaction, the consumers here are normally the general public. The customers will be a wider group than the immediate consumer of the service or product. Another distinction provided by Rees (1992) refers to the fact that most public sector activities are in a monopolistic position and in many cases their products or services are free or subsidised. Comparisons towards quality improvements come though from the standard of services in other parts of the public sector or from the private sector. In Rees' (1992:73) point of view "standards defining

⁽¹⁾ The discussion of quality management in the service sector will be extended in section 2.3 "Studies in Quality Management", subsection 2.3.2 "Perceived Quality".

services to be provided can give a useful benchmark for evaluating present services and proposing improvements".

Arguing that orthodox quality management initiatives, particularly TQM, is not well suited to government, Swiss (1992) points out four main problems regarding the application of TQM to the public sector: a) customer definition; b) services x products; c) focusing on inputs and processes; and d) government culture.

Swiss (1992) addresses the issue of defining the customer within public service organisations arguing that specific definitions of market niche, which enables one to define clearly who the customers are, have a politically controversial dimension in the public sector. It means that the "niche" can have different groups of "potential customers" with conflicting objectives. When it happens, to which group's demands should the government give more weight in the decision making process? Swiss (1992) argues that the definition of quality based on customer satisfaction in the public sector depends heavily upon the answer to the above question. Government organisations have obligations to more than their direct clients. Sometimes, in order to fulfil their public obligations they have to be contrary to the needs of those more direct clients and protect the more general interests of the taxpayers. Swiss (1992) also points out the lack of precision of surveys among the general public in order to measure government performance and customer satisfaction. He argues that these surveys are always subject to media pressures and ideological issues and therefore can reflect a specific and single dimension of a greater issue. However, he argues that these measures, as well as surveys applied to more direct clients, are still important as one factor to be considered in the decision making process.

In terms of differences between products and services, Swiss' (1992) point of view is similar to other authors that services are, for example, more labour intensive and it is difficult to achieve uniformity of output (also Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry 1985; Rees 1992).

The question of emphasis on inputs and processes stands on the tendency of TQM to force the organisations to establish performance measures. As output measures in the public sector are problematic it tends to place emphasis on means or tools to achieve the ends which, in Swiss' (1992) argument, can contribute to goal replacement and increase of bureaucracy.

Government culture concerns the lack of a strong culture in public sector organisations caused mainly by the high turnover of the top level of hierarchy. Orthodox TQM depends on a strong organisational culture that implies senior management's long term commitment to quality initiatives.

Rago (1994) comments on the necessity of adapting TQM to public organisations. His reasons are, however, different from those of Swiss (1992). He states that when a narrow perspective of TQM is taken, that is, the level of analysis shifts from the organisation to the department, at least the first three problems prescribed by Swiss (1992) are overcome. Nevertheless, when he relates the experience of a health institution in the USA he found out two different sets of problems in the application of a TQM programme, that is, number of customers and quantity x quality, and supports Swiss' fourth problem of governmental culture.

Concerning the number of customers (Rago 1994) argues that while in the private sector an increase in the number of customer means an increase in profit generated, in the public organisations it means intensification of work with the same budget. Budgets normally do not follow the pattern of increasing demands for public services. Rather, an increase in the number of customers brings a variety of administrative problems because parts of the organisation become responsible for delivering more services with the same structural, human and financial resources.

Rago (1994) also found out a problem that he called "quantity x quality dilemma". It means that where quality is concerned, due to budgetary restrictions, a public organisation has to face decisions related to either increasing the number of customers and meeting only part of their needs or increasing the number of attended

needs for the existing customers. It does not occur in the private sector in general because the profits gained from organisational performance shape the future application of the resources. There is no public obligation because the market niche of private enterprises is restricted and well limited.

Although there are differences concerning the nature of the services or products provided by the public sector, Rees (1992) points out that the principles of quality remain appropriate. Rago (1994) also argues that despite some particular characteristics of public sector organisations it is a mistake to believe that TQM cannot be successfully integrated into public organisations. If quality refers to customer satisfaction, there is no reason to believe that the public sector cannot offer services or products according to a pre-established pattern of quality. Concepts like quality assurance and customer care (based on the principle of the customer chain developed by Oakland [1989]) have already been used by some public organisations (see Rees [1992:74-80] for examples). Moreover, the concepts related to the soft side of TQM are likely to be applied in the public sector. In this sense, Rees (1992:81) argues that "the notion of continuous improvement, as a goal to be sought but never finally achieved, shifts quality thinking away from product/service, private/public differentiation towards the more general concept of improving the functioning of an organisation".

Following this thought, Swiss (1992) points out the TQM principles that in his opinion are useful to public sector organisations. They are client feedback, tracking performance, continuous improvement, and empowerment. He argues that "if introduced without overselling and with sensitivity to government's unique circumstances, reformed TQM can make a useful contribution to contemporary public management" (p.360).

Pollitt and Bouckaert (1995) add an important critique to the discussion of total quality management in the public sector. They argue that a fundamental concept regarding the provision of public sector services is absent from the vocabulary of

TQM and other quality initiatives, that is, the concept of "citizen". Quality management refers to "customer" which is a different concept to that of "citizen", they argue. Pollitt and Bouckaert (1995:06) state that

"a citizen can be defined as a concentration of rights and duties in the person of an individual, within a constitutional state, under the rule of law, and within a hierarchy of laws and regulations. The state supposedly exists to protect citizens and promote the general interest. A client is a concentration of needs and satisfaction of needs in an individual, within a market situation of supply and demand of goods and services, and within a hierarchy of needs, subject to the willingness to pay. A citizen is a part of a social contract, whereas a client is part of a market contract".

Pollitt and Bouckaert (1995) also argue that quality management initiatives are not to be blamed for not using a concept that they were not designed to incorporate in the first place. But it still has to be considered as a central issue when studying the adaptation of such practices to public sector organisations.

Total Quality Management programmes were first created to solve problems of performance in manufacturing organisations. These programmes predict many changes in the organisational design, and organisation studies literature has been trying to analyse such changes. Results of research in this area show that the outcomes of these changes can sometimes differ from the ones predicted in the consultant literature on TQM. There is also a certain degree of disagreement among organisational analysts in relation to the real effects of TQM programmes on the work organisation.

The aspects that concern manufacturing organisations have been researched more thoroughly than those regarding service and public sectors. Even though, as Storey and Sisson (1989:116) comment, most of the research on the subject is based on the "Labour Process" tradition and "empirical underpinning is too often unsatisfactory, and even when data is presented it seems to be in the form of using examples to illustrate theory rather than to test it..."

Public sector organisations have not been studied with the same intensity as have private sector organisations. In this respect, there is not yet a well established body of knowledge about how quality management techniques can be applied to the public sector. Research is needed, especially in the nature of changes in quality management principles if one wants to successfully apply them to the public sector. Moreover, the issue of the universality of quality principles remains obscure. Research on quality in a cross-cultural perspective will help to illuminate the issue.

2.3. Studies in Quality Management

For the purpose of this research, current studies on quality management focusing on the two specific fields of organisation studies and perceived quality will be presented in this section. Both fields are normally treated independently as fields of investigation, but there are interfaces between them that help us to understand quality management practices in a variety of organisational arenas as well as in different institutional contexts.

2.3.1. Organisation Studies and Quality Management: Job Structure and Control

Most of the discussion on quality management in the organisation studies literature relates to the issue of the control variable which is a central issue in the area. There has been a polarisation of two basic theses regarding the subject. The first one is based on the flexible specialisation model of organisation (Piore and Sabel 1984) which argues that new arrangements of work organisation based on this model will lead to greater autonomy of a multi-skilled workforce that will become involved in the decision-making process in a participative and high-trust-relationships in the

work environment. The second thesis is based on the labour process literature and gained special strength after Braverman's (1974) work. It contends that new technologies, and quality management related ones, are introduced in the organisation by management to enhance control over the workforce.

The issue of control has always been a central one in organisation theory. As suggested by Kouzmin (1980:134) "organisation signifies a method of social control, a means of imparting a regularity to society or collective action". The centrality of control in organisation theory is also emphasised by Tannembaum (1968:3) who says that

"a social organisation is an ordered arrangement of individual human interactions. Control processes help circumscribe idiosyncratic behaviours and keep them conformant to the rational plan of the organisation... The coordination and order created out of the diverse interests and potentially diffuse behaviour of members is largely a function of control".

Hickson (1966) suggests that theories on the structure of organisations converge to a single line of analysis, that is, the specificity of role prescription. It means the degree to which organisations control their members through pre-established standardised rules, describing their behaviour during the development of organisational activities. Hickson argues that different types of organisations are produced according to a linear relationship in the study of each theorist, between the degree of specificity of role prescription and other variables of organisational structure⁽²⁾.

More than a set of techniques to ensure that organisational performances will proceed according to pre-established standards, control has been analysed as having a

⁽²⁾ For example, in Hickson's (1966) point of view, Likert (1961) and McGregor (1960) relate the role of specificity with motivation. For these authors the higher the role specificity, the lower the motivation of employees will be. Thompson (1965) and Hage (1965) argue that the capacity of innovation is higher when the degree of specificity is lower. Crozier (1964) and Litwak (1961), on the other hand, hypothesised that a low level of role prescription causes conflict between roles in the dispute for distribution of power within organisations. In a similar approach Taylor (1947) and Fayol (1949) argue that a high level of specificity reduces confusion during the development of organisational activities.

relation with social development. Perrow (1986), for example, suggests that with the process of industrialisation of modern society, forms of control in organisations tend to go from direct control to bureaucratic, and ultimately to control of cognitive premises. The same basic argument can be found in the studies of Edwards (1983), Burris (1989), and Rosen and Baroudi (1992).

Perrow (1986) summarises the issue clearly. He suggests a typology based on three types of organisational control: 1) fully obtrusive or direct; 2) fairly obtrusive or bureaucratic; and 3) fully unobtrusive or control of cognitive premises. Fully obtrusive control refers to direct surveillance, rules and regulation. This type of control is necessary in periods of instability and crisis in organisations, but it fails in trying to regulate the personal background of the subordinates. Rules are also inefficient in periods of continuous innovation. This type of control requires a great effort from management concerning time and costs. According to Perrow, bureaucratic control is more efficient. It is related to the degree of standardisation and specialisation of organisational activities. As many of as the activities are standardised and specialised, the subordinates have less chance of making decisions according to their personal interests. Perrow argues that it can explain some findings of previous research (Blau and Scott 1963; Blau 1968; Aston Group studies - especially Pugh and Hickson 1976 and Pugh and Hinings 1976) that the higher the degree of bureaucratisation is, the higher the degree of decentralisation will be. This is because the application of organisational rules and regulations establishes the parameters of individual discretion, allowing for controlled and predictable decision-making at lower organisational levels. Another explanation is related to methodological aspects of such research, especially related to the operationalisation of the concepts used in order to make them measurable (see Clegg and Dunkerley 1980 and Perrow 1986). Control of premises or fully unobtrusive control is the more difficult to achieve and it is, in Perrow's opinion, the most effective. It is related to a voluntary normative attachment between the subordinate and the objective of his or

her task, through a process of internalisation of the premises of the behaviour necessary for the development of the task. This form of control is more important when the nature of work is non routine and rules and regulations cannot be established to determine behaviour during the development of the activities (e.g. scientists in research laboratories, professors in universities and politicians in parliament). This type of control is more often used at the top of organisations than at the shop-floor level because managerial work is less routine. Although direct control and bureaucratic control are more visible at the lower levels of the hierarchy, all these three types of control exist at all levels in the organisations varying in degree of applicability.

One important aspect of Perrow's (1986) argument about the transition to fully unobtrusive forms of control is that although unobtrusive forms are more evident nowadays the other two forms continue to be practised.

Quality management has been described as enhancing unobtrusive forms of control, since it has been regarded as a strategic issue related not only to technical but also to cultural changes. Dawson and Palmer (1993:116), for example, argue that "TQM is increasingly being used as a cultural control strategy which goes beyond the shopfloor to incorporate strategic human resource management and inter-company relationships".

Petelin (1992:140) also comments on the subject of quality management as a control device arguing that "the broad administrative focus on quality arises as a conventional bureaucratic palliative to economic problems - one that enables administration to evade addressing specific social ills through substituting them with an abstraction which legitimates tighter surveillance and behavioural control of the workforce". It implies definitions of competencies by specification of performance criteria and by standardisation of production.

Palmer and Allan (1992:280) also relate quality management and control in organisations: "narrowly speaking, quality management focuses upon the way in

which commodities are produced to conform to user requirements. As such, quality management is concerned with the reorganisation, manipulation and control of material and social aspects of the production process".

It became clear at this point that issues of quality management practices and control are related to the characteristics of such programmes, as pointed out in section 2.1 of this chapter. In short, they are concerned with the set of techniques that composes quality management programmes, work-group activities and decision making towards employee empowerment and internal customer-supplier relationship.

Based on case studies of enterprises in Australia and New Zealand, Dawson and Palmer (1993) point out the issues that arise as being of special concern in the introduction of quality management initiatives. The first one is related to organisational flexibility. Quality initiatives are introduced to overcome rigidity problems faced by organisations. Employee empowerment and participation are used as means to achieve such ends. For the authors "it can modify work arrangements or to function as a discursive practice". They also argue that quality management "allows participation in low levels of decision making, but not levels that may have considerable significance to employees in terms of their work practices" (p.126). The cultural issue also appears to be very important in their findings, showing that prescribed homogeneity of quality management does not support cultural pluralism. As they point out "we saw some signs, in the case studies, that TQM was not well suited to build employee commitment within a workforce that was culturally very diverse. It proves a common problem, then in the culturally mixed environment of Australian business, the organisational assumptions of TQM may need to be adapted for our purposes" (p.135).

Dawson and Webb (1989) investigate some of the impacts of TQM and JIT principles of production on work organisation. In their case study of two different operating units on a single site of a UK Division of a US-owned high technology multinational corporation, they examine "the effects of a change in production on the

job tasks and control responsibilities of managerial, supervisory and operative staff" (p.223). They observed the utilisation of TQM and JIT principles like customer-supplier relation in organisational activities. All staff were trained to work in groups using descriptive statistical tools to identify problems, and suggest and implement solutions. Through the introduction of the automatic program generation for new products, manual work declined in proportion to the number of total activities. Nevertheless, the authors argue that in some circumstances JIT/TQM techniques are not incompatible with fragmented tasks. In the case analysed "assembly work remains relatively routinised, with tasks broken into small components; in some cases the sequencing of tasks is computer controlled" (Dawson and Webb 1989:229).

Dawson and Webb's (1989) research also suggests that work groups increased their authority as a result of the changes, which provided the delegation of more autonomy and control to line supervisors. But, on the other hand, with regard to re-skilling of tasks their results show a great difference between male and female workers. The flexibility and enhancement of tasks is more a characteristic of male technicians and of the graduate engineering workforce while "the re-skilling of women assembly workers has largely been restricted to the adoption of TQM techniques to service on-line quality control, rather than the acquisition of technical knowledge to enable the free movement of assemblers across a wide range of tasks" (Dawson and Webb 1989:230).

Managers' jobs were also affected by TQM. As a result of the new arrangements managers had to become more involved in problem-solving because their status in the organisation depended on their ability to deal with production problems.

Dawson and Webb (1989) conclude by arguing that their findings support the argument that TQM, to a certain degree, contributes to reversing the division of labour, increasing autonomy and providing greater employee involvement in the organisation of production. However, they also argue that these characteristics are not

presented in the ideal conditions of the flexible specialisation thesis of Piore and Sabel (1984). Quality management entails a number of contradictions and results different from those anticipated by prescriptive literature in the field. For Dawson and Webb (1989:236) "the extent of discretion and autonomy introduced by the requirements to participate in incremental improvements is consistent with attempts to incorporate the workforce in the projects of capital without extending to any substantive control over business strategy or the dispersal of profits". Their results and conclusions are consistent with those of Dawson and Palmer (1993) who conclude that some quality management techniques, particularly those related to the introduction of information technology, can be seen as promoting decentralisation and greater flexibility, whereas others enhance centralised decision making and control.

Sewell and Wilkinson (1992) address the issue of the change on the focus of control. Based on case study observation, the authors argue that a shift in control occurs due to two disciplinary aspects: control of one's peers and information technology systems. Sewell and Wilkinson (1992) comment that in one car manufacturing plant studied TQM/JIT included a "Neighbour-Watch System" and a "Vehicle Evaluation System". These systems make it possible to identify faults to specific individuals on the production line. In the case of a manufacturer of electronic consumer goods, it is based more on an information technology system. At the end of the production line an electronic test identifies the errors in the product and links them to each individual operator responsible. Peer control is supported by a flatter organisational structure associated to TQM and it is seen as a horizontal process of control, while information technology systems enhance vertical control mechanisms.

Based on two case studies, Wilkinson, Allen and Snape (1991:30) argue that "TQM might be seen as an attempt by management to control employees through internal discipline and self control. However, the workforce appeared to be reasonably enthusiastic about the TQM programme". The authors comment that the

enthusiasm of the work force can be justified because TQM, as a form of involvement, seems to bring more immediate benefits to workers like more flexibility to work in groups and solve cross-functional problems, as well as certain degree of decentralisation of decision-making.

In terms of shopfloor workers Hill's (1991a:412) research shows that after the implementation of TQM "the labour force needed less supervision and worked more autonomously". Dawson and Palmer's (1993:289) findings also show that TQM attempts to de-specialise the inspection function when it "advocates the re-absorption of the task of monitoring output back into the operator's job description", developing group rather than individual responsibilities for standards of outputs. Hill (1991a) also argues that team working, job rotation, more autonomy regarding the decision-making process and an environment of high-trust relationships are probably outcomes of TQM implementation. It implies employees' commitment towards organisational change, based on the importance of creating a positive culture in the organisation (Peters and Waterman 1982; Kanter, 1983 and 1990). This commitment can be achieved through a strong management ideology as well as a policy on human resource management (Oakland 1989; Hill 1991a). Wilkinson, Allen and Snap (1991) also point out that a management commitment to TQM objectives and a well-established policy of human resource management are key factors for the success of the programme. This idea is illustrated in their work by showing how quality circles initiatives failed in the cases studied, because of a lack of consideration of these factors.

Hill (1991a) places the TQM debate as a central issue for the economic restructuring that will provide new patterns of market competitiveness through changes in the organisational design and culture. He studied the effectiveness of quality circles in twelve American and British companies and found out that quality circles promote non-significant operational improvements. The most important cause for the failure of quality circles was a lack of commitment of middle managers. The

existing organisational design did not allow the necessary integration among organisational functions and promoted the emergence of a parallel structure of power, conflicting with the existing structure. Moreover, shopfloor workers were not committed on a voluntary basis, as expected by senior managers.

For these reasons Hill (1991b) believes that quality circles without a context of TQM are likely to fail. When the companies studied moved toward a TQM approach the results regarding middle management commitment were much more successful when compared to the quality circles ones. Hill's findings show that TQM philosophy of participative problem identification and problem-solving became more decentralised, especially among the managerial level.

Wilkinson Marchington and Goodman (1992) studied the issue of employee involvement in TQM programmes. The authors, as well as Hill (1991a; 1991b) and others, argue that to base the implementation of TQM programme on the so-called "hard side" (techniques-based approach) without considering employee's involvement cannot lead to the necessary cultural changes and, as a consequence, lead to a degree of resistance. Wilkinson et al. (1992) observe that the problem of dualism or, in other words, the creation of a parallel structure of power, is likely to occur when TQM is not integrated into the existing organisational structure, as also described by Hill's (1991a) study of quality circles.

For Wilkinson et al. (1992) three elements comprise the theoretical participative structure of TQM: 1) an educative process at company level; 2) restructuring of labour process; and 3) working teams established on an *ad hoc* basis. However, these elements do not mean a significant change in terms of labour control. Involvement in the decision-making process, for example, is normally related to operational issues and does not imply involvement in strategic issues. Wilkinson et al. (1992:17) point out that "there is a considerable degree of ambiguity about TQM in practice - while the language is about increased involvement, there is also a strong emphasis on reinforcing management control". It tends to be achieved through a shift

in the focus of control from supervision to a self-control mechanism, peer-control or control based on information technology, as shown by Sewell and Wilkinson (1992).

In their study concerning the relationship between TQM and human resource management in two financial sector companies, Kerfoot and Knights (1993) argue that in trying to adopt quality principles through a set of rationally planned techniques, the organisation itself can undermine the principles of quality. The authors explain that quality is related to creativity enabled by a wide range of complex human interactions and it can be conflicting within the TQM programme. Although TQM programmes have the theoretical potential to increase creativity "large scale rational programmes such as TQM, imposed on an organisation from 'above', are likely to corrupt the very content of quality in their appropriation of those features of creative interaction which it is believed can be measured, quantified and implemented through technical procedures" (Kerfoot and Knights 1993:13). In one of the case studies, for example, after one year of an operational TQM programme, the staff refused to co-operate with management. Kerfoot and Knights (1993:16) conclude that "TQM has a self-contradictory component because quality may depend upon some contradictory features of human interaction in organisations that TQM, in the interests of precision and control, might undermine".

Baker (1993) investigates a manufacturing company in the USA that has passed through a changing process from a hierarchical bureaucratic form to a flexible self-managed form based on team working and monitoring. Baker shows how the employees developed a form of control that he called concertive control. The employees developed a system of value-based normative rules that controlled their actions more powerfully and completely than the former system. For Baker (1993: 411) concertive control represents

"a key shift in the locus of control from management to the workers themselves, who collaborate to develop the means of their own control. Workers achieve concertive control by reaching a negotiated consensus on how to shape their behaviour according to a set of core values, such as the values found in a corporate vision statement. In a sense, concertive control reflects the adoption of

a new substantive rationality, a new set of consensual values, by the organisation and its members".

Baker (1993) concludes that contrary to some proponents of flexible and group-based organisational forms, the concertive control that emerges from these arrangements tightens Weber's (1948) "iron cage", through a powerful combination of peer pressure and rational rules in the concertive system.

2.3.2. Perceived Quality

Perceived quality is a concept that has its base in the concept of "the customer". It gained considerable importance in research after the recognition that quality initiatives and concern have been contributing positively to market share and return of investment (Anderson and Zeithaml 1984) as well as for lowering manufacturing costs and improving productivity (Garvin 1983).

Emphasis on the consumer is the genesis of perceived quality (Leonard and Sasser 1982). Palmer and Allan (1992:288) also argue that "quality management uses a marketing approach focusing on the importance of customer requirements as a key motivator for employees". Moreover, the importance attributed to customer satisfaction has also been responsible for shaping the production process in organisations. In this sense, Garvin (1987) argues that consumers do not always have complete information about a product or a service and that they tend to use indirect measures. In such circumstances, image, advertisement and labels can be crucial in defining quality.

The service sector has been the focus for studies on perceived quality. This is perhaps as a result of the difficulties of applying some manufacturing concepts to services and as an attempt to have a broader understanding of the subject. However, in many cases these studies neglect the formal aspect of quality management initiatives and their relation to a more subjective dimension of the phenomenon.

Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry (1985), for example, argue that definitions given from manufacturing are not sufficient to define quality in the service sector because of three main characteristics:

- intangibility: services are performances rather than objects. It is difficult, though, to use precise measures like in the industry. For this reason it is difficult to understand how consumers perceive and evaluate quality (Zeithaml 1981);
- heterogeneity: especially in services that rely upon high labour content because performances vary within and between different sites from day to day. It is difficult to assure a consistence of behaviour from service personnel (Booms and Bitner 1981);
- inseparability: production and consumption are inseparable (Carmen and Langeard 1980), that is, the service is produced and consumed almost at the same time and a personal contact between consumer and producer defines quality. Moreover, in the service sector the organisation has less power to control quality because it depends on the interaction between client and provider. The client affects the process of defining quality.

Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry (1985) define perceived quality as a function of the gap between a consumer's expectations of the service and their perceptions of the actual service delivered by the organisation. Their exploratory research is an attempt to identify dimensions used by customers to analyse quality. Based on these dimensions they build a theoretical model that helps to understand and measure service quality as it is perceived by consumers. They found out that consumers used basically similar criteria in evaluating quality. Ten dimensions were identified as determinants of service quality as follows: reliability, responsiveness, competence, access, courtesy, communication, credibility, security, understanding/knowing the customer, and tangibles. Subsequent analysis and testing (Zeithaml, Berry and Parasuraman 1988) condensed these 10 dimensions into 5:

1. tangibles: physical facilities, equipment, appearance of contact personnel;

2. reliability: ability to perform the promised service dependably and accurately;

3. responsiveness: willingness to help customers and to provide a prompt service;

4. assurance: knowledge and courtesy of employees and their ability to inspire trust and confidence;

5. empathy: caring, individualised attention the company provides its customers.

Most of the work that has been carried out on quality management analyses and discusses theoretical and practical aspects of the subject. However, this work is limited to organisations that have driven themselves into a quality management programme. Also, they analyse the relationship between quality management and particular aspects or dimensions of organisations and very few attempt to link these issues with a more general organisational-theory-based knowledge.

Zeithaml, Berry and Parasuraman (1988) analyse the relationship between service quality and various organisational variables. Based on their model of perceived service quality they identify specific dimensions of service quality that are more directly related to different organisational variables as follows:

1. difference between consumer expectations and management perceptions of consumer expectations are affected by the extent of market research orientation, the extent and quality of upward communication and the number of managerial levels;

2. difference between management perceptions of consumer expectations and service quality specifications are related to management committed to service quality, setting of goals relating to service quality, task standardisation, and perception of feasibility for meeting customer expectations.

3. difference between service quality specifications and the service quality delivered is related to the extent of teamwork perceived by employees, employee-job fit, technology-job fit, the extent of perceived control experienced by customer-

contact personnel, the extent to which behavioural control systems are used to supplement output control systems, the extent of role conflict experienced by customer contact personnel, and the extent of role ambiguity experienced by customer-contact personnel;

4. difference between service delivery and what is communicated about service to consumers is affected by the extent of horizontal communication, and the propensity to over promise.

They argue, for example, that goal setting for services involves defining quality in ways that enable providers to understand what management wants to deliver. If the goals of the organisation are to be achieved there has to be a good flow of information either horizontally and vertically. In terms of control Zeithaml, Berry and Parasuraman (1988) affirm that the use of either an output control or a behavioural control measure (Ouchi 1979; Ouchi and Maguire 1975) encourages employees to perform consistently with customer expectation. In conclusion, they argue that an enhancement in communication systems and control measures helps to improve the understanding and measurement of the subjective dimension of quality management practices, that of perceived quality.

Benson, Saraph and Schroeder (1991) propose a system-structural model of quality management that relates organisational quality context, actual quality management, ideal quality management, and quality performance. As their research focuses on the business-unit manager level, ideal quality management was defined as the manager's beliefs of what quality should be in the business unit. Actual quality management was defined as a manager's perception of the current practice of quality management in the business unit. Organisational quality context is the business unit manager's quality environment and it was described by variables such as company type and size, marketplace conditions, types of products and process and the degree of corporate support for quality. Amongst their results the authors see quality management actions taken by managers

“as being triggered by stimuli in their environment or what we have called their organisational quality contexts. These stimuli influence the formulation of the quality problem and, as a result, the determination of organisation change needs and the organisational response to those needs” (Benson, Saraph and Schroeder 1991:1122).

Benson, Saraph and Schroeder (1991) also point out that a manager's perception of an actual quality management situation as well as the ideal quality management practices are influenced by both the internal context and the organisational environment. Their research was conducted in seventy-seven business units of twelve manufacture and service firms. The variables used to measure and evaluate quality were expressed in terms of eight critical factors that include the role of quality department, the design of the product or service, administrative processes and industrial relations.

The studies presented in this chapter so far, are limited to the understanding of quality initiatives through formal quality management programmes or through customers' perceptions. As said before, there are organisations that do not have a quality department or even a quality management programme as a managerialist tool. Moreover, in some organisations the concept of "customer" is problematic as, for example, in prisons. However, these organisations have at least implicit in their logic of action some pattern of quality in their operations that legitimate their actions in society. In this sense, it shows the limitations of formal quality management approaches in trying to understand quality initiatives in a wide and more diverse set of organisations. The next section proposes an alternative method of understanding and analysing quality in these kind of organisations which includes the use of the concept of operative objectives (Perrow 1978) as a central variable. It is suggested that in organisations where there is no formal quality programme and the definition of customer is problematic, the quality varies and can better be understood through the identification of the operative objectives of different groups within an organisation in an specific period of time.

2.4. The Role of Operative Objectives in Understanding Quality Initiatives in Organisations: a Proposed Approach

The appearance of the large scale labour process led to the emergence of complex organisations. The concept of objectives therefore became important in order to direct organisational action.

In disagreement with the static and integrative visions of the rational and functional approaches to the analysis of organisational goals, this research adopts a structuralist perspective. This assumes that organisations have multiple and conflicting objectives between the organisation and its members. It does not mean to accept the objectives formally defined by the organisation as expressions of the total reality in the organisational arena. As Clegg and Dunkerley (1980) point out, goal definition is a problematic subject. The authors argue that before the analysis, goals have to be identified because they will not necessarily be consistent with those of the controllers of the organisations (Clegg and Dunkerley 1980).

Bearing in mind the problem related to the high level of abstraction of formal goals, Perrow (1978) introduced the concept of operative objectives that he opposed to the concept of official objectives. For him, official objectives are the general propositions of the organisation that are assumed publicly in official and formal manifestations by the organisation's directorate. Operative objectives are the ones that represent the ends sought through the operational politics of the organisation. They indicate what the organisation is really trying to do, regardless of what the official objectives affirm.

Clegg and Dunkerley (1980) argue that Perrow's (1978) model is much more realistic in comparison to schemes applied before to the analysis of organisational goals, especially when it refers to the operative goals being linked to a particular

organisational group, instead of an abstract set of formal statements. Perrow (1978) clearly links the formation of operative objectives to interests, task and power of the dominant group in the organisation.

It is important however to emphasise Georgiou's (1973) point that organisational behaviour cannot be taken as entirely determined by the objectives of one group. The objectives of a certain group are modified and limited by the need to satisfy other organisational groups of whom the dominant group has a degree of dependence.

Clegg and Dunkerley (1980) point out that organisational goals can also be modified by external forces. In relation to this point they bring attention to the fact that even Perrow's (1978) model of analysis of organisational objectives does not completely solve the problem of assuming a static model of organisation. For them if it is assumed that organisational goals change over time because of internal disputes for power or external pressures "it is therefore unrealistic to consider the finality of goal achievement. The goals of an organisation have to be continually revised and redefined, and yet in many respects the goal model is unsuitable for analysing such revisions and redefinitions" (Clegg and Dunkerley 1980:318).

Scott (1992) presents an approach that helps to diminish this problem. He assumes the concept of dominant coalition as a key one in the formulation of organisational objectives and takes an institutional perspective to analyse changes in them. For Scott (1992:295) institutional analysts stress the symbolic function of goals as "the significance of goals for organisational audiences: public, clients, tax payers, regulators". This approach emphasises the organisation's ability to achieve legitimacy and resources that will guarantee its survival.

The set of organisational goals has mostly been taken for granted in research as being established by either the entrepreneur or by consensus among the participants. According to Scott (1992) these situations have proved to be exceptional. He argues that Cyert and March (1963) still provide "the most

satisfactory answer to date the question of who sets organisational goals" (Scott 1992:288), that is, goals as being set by a negotiation process that occurs among members of the dominant coalitions. For dominant coalitions he understands groups of individuals pursuing certain goals. When one organisational group retains a position of power in the organisation and they are able to impose their objectives, then they become the dominant coalition.

Among the advantages of this perspective described by Scott (1992), the following are especially concerned with this research:

- it is recognised that although individuals and groups are responsible for the establishment of organisational goals, no individual or group is powerful enough to determine them completely. So, organisational goals are different from those of any of its participants;
- it is recognised that there is existence of a conflict of interests among groups and within an specific group and some of these are solved through a negotiation process;
- it allows the analyst to shift the level of analysis from individual to group and organisation⁽³⁾ ; and
- it is recognised that size and composition of the dominant coalition may change from time to time, and these changes will reflect the operative objectives of the organisation (see Carvalho [1993] for evidences of this point).

Perrow (1978) provides evidence of the importance of the concept of a dominant coalition and the effects of a power shift in the organisational objectives. In his study of American hospitals he distinguishes three main groups of interests: the trustees, the doctors and the administrators. In a case study conducted in an American community hospital, he showed that when power shifted from trustees to doctors, hospital goals shifted from welfare concerns to business-professional objectives,

⁽³⁾ The individual level of analysis is not considered in this research.

including research. When the administrators became the powerful group the goals shifted to emphasise the role of the hospital as the medical centre for the community.

Galbraith (1967) states that with the emergence of a technical-managerial specialists coalition as the dominant one in the modern corporations, the organisational goals shifted from an emphasis on the return of stockholders' investment in terms of maximisation of profits and entrepreneurial strategy, to an emphasis on expansion of the technostructure and an increase of sales. Management literature also provides many studies supporting the thesis of the association of shifts in groups that control organisational action and its operative objectives, particularly studies on strategy (Mintzberg 1989; Birley 1989 and Drucker 1961 among others).

Machado-da-Silva and Fonseca (1993) add the institutional dimension stressed by Scott (1992) to the understanding of the set of goals and strategy in organisations, which is also important for this research. In a case study of a manufacturing company in the south of Brazil they identified initially a cultural pattern in accordance with a traditional family-based model of administration. The legitimacy of the values created and transmitted by the company founders were identified as one of the causes of the decrease in the organisational performance, since these values started to lose environmental support in a new competitive environment. This fact, along with the entrance of new members to the top management team led the organisation to pursue some changes towards professionalism, like the introduction of a strategic planning programme. This supports the argument that changes in the dominant coalition can be caused by external pressures and that these changes will ultimately have influence in the organisational operative objectives in an specific period of its history.

The interests of coalitions can be linked with the concept of quality. It is proposed in this research that the idea of quality is expressed, to a certain extent, in the operative objectives of different groups. Once a group has become the dominant coalition, its idea of what should be quality for the organisation will be shown in

their operations or, in other words, in the operative objectives of the organisation. There is always the possibility of some individuals having personal and egoistic objectives, but when the organisational or group level of analysis is taken into consideration it is unlikely that egoistic objectives would have a strong influence on the organisational ones, since they can jeopardise the existence of the organisation and consequently of the group.

Carvalho (1993) provides some evidence on how operative objectives can be regarded as quality ideologies. Her study was conducted on a social welfare work organisation maintained by the private sector in the Northeast of Brazil. In trying to relate and analyse operative objectives and the level of conflict in such an organisation, she has identified three different groups that have distinct positions about what the service provided by the organisation should be. These can be taken as ideas of what a "quality organisation" would be in that specific area of activity. The group of old employees had a social welfare view of the organisation. This is related to the period of foundation of the organisation (after 1945), when this kind of organisation started to become spread throughout the country with an aim to promote social welfare benefits to the commercial employees. The group of new employees, however, had a culturalist view of the organisation. They desired the opening up of the organisation to the general public through the promotion of cultural and political activities. The third group was composed of the administrative council and its idea of the organisation was an expansionist one. It means that its main objective was to expand the organisational activities through the expansion of its public. They aimed to gain prestige and power mainly out of the organisational frontiers.

In this kind of organisation the group of customers is easily identifiable. However, they were not unified enough to express to the organisation what they would like its services to be. Then, instead of adopting a customer-satisfaction-approach, quality patterns were set by the organisational groups. When an alteration

occurs in the power positions in the organisation, the objectives of it tend to shift, as noticed by Carvalho (1993), as well as the overall quality image of the organisation.

In this chapter it was shown how quality has been studied so far in the specialised literature on management and organisation studies. A limitation in such approaches to the understanding of quality initiatives based on formal quality management programmes, as well as on customers satisfaction, was identified. An alternative approach to the study of quality based on the identification of main organisational groups and their objectives within the organisation was also suggested. Therefore, this research analyses quality initiatives in two different organisations, as follows:

1) the Scottish Prison Service (SPS), where a formal quality management programme has been introduced. The findings of the research will be compared with the results available in the literature, and will present evidence about the importance of considering organisational groups in the study of quality, even when a formal quality management programme has been established; and

2) the Brazilian Prison Service - Santa Catarina State (BPS-SC), where the organisation does not have a clear managerialist quality programme in operation and the definition of customers is rather problematic. The analysis will be based on the proposed approach, that is, the use of the concepts of operative objectives (Perrow 1978) and organisational groups (certain number of people within the organisation pursuing the same goals [Carvalho 1993]). The results will be compared with both initial evidence presented in the literature on the suitability of this approach as well as with the results obtained by the analysis of the formal quality management programme implemented in the SPS.

Since the study refers to organisations in two different institutional contexts, the next chapter presents arguments and findings on the influences of the environmental characteristics in the organisations structure and process. It also puts

the Scottish and the Brazilian cases into context which prepares the ground for further interpretation of the results of this research.

Chapter 3: Institutional Contexts and Organisations

3.1. Environments and Organisations

Quality has often been regarded as an universal concept, that is, it is claimed as something that could be applied to a variety of organisations in a variety of contexts. Such statements are common in the managerialist literature that offers techniques as tools for solving organisational problems. Universal approaches of management normally underestimate the links between organisations and their environments. The empirical variety of organisational reality has shown the limitations of such approaches.

The links between organisations and environments achieved greater status in organisation studies during the 1970s, in opposition to technical explanations of organisational structure and behaviour. According to Scott (1992:14) "although there is now consensus on the importance of environment, there is little agreement about how the environment is to be conceived or which features are most salient."

Clegg (1990) suggests the concept of embeddedness to explain organisational diversity within different environments. Embeddedness "refers to the configuration of those relations of 'relative autonomy' and 'relative dependence' which exists between forms of economic and social organisation and the respective national frameworks of cultural and institutional value within which they are constituted" (Clegg 1990:7).

Clegg (1990:6-7) also stresses that embeddedness does not only concern cultural aspects or specific market relations since it could imply a reduction of organisational reality. Such a reduction refers to two different approaches to the understanding of organisations: a) an over-socialised view of organisational configuration and action which uses one "all-encroaching variable" (culture) to explain diversities in organisation configurations and action; and b) an under-

socialised approach that provides all explanations based on universalising, generalising market and efficiency theories. The concept of embeddedness signifies that organisational action is seen as framed by the institutional frameworks within which action is lodged. For institutional frameworks Clegg (1990:7) understands "tax regimes, accounting conventions, religious beliefs, formally constituted public policies in respect to matters of gender, equal opportunity, industry and regional police and so on." This framework would provide patterns of meaning through which action would be taken and interpreted by agents.

Meyer and Scott (1992) also emphasise the role played by the institutional environment in defining organisational structure and behaviour. In fact, the idea that organisations are deeply embedded in institutional environments, and that these environments have significant influence on the way organisations are structured, are not new in organisational analysis (see Selznik 1957 and 1949). Nevertheless, the idea was revitalised and has been receiving increasing attention since the publication of studies such as Scott and Meyer (1983), DiMaggio and Powell (1983), Meyer and Rowan (1977), and Zucker (1977).

Institutional approaches to organisations emphasise: (a) the environmental dependence of organisational structure; (b) the broadly political and cultural environmental dimensions involved; and (c) the effects of these dependencies on the character of more modern organisations - in particular, the sprawling, complex, and often decoupled nature of organisations created under highly institutionalised regimes (Scott and Meyer 1994). Environments are seen as including "the rules and belief systems as well as the relational networks that arise in the broader societal context" (Scott 1992:14). Environments then are not only a source of resources but a group of elements that provide beliefs functioning as "rational myths". Although the expression seems to be contradictory, Meyer and Scott (1977) explain that the beliefs are rational in the sense that they serve specific purposes and have the character of rule in terms of specifying the ways activities and structuring must be carried out. At

the same time they are myths in the sense that they have to be widely shared to guarantee efficiency.

The belief systems and rules in the environment promote the condition for organisations to rise and develop their structures and activities (Scott 1992). The form that organisations will take are dependent upon the nature of the belief systems and meanings in the institutional environment. Some professions, for example, are regulated by a group of norms and beliefs that limit the action in and around organisations in this area of activity. In the universities, for example, authority is placed by formal categorisation of positions (professors, lecturers, etc.) and for formal graduation degrees (PhD, Master, BA, etc.). In a study of district schools in the USA Meyer, Scott and Deal (1992:52) found out that

"agreements on the nature of the school system and the norms governing it are worked out at quite general collective levels (through political process, the development of common symbols, occupational agreements). Each school and district - and teacher, principal, and district officer - acquires an understanding of the educational process and divisions of labour, not from relating to others within the same organisational unit, but from participating in the same institutional environment, from sharing the same educational 'culture'."

Institutional effects are, however, claimed to be greater in organisations with vague or conflicting objectives and without clear performance measures (DiMaggio and Powell 1983). In this sense, Meyer, Scott and Deal (1992) present a model of two different kinds of organisations originating in environments with two distinct characteristics namely technical and institutional. They argue that technically complex environments will form organisations which will buffer their technical activities and then create structures that will coordinate and control technical activities. If they do so in an effective way they will obtain social support, resources and will be successful. On the other hand, institutionally complex environments will form organisations that tend to decouple their structures from their technical activities in an attempt to obtain legitimacy and to succeed in their activities.

A technical environment is, therefore, the one in which a product or a service is exchanged in the market and the organisation is rewarded for effective control of the process. Thus, "technical environments exercise output controls over organisations" (Scott 1995:46). Organisations operating in these kinds of environment, characterised by highly technical requirements for success, include most manufacturing firms and many types of service organisations. The survival of these organisations and significant changes in their operations are, to a great extent, controlled by external factors, mostly regarding consumers' decisions of whether to continue buying the product or the service offered. Institutional environments, on the other hand, are characterised by "the elaboration of rules and requirements to which individual organisations must conform if they are to receive support and legitimacy from the environment" (Scott and Meyer 1992:140). Institutional environments exercise "process or structural controls over organisations, determining the procedures they employ, the qualifications of their staff, and the type of facilities to be employed" (Scott 1995:46). Organisations that are subject to strong institutional influences and relatively weak technical ones, according to Scott (1995) and others, are, for example, schools, mental health agencies and law firms. These organisations carry out their activities subject to a variety of procedural rules functioning as forms of control like "accreditation and certification bodies, professional associations, and governmental rules concerning what types of personnel are to be employed or what sorts of procedures will be reimbursed" (Scott 1995).

It is also important to note that technical and institutional environments are not mutually exclusive. Although in the first papers on the subject, Meyer, Scott and Deal (1992) and Scott and Meyer (1992) did not make this point clear, in later studies the authors have been systematically stressing that the two types of environments are complementary. In Scott and Meyer (1994), for example, they acknowledge that concentrating many of their examples and empirical work on a certain kind of

organisation leads to the belief that institutional arguments are specific to certain kinds of organisations. They go further, pointing out that

"we no doubt inadvertently reinforced this error by distinguishing in our work between 'institutional' and 'technical' organisations and environments (Meyer and Rowan 1977, Meyer and Scott 1983). Our intent was to differentiate between different bases of regulating organisations - by attention to process versus outcome controls, not to suggest that some organisations operate outside the framework of institutional forces" (p.119).

Zeitl and Mittal (1993) also argue that technical and institutional approaches have been seen as sometimes opposed to each other but sometimes complementary.

This is to say that organisations operating in technical environments are also subjected to institutional pressures, although technical requirements are the main source of control and resources for survival. Organisations operating in institutional environments also have to comply with technical procedures although institutional elements are the main source of legitimacy and survival (Scott 1995).

Institutions and institutionalisation have been defined in a variety of ways in different areas of knowledge. In this research a sociological view of these concepts is assumed. Institutions are defined as "a social order or pattern that has attained a certain state or property" (Jepperson 1991:45). Institutionalisation involves "the process by which social processes, obligations, or actualities come to take on a rulelike status in social thought and action" (Meyer and Rowan 1983:341).

The process of institutionalisation of normative or cognitive values and beliefs occur in various levels of analysis. Some authors have focused on the interpersonal and intraorganisational levels, using institutional arguments as a form of reviving agency in the study of organisations (DiMaggio 1991, for example). Nevertheless, this research follows the line of Scott and Christensen's (1995) and Scott and Meyer's (1994) work, among others, that emphasise broader influences of wider social and cultural issues affecting organisational life, that is, scientific, professional, political and ideological issues. As they point out

"wider social and cultural worlds infused with long-term process of rationalisation - scientific and professional, cultural and ideological, political and organisational - that have continually expanded possibilities and necessities for organising and for expanding and changing organisations" (Scott and Meyer 1994:3).

This research uses institutional theory arguments to interpret and explain quality practices into two different contexts (particularly shown in chapter 6). In one context (Scotland) there seems to be a high degree of institutionalisation of quality as a managerial tool as part of a broader ideology involving new ideas and forms for managing public sector activities. The managerial approach to the administration of the public sector became particularly noticable in the British government activities during the period of Margaret Thatcher's government and it made an impact on the management, planning and activities of the Scottish Prison Service as a British public service organisation.

In the second context (Brazil) the degree of institutionalisation of quality as a managerial practice and ideology seems to be low, although a growing managerialist discourse can be noticed in the political and governmental arenas. Even though organisations in this environment have an idea of quality in relation to their activities, there seem to be other factors specific to that context which make a more direct impact on the organisations' structure. Moreover, they can act as constraints to the implementation of a more technical approach to quality management. The Brazilian context is characterised by a gap between the formal discourse and the daily practice of management activities in the public sector. This gap Riggs (1964) called formalism, which is a main characteristic of societies in transition or developing countries. The other main characteristic that seems to influence organisational structures and practices in the public service in Brazil is the patrimonial character of the State (Faoro 1989).

Such characteristics of the Brazilian and the British contexts can be helpful in the interpretation of the way quality is perceived and managed in both prison

services. Moreover, they can explain, to a certain extent, organisational practices in both contexts. Prisons are public service organisations and as such they are subject to a series of regulatory statements given by the governments as guidelines for their operations. The norms and rules stated by governments are normally part of an ideology that reflects values and beliefs present in the society as a whole, or in the process of institutionalisation, regarding the way to organise and manage the society. Moreover, in prisons illegalities are managed through penalties and, in this sense, the limits of what is acceptable is set by society. Prisons do not exist just to repress illegalities, but to categorise them. Foucault (1977) points out that the mechanisms of domination used by those who have power or are in power positions include, besides the set of laws, the form of application of those laws in relation to the differential management of illegalities through penalties.

3.2. The Scottish Prison Service Context: Managerialism and the "New Public Service" in Britain

Since the 1970s a new theme appeared to be one of increasing concern in public services in Britain, namely, managerialism. The global economic situation together with other aspects of technological and demographic nature pressurised governments world-wide to pursue efficiency in the delivery of public services. In Britain, particularly, managerialism became a major governmental issue under a conservative government headed by Margaret Thatcher.

Authors studying the British public sector have defined managerialism in two basic ways. The first comprises the elements that, when combined, will lead organisations to structural and processual changes in order to achieve economy and efficiency. As Pollitt (1993:01) points out "managerialism is a set of beliefs and practices, at the core of which burns the seldom-tested assumption that better management will prove an effective solvent for a wide range of economic and social



ills". These practices and beliefs are in essence those of private sector management applied to the public sector. Farnham and Horton (1993b:238) present a good summary of the characteristics of managerialism in the public sector, as follows:

1. adopting a rational approach to managing, which emphasises the role of strategic management in setting objectives and clarifying policy issues;

2. changing organisational structures designed to separate policy from administration and creating executive units with delegated responsibility for service delivery, whether internally to other parts of the organisation or externally to the "public";

3. changing organisational structures which are designed to shorten hierarchies, devolving managerial responsibility for achieving set targets of performance and holding individual managers responsible for achieving them;

4. measuring organisational achievement in terms of the criteria of economy, efficiency and effectiveness;

5. developing performance indicators enabling comparisons and measures of achievement to be made and providing information upon which future decisions can be determined;

6. developing active policies for changing the cultures of public organisations from ones dominated by traditional public service values to ones attuned to the market, business and entrepreneurial values of the 'new' public service model;

7. implementing human resource management techniques aimed at weakening collectivist approaches and introducing individualist ones, including seeking to mobilise employee support and commitment to continual structural and organisational change;

8. seeking to create flexible, responsive and learning public organisations;
and

9. developing a "public service orientation" focusing on the public clients, customers and citizens, with a move away from supply-led to demand-led services,

no longer dominated by professional providers but responsive to the needs of those being served.

The second aspect of a definition of managerialism is an ideological one. Pollitt (1993), Farnham and Horton (1993a) and others explain this dimension of managerialism. Based on Hartley (1983 - quoted by Pollitt 1993) Pollitt points out four elements of an ideology that he would later relate to managerialist ideology, that is:

1. set of beliefs or ideas about the world and how it should be;
2. the set of beliefs and ideas are cognitive and affective elements that form a relatively stable framework;
3. ideologies concern social groups and social arrangements. They are developed and maintained by groups; and
4. ideology provides justification for behaviour.

In terms of the first point, managerialism is concerned with the efficient management of organisations in economic terms, that is, to provide a good service keeping the costs as low as possible. It can be achieved, according to managerialist principles, through "good management practices". It encompasses the adoption of market-like mechanisms to force organisations to perform in a more efficient way (Walsh 1995). Management referring to good administrative practices is a core value in managerial ideologies. As Pollitt (1993:7) points out, the managerialist answer for how to achieve efficiency is "through the introduction of good management practices, which are assumed to be found at the highest pitch and most widely distributed in the private sector". Walsh (1995:101-2) states that three main characteristics of the managerial ideology are:

1. separation of politics and management, since politics is seen as incompatible with efficiency values;
2. the establishment of processes of audit and inspection to provide a check on the freedom of management; and

3. the emergence of "contract" and "customers" as metaphors of the new public service management.

The framework composed by the elements of managerialism has a relatively stable basis on the success of private sector enterprises in the post world-war period (Pollitt 1993). In contrast, public sector activities have grown without the obvious economic success of the private sector, since political and social issues are also important elements of public activity. Nevertheless, with the economic crisis of the late 1970s, economic and financial issues received more attention, which made the differences between the way of running private and public enterprises more evident, with emphasis on the efficiency of the former and the inefficiency of the latter.

Regarding social groups it seems clear that managers are the privileged group. According to Farnham and Horton (1993c), although managerialism has been attributed to the "New Right", that is, right-wing parties' ideologies, especially the Conservative Party, it has its roots in the classical management theories of Taylor (1947) and Fayol (1949), and follows the developments of administrative theory to the actual ideas of excellence, flexibility and quality management. In all these developments, managers are the ones responsible for the changes that will make the organisation successful, which maintains their power over other groups and their status as "heroes" (Pollitt 1993). Other groups are disregarded in this context. Politicians are the main ones, as they are always linked to the idea of inefficiency. Workers and trade unions also have their status limited by managerialist initiatives. However it is important to stress Pollitt's (1993:9) remark that other groups, including the ones seen as being disregarded, "find it convenient to adopt, at least rhetorically, certain elements of managerialism, even if they do not subscribe to the full 'package'." It gives them some legitimacy for the use of terms accepted by society as important and necessary, such as quality.

Finally, ideology justifies behaviour. Although Pollitt (1993) emphasises that the relationship between ideas and behaviour is rather complex, ideologies can

provide legitimacy in the sense that it can call for values shared by the society as a whole. As said before, managerialist ideology was successful in spreading its values since economic, political, social and technological contingencies in Britain (see Pollitt 1993; Farnham and Horton 1993a) provided the ideal ground for its legitimacy.

Pollitt (1993) points out that the set of managerial proposals for the administration of the British public sector became known in the academic literature as the "New Public Service" (NPS). Although he stresses that it is too early to analyse its impact on the services organisation and delivery, others like Farnham and Horton (1993c:248-9) provide four major criticisms of it, that can be summarised as follows:

- 1) managerialism is an essentially directive and potentially authoritarian model of managing and hence limited. It limits collective participation in the managerial process;

- 2) although managerialist initiatives claim to be un-political, they have been carried out by politicians who for long have been involved in making policies discursively linked to organisational effectiveness;

- 3) organisational changes carried out have been causing adverse consequences for the staff, particularly affecting the morale of public servants and their condition of employment; and

- 4) the reforms in the sector can be used to cover up lack of investment and effective renewal of public service infrastructures. It can also fragment public services leading to variations of quality standards, which can diminish the distinctiveness of the public services as providers to the community and their attractiveness as potential employers to the best qualified and most skilled members of the workforce.

These criticisms seem to be based on theoretical assumptions, and empirical evidence is needed in order to provide a more accurate analysis of the impact of managerialism assumptions on the organisation and provision of effective services.

However, Pollitt (1993) raises an interesting issue on the subject. He points out that NPS comprises two different dimensions: a customer-driven approach and a management-driven one. While the rhetoric of quality emphasises a customer-driven approach, where citizenship became a major element, the market side of NPS is still very much management-driven. The two approaches seem to be conflicting, but this, as well, needs to be empirically tested.

3.3. The Brazilian Prison Service Context: Formalism and Patrimonialism in the Public Services

Formalism has been discussed in Brazilian social and political studies for a long time (see Ramos 1983 for references and examples) but it was the work of Riggs (1964) that systematised the study of the phenomenon and made it known world-wide through the development of the "Theory of Prismatic Society"⁽⁴⁾.

According to Riggs (1964) the process of social development is similar to a diffraction, phenomenon that is known in physics as the spreading of light. Diffraction in Riggs' (1964) terms means the differentiation between independent and specific functions, and the different and specific structures and organisations that compose the society. In physics this process is instantaneous but in social development terms the process is much slower, varying from society to society.

Based on this metaphor Riggs (1964) idealised three hypothetical models of society. The first one is the concentrated society where there is a predominance of diffuse structures. In a concentrated society the structures are diffuse and their functions are performed in an unruly way. There is no specific function allocated to a specific structure (e.g. the family in traditional societies perform moral, ethical, religious, political and educational functions). The second model is the diffracted one

⁽⁴⁾ Although formalism is not the only characteristic of a prismatic society, for the purposes of this research this will be the main focus of analysis.

in which every structure performs a single and specific function or a small number of different functions (e.g. USA, United Kingdom and other industrialised countries). The third model is the prismatic society composed of diffuse and specific structures at the same time. The overlaying of structures in this model generates incongruences and ambiguities regarding social and administrative issues. Riggs (1964) believes that it is possible to have empirical evidence that modern societies - the ones that are industrially developed and administratively efficient - are the ones that also present a relatively high degree of diffraction or differentiation, that is, their functions are very specific to certain structures or organisations. On the other hand, societies that to a greater extent traditional orientations tend to be very concentrated. Finally, societies in transition or in a process of development will present prismatic structural forms.

Riggs (1964) admits the existence of formalism in all three models of society although he affirms that the degree of its occurrence is much higher in prismatic societies due to their heterogeneous characteristics. He uses the developing countries as an example. In these countries one can find rural communities still very primitive. At the same time, in the big urban centres, there are developed communities with social values in a constant process of change.

The overlaying of structures in developing countries prepares the ground for the rise of polinormativism and, therefore, of non-observance of norms in general terms. This fact is responsible for the great gaps between the laws and their execution. In administrative terms, the lack of control of such gaps leads to opportunities for bureaucrats who can fabricate interpretations that allow them to do whatever they think is interesting for them, for their clients, or for those of whom they protect the interests.

In this context formalism is likely to occur. According to Riggs (1964) formalism is the gap between the prescriptive and the descriptive, between the formal power and the effective power, between the impression that is given by laws and the facts and practices of the government and the society. It is also cause and

consequence of the lack of harmony and objectives in the way of conquering political authority. It gives people in power positions less control over the administrative and social situation leading them into making more formal rules which would contribute to polinormativism, that is, the emergence of a set of rules and regulations aiming to regulate a specific phenomenon that are, in fact, unconnected to the natural social process and, therefore, impossible to follow.

Riggs (1964) attributes this flexibility of the legal system to the formation of an elite of legalist bureaucrats, who aimed to get personal benefits from the laws instead of paying attention to their macro-social functions. For Ramos (1983b) the elite, in prismatic societies, is always in a privileged place in relation to ordinary people because of its position in social process. Riggs (1964) also comments that in some cases the laws are so formalistic in their nature and so difficult in execution that it became necessary to elaborate new laws and, in this way, a process of successive multiplication of laws was established.

Ramos (1983b) considers Riggs' (1964) study of formalism as one of the most comprehensive on the subject. Nevertheless, Ramos (1983b) brings attention to the lack of systematic completion of the study on formalism in the prismatic societies. For him, this is a consequence of a limitation in the historical perspective dimension of Riggs' (1964) work, since the latter analyses the issue from a hegemonic society. For Ramos (1983b:271)

"Riggs describes the formalism in prismatic societies from the outside. The vision of the phenomenon has to be necessarily other when the subject find him or herself in the middle of the prismatic society and takes part in the process of overcoming its actual stage of development".

Ramos (1983b) considers formalism as a normal and even necessary element instead of a pathological phenomenon of prismatic societies. As he points out "formalism in prismatic societies can be regarded as a strategy of change imposed by

the dual character of its historical formation and by the particular way in which it interacts with the rest of the world" Ramos (1983b:271).

Formalism as a strategy of change is necessary for countries in a phase of social and economic development, that is, for countries that drive themselves in the direction of a diffracted society. The integration of these countries in the world causes a type of duality - economic and social formation - of internal and external elements. Internal conditions to social and economic development are smaller in developing countries than the external ones but, when these conditions are becoming equivalent, the duality will be smaller and, therefore, the degree of formalism will be smaller, from an institutional point of view.

The difference between the formal and the actual practice in Brazilian social and cultural life can be observed throughout its history, but it has its basis on three centuries of Portuguese dominance and European influence. Portugal and Europe imposed much of their culture and institutions, and economic and political systems on Brazil. According to Sander (1977:36)

"many exogenous norms and institutions were assimilated from Brazilian society, in process of formation, through a mimetic process of conscious or unconscious adaptation, while other imported elements have never incorporated themselves to the nationality and, therefore, they are not Brazilian and they do not have support in the real life".

Prescribed norms are ignored, and other alternative codes and institutions are adopted simultaneously to replace them. This characteristic of Brazilian society in general, and public sector activities in particular, is also strongly related to the patrimonialist character of the State in Brazil.

Schwartzman (1988) points out that the institutionalisation of governmental practices is linked to the stabilisation of Brazil as a Portuguese colony, and later to the continuity of the presence of Portuguese influence through the presence of members of the royal family even after independence in 1822.

The concession of political and administrative positions during these years was performed as an exchange of particular interests among the elite and the government (Faoro 1977). Differing from North American colonisation, where the private initiative had an important role, the Brazilian case was the result of the action of the centralised and militarised Portuguese State.

While during the Empire some ideas of French Iluminism were discussed in the Brazilian context, two conservative institutions remained almost until the Republic had been proclaimed - monarchy and slavery. It shows the dual character of the social and political formation of Brazil. The end of the imperial years, according to Faoro (1977), was caused among other factors, by this duality between institutions. He points out, as an example, the incapacity of the government to come to terms with the rise of local and regional leadership during the process of social and economic development of the country. Faoro (1977) describes that political rights during the imperial period were linked to income and property. Through a series of irregularities the government elected candidates to political and administrative positions showing, according to Cardoso (1977), not a State based on liberal ideas but an oligarchy that behind a liberal discourse represented, in fact, forms of traditional domination and patrimonialist practices of an authoritarian nature. This characteristic remained present until the end of the period called "Old Republic" in 1930⁽⁵⁾.

After 1930 Brazilian development is characterised by an ascending urbanisation and industrialisation. In this period efficiency, productivity and organisation became important aims and part of the political and economical discourse. As this process is still an ongoing one and Brazil is still largely a developing country, heterogeneity (e.g. coexistence of rural and urban, old and modern, underdeveloped and developed elements), overlaying of functions and

(5) It is not an aim of this research to give a detailed description of the social, political and economic development of Brazil. but just to provide a basis for the understanding of some actual administrative practices. A complete analysis can be found in the work of DaMatta (1993, 1987 and 1983), Schwartzman (1988), Ramos (1983b), Faoro (1977), Cardoso (1977), among others.

structures and other elements of a formalist and patrimonialist State are still present in the administrative spheres of the society. The result of this is that Brazilian social institutions are always subjected to two types of pressure: a) bureaucratic and legal norms; and b) the network of personal relationships and social resources that these networks allocate (DaMatta 1987). These characteristics jeopardise administrative initiatives based on rational principles, as the findings of Souza (1991) and Casate (1990) suggest. They represent, therefore, starting points for the understanding of administrative practices in the Brazilian context and they are likely to be of primary importance when a rational managerial programme is to be introduced.

As DaMatta (1987) points out, these issues have to be addressed in order to be, if not solved, at least limited in order to maintain the basics of democratic principles and make them more operational. Formalism in the actual Brazilian context, in the sense it was described in this chapter, tends to jeopardise the institutionalisation of citizenship as a strong value in the society.

The managerialist approach to public administration in Britain and the formalistic and the patrimonialistic character of public administration in Brazil are likely to influence and explain, to a certain extent, quality perceptions and initiatives in the Scottish Prison Service and in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC respectively. Moreover, they provide the basis for a discussion about the possibility of implementing a rational and formal quality management programme in the context of Brazilian public services.

Chapter 4: Methodology

This Chapter presents an overview of the methodology used to investigate the research problem and to achieve its specific objectives as stated in chapter 1.

4.1. Research Questions, Key concepts and Variables

Following Miles and Huberman (1994), the establishment of a set of research questions is the next step after the formulation of a theoretical framework for the research purposes. The formulation of research questions helps the data collection be more focused and limited. The research questions begin the operationalisation of the conceptual framework aimed at the achievement of the research objectives.

In order to achieve the main objective of this research, that is, to identify and compare quality definition and initiatives, as well as its relation with structural aspects of the Brazilian and the Scottish Prison Services, some research questions were initially formulated and later refined by the course of the fieldwork. This is a well accepted procedure in conducting qualitative research (Miles and Huberman 1994), since it allows flexibility for the researcher in trying to minimise the degree of distortion of the organisational context that could arise from pre-established research instruments (Bryman 1992). The research questions of this study were established as follows:

- 1) What are the significant components of quality definition in the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Services?
- 2) What is the rationale behind the quality definition in the SPS and the BPS-SC?
- 3) How do organisational members identify the customers of the SPS and the BPS-SC?

4) What is the impact of the SPS quality management initiatives on structural aspects (job structure and control) of the organisation?

5) What are the significant elements of the relationship between quality initiatives and structural aspects of the BPS-SC?

6) How do quality perceptions and initiatives compare/contrast in the SPS and the BPS-SC?

7) What is the relationship between the institutional contexts in which both organisations operate and quality definition and initiatives in the SPS and the BPS-SC?

8) Can elements of institutional context explain, in any way, the creation of quality perceptions and initiatives in the SPS and the BPS-SC?

In order to answer these questions, information had to be collected on key concepts and variables to allow the operationalisation of the research (Dixon, Bouma and Atkinson 1991). The concepts and variables involved in the study are defined as follows:

- Quality: it is an abstract concept normally defined as an intrinsic characteristic of something (Petelin 1992). Quality was operationalised in this research through the identification of significant elements quoted by members of different organisational groups as quality components of the organisation's actual or ideal practices. The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes.
- organisational groups: in this research it relates to a certain number of people within the organisation pursuing the same basic objectives. It was operationalised by the categorisation of organisational members according to their professional position as governors, technicians and prison officers (based on Carvalho [1993]). The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes.

- customers: a concentration of needs and satisfaction of needs in an individual, within a market situation of supply and demand of goods and services (adapted from Pollitt and Bouckaert [1995]). As well as quality, the concept of customer was operationalised in this research through the identification of categories quoted by members of different organisational groups as the customers of the services offered. The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes.
- operative objectives: represent the ends sought through the operational politics of the organisation (Perrow 1978). In this research they were operationalised through the identification during interviews, of the aims (see section 4.4) of the different organisational groups regarding organisational activities. The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes.
- Job Structure⁽⁶⁾ : in this research it is defined as a set of characteristics that determine both how jobs are to be performed, as well as how the workers relate to the established performances. The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes, and it aggregates dimensions of job design and job satisfaction (based on Child 1984). Five dimensions were selected: three as components of job design, and two of job satisfaction, as follows:

Job design

- 1) understanding of the function: the degree in which the dimensions of a specific social role within an organisation is perceived by its performer.
- 2) managerial skills: the ability to perform activities which involve some degree of organisation, planning, controlling and co-ordination (leadership).
- 3) delegation: "it is a particular meaning of the term decentralisation and describes a condition when the authority to make specified decisions is passed

⁽⁶⁾ The analysis of this variable is performed in relation to the impact of the quality management programme on the structure only in the case of the Scottish Prison Service (chapter 5), since no quality management programme was implemented in the Brazilian case (BPS-SC) to allow such analysis to be performed.

down to units and people at lower levels in the organisation's hierarchy" (Child 1984:146).

job satisfaction

4) job satisfaction: the degree of contentment with the activities performed (with respect to both the interviewee and his or her perception of the general level of job satisfaction among the staff).

5) morale: the mental and emotional attitudes of an individual to the tasks expected of him or her (with respect to both the interviewee and his or her perception of the general level of morale among the staff).

- control: in this research a distinction made by Child (1984:136) is assumed "between control as a general process and control as specific mechanism used within that process". In organisations, control is the process whereby groups of people are able to initiate and regulate activities toward the achievement of their specific aims. As specific mechanisms, control signifies the monitoring and evaluation process of behaviour or outputs (Ouchi 1977). The variable was operationalised both for data collection and data analysis purposes through a set of open-ended questions aiming at identifying supervision, subordination, performance evaluation methods, and rules and regulations (written or otherwise).
- institutional environments: "institutional environments are broadly defined as including the rules and belief systems as well as the relational networks that arise in the broader societal context" (Meyer and Scott 1992:14). It is believed that a group of shared myths and beliefs can, and will, guide organisational action, because it evolves a socially legitimated definition as real. Therefore, "environments are more than stocks of resources and energy flows; they are cultural systems, defining and legitimating organisational structures" (Meyer and Scott 1992:1). The variable was operationalised only for data analysis purposes as

an interpretative model, based on a theoretical foundation presented in chapter 3, sections 3.2 and 3.3.

4.2. Research Design

The research strategy adopted is mostly qualitative. Although qualitative research has been historically used in some fields of investigation in the social sciences, notably anthropology, history and political sciences, as Miles and Huberman (1994) point out, "in the past decade more research in basic disciplines and applied fields (psychology, sociology, linguistics, public administration, organisation studies, business studies, health care, urban planning, educational research, family studies, program evaluation, and policy analysis) has shifted to a more qualitative paradigm" (Miles and Huberman 1994:1).

Qualitative research is that which is mostly based on qualitative analysis. As Alasuutari (1995:7) points out, qualitative analysis is the "reasoning and argumentation that is not based simply on statistical relations between 'variables', by which certain objects or observation units are described". The reasoning and argumentation in qualitative analysis is based on a variety of techniques used in a qualitative way, such as formal and informal interview, field-observation techniques, historical analysis, among others. Nevertheless, Alasuutari (1995) stresses that the definition of qualitative research does not imply the exclusion of some quantitative analysis of qualitative data alongside qualitative analysis. Martin (1990:31) also comments on the subject, arguing that "these definitions are not meant to imply that quantitative research is objective, while qualitative research is subjective. Any research - whether qualitative or quantitative - must include subjective elements".

The qualitative research strategy was considered appropriate to the study of quality definition and initiatives in the Scottish and in the Brazilian Prison Services since, as Miles and Huberman (1994) point out, it provides well-grounded rich

descriptions and explanations of processes in identifiable local contexts. Moreover, "they help the researcher to get beyond initial conceptions and to generate or revise conceptual frameworks" (Miles and Huberman 1994:1). The last point is particularly important to this research since the study questions the limitations of the use of some established ways to analyse quality in organisations and suggests additional elements to such ways.

Although mostly qualitative, this research also uses some basic quantitative analysis both to support qualitative findings and to provide a better visualisation of the results. As Martin (1990) argues, the qualitative vs. quantitative research is a false dichotomy. "It is essential to conceptualise the qualitative vs. quantitative distinction not as a dichotomy, but as a continuum, with mixed methods at the midpoint of the scale" (Martin 1990:31). She goes further, arguing that "the simple mono-method approach impedes the sharing of knowledge about organisational phenomena" (p.33).

This research is also characterised as a case-comparative study. It enables comparisons between two or more specific scopes to be established.

According to Dixon, Bouma and Atkinson (1991) case studies are normally exploratory in nature and their main characteristic is to offer an in depth description of a certain reality which can enable the formulation of hypothesis for future work. However, the authors point out that not all case studies are exploratory. They can be used to test an initial hypothesis of the relationship between variables, without implying cause and effect relationship (Yin 1994).

On the nature of case studies, Bryman (1989:173) comments that they "are often useful for providing an understanding of areas of organisational functioning that are not well documented and which are not amenable to investigation through fleeting contact with organisations". The exploratory and descriptive design of case studies also provides an in depth examination of the organisation where there is insufficient knowledge of the context being focused. Although this argument is valid

for both cases analysed in this research, it was particularly suited to the Brazilian case, where there were no records available on quality initiatives. Moreover the exploratory nature of the case study is adequate to the application of an alternative model of analysing and understanding quality initiatives (*the use of operative objectives and organisational groups as the main categories of analysis*), allowing later statements to be made on the applicability and viability of such an alternative model. That same exploratory and descriptive nature of the case study allows also to contemplate a facet of the phenomenon only superficially addressed by the literature on quality management in particular and organisation studies in general, which is the importance of taking into consideration the impact of structural and contextual characteristics of organisations on quality perceptions and initiatives.

The comparison involves the usage (measuring or analysing) of two or more different realities in order to find out similarities and differences between them. According to Dixon, Bouma and Atkinson (1991: 117) in a comparison study two or more groups are compared "using the same measure of the same variables at or nearly at the same time". This research has the characteristics of a case-comparative study because it comprises an in depth analysis of the concepts and variables selected in two specific organisation in two different contexts. The fact that the analysis takes place in a specific moment of the reality of both organisations also characterises the research as a cross-sectional one.

The choice of the study of the prison service in the two different organisational contexts of Scotland and Brazil is suited to the comparison of a formal and an informal dimension of quality initiatives based on the conceptual framework established in chapter 2. It also provided the possibility for the study of quality initiatives in public sector organisations, since the specialised literature in public management, organisation studies and quality management is still in need of more empirical evidence. Moreover, it is also well suited to the discussion of the influence of institutional contexts on organisational practices since Scotland and Brazil are in

very different cultural and historical situations, according to the conceptual framework developed in chapter 3.

4.3. Fieldwork

The initial stage of the fieldwork was carried out in January 1993, when the first contact was made with Quality Scotland Foundation, an organisation that agreed to intermediate the first contact between the researcher and the Scottish Prison Service. The SPS is a founder member of Quality Scotland Foundation. The latter organisation has, as its main objective, the spread of quality philosophy through different organisations in diverse areas of activity throughout Scotland. After a series of meetings with the chief Executive and other members of Quality Scotland Foundation sufficient information in oral and documented form was gathered which enabled the researcher to prepare the interview to be conducted in the field.

In June 1993 the first initial contact was made in Brazil in order to prepare the ground for a later visit by the researcher to the organisations to be studied. These contacts were made by mail with a key informant in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC who provided sufficient information for the preparation of the interviews to be conducted. This informant was also an intermediate for the initial contact of the researcher with the BPS-SC. Contact was also made with the Group for Research in Organisations at the Federal University of Santa Catarina. This contact proved to be very fruitful since the Group provided all the necessary infrastructure for the researcher to conduct the study.

Based on the initial information gathered in Scotland and in Brazil, as well as on the theoretical framework built for this research, the following techniques were chosen as appropriate to conduct the main part of the fieldwork:

1) open-ended interviews: this technique was used as the main source of information. They had the objective of identifying quality perceptions, quality

initiatives, customer definition and some characteristics of the organisational internal and external environment that could present some kind of relationship with the main concepts and variables analysed in the research. The interviews conducted in Scotland and in Brazil present some differences due to the specific characteristics of each situation (see Appendix 1 for the interview schedule in Scotland and Appendix 2 for the interview schedule in Brazil). The differences refer basically to the introduction of new questions in the BPS-SC questionnaire. Since there was no formal quality management programme operating in the organisation, three questions were introduced with the intention of picturing some administrative characteristics of the organisation (questions 3, 5 and 12) which would allow further comparison with SPS administrative characteristics. Although in the case of SPS most of the referred characteristics were explicit in written documents (particularly in those related to the quality management programme) some of them were again discussed during the interviews, given the nature of an open-ended interview process. The questions regarding the impact of the introduction of quality management programme on job structure in the SPS questionnaire have no correspondence in the BPS-SC questionnaire, since the latter organisation was not involved in the implementation of such kind of programme.

The period of interviewing in Scotland was carried out between September 1993 and March 1994. These interviews were conducted in the Headquarters of the Scottish Prison Service, in Perth Prison and in Dungavel Prison. In Brazil the interviews were carried out between April 1994 and July 1994 at the Headquarters of the Brazilian Prison Service (DIAP), in Florianópolis Prison and in Chapecó Prison.

At both Headquarters the interviews were conducted with key informants. In Scotland interviews were conducted with three employees on the higher hierarchical levels of the organisation. Two of these employees were responsible for the strategic planning, and one for the human resource management. In Brazil two interviews

were conducted, one with the Director of the organisation and one with the Director's main adviser.

In the prisons studied the interviews were conducted with governors, technicians (psychologists and social workers) and prisons officers. These interviews were conducted as follows:

- In Scotland nine out of sixteen governors (7 in Perth and 2 in Dungavel) were interviewed, and in Brazil eleven out of twelve (6 in Florianópolis and 5 in Chapecó), covering all functional areas. The number of interviews conducted with governors were constrained by both availability and time schedules. Nevertheless the number of governors interviewed is considered representative of the category. The interviews were tape-recorded and had duration of approximately one hour.
- Four out of eight technicians were interviewed in Scotland (3 in Perth and 1 in Dungavel), and in Brazil five out of five technicians (3 in Florianópolis and 2 in Chapecó), again due to availability and time schedule constraints. The results are, however, seen as representative of this professional category. Although the interview schedule was basically the same as used with governors, they lasted on average one and a half hours with technicians, as they always detailed subjects related to some specific treatment activity being developed. The interviews were tape-recorded.
- The interviews with prisons officers were conducted in very different circumstances. Officers in both the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Services were allocated to the interviews by the organisation due to their availability. Security was the reason alleged by the organisation for such a procedure. These interviews were undertaken in groups which varied in size according to officers disposability. The choice of group interviews was due to the possibility of accessing a larger number of officers. Most of the interviews were conducted after training sessions when officers were available. This procedure was seen by

the organisations as being the most appropriate for them. The interviews lasted for thirty to forty minutes in Scotland and for twenty to thirty minutes in Brazil. It was possible to interview a minimum of 10% of all officers in each prison (39 officers in Perth Prison, 12 in Dungavel, 12 in Florianópolis and 10 in Chapecó). Considering the nature of the organisations studied, which offer difficult access to data, these numbers of formal interviews together with other techniques (participation in training sessions and informal interviews) were considered appropriate for the establishment of a general picture of this professional category in relation to the concepts and variables under analysis. The interviews in Scotland were tape-recorded but in Brazil such a procedure was not efficient since it was a cause of concern for both Chief of the officers in Florianópolis and in Chapecó Prisons. Therefore, written notes were used to register the results of the interviews with prison officers in Brazil.

2) informal interviews: this technique was used mainly with members of the three main organisational groups studied, but also with other personnel (e.g. clerical workers) within the organisations. This procedure had the objective of identifying important aspects of the organisational reality that could not have been covered by the open-ended interviews. The informal interviews were undertaken during breaks between formal interviews, lunch breaks, and coffee and tea breaks.

3) documentary research: this procedure refers to the collection of official documents of the organisation including management plans, official letters, projects for the development of specific activities, reports of activities, and all kind of published material related to the objectives of this research. It had the objective of establishing a formal picture of the organisation in relation to the concepts and variables analysed in this research.

4) participation in training sessions: this procedure was used only in the Scottish case, since there is a lack of specialised training in the Brazilian case as will become clear in chapter 6. In both Perth and Dungavel Prison the researcher

participated in different training activities for prison officers including technical training (e.g. on behaviour in court), team-briefings and training on quality management. It also helped to create a picture of the organisational context and to have a better understanding of how officers perceived quality initiatives. It was particularly useful in view of the stated constraints regarding the formal interviews with prison officers.

The main period of fieldwork was completed at the end of July 1994, when the researcher had finished the data collection in Brazil. Nevertheless, additional contact with the organisations both in Scotland and in Brazil was made in order to: a) gather additional information on specific aspects of the organisation when needed; b) to check some information collected beforehand; and c) to collect new official material considered relevant for the research.

4.4. Data Analysis

Data was analysed mostly in a qualitative form, although some basic quantitative analysis was also performed on the impact of the formal quality management programme of the SPS on some areas of job design, satisfaction and control in the organisation.

The procedures for the analysis of data started with the transcriptions of the tapes containing the interviews with governors, technicians and prison officers in Scotland and in Brazil. After the transcriptions, it was possible to visualise the definition of quality for the members of each organisational group through the identification of significant elements quoted in the interviews as examples of quality practices. Some elements were quoted more than once in each interview or were repeated in different interviews. Therefore the results of the interviews for components of quality definition for each organisational group were subjected to a clustering process technique for qualitative data (Miles and Huberman 1994), in

order to define only the significant elements for each group. This process refers to: a) a content analysis of the interviews in order to define response categories, b) a manual process of establishing clusters according to the categories identified during the previous phase, and c) the analysis of the different clusters generated by the responses. The same procedure was used for the analysis of the results on customer identification in all organisations studied.

The final result of the identification of significant components of quality definition allowed the researcher to establish categories, probably not totally independent from each other but sufficiently consistent, for the identification of rationales behind the quality definition of each organisational group. These categories were established as follows:

- managerialist rationale: this category includes all the components of quality definition quoted in the interviews related to formal quality management programmes and those related to the performance specific managerial activities (e.g. set clear targets).
- legalist rationale: this category encompasses all components quoted, that make any reference to the legal aspects of the prison service (e.g. observance of legal deadlines to offer changes in the regimes of incarceration).
- professional rationale (custody): this category relates to all components referring to custodial activities, relating mainly to specific professions (e.g. prison officers function of escorts).
- professional rationale (rehabilitation): this category includes to all components referring to rehabilitation activities, relating mainly to specific professions (e.g. social workers function of preparation for release).
- humanist rationale: this category encompasses all components quoted that make any reference to the general aspects of human relations within the prisons (e.g. treat people well).

The results of significant components of quality definition, quality rationale and customer identification were displayed in a content matrix (Miles and Huberman 1994) which would allow a better visualisation of the general results.

The results are then discussed in a descriptive form. A cross-checking of the results of the open-ended interviews with information collected through informal interviews, and the information contained in the formal documents of the organisations, was then implemented. It allowed the identification of the gaps between the formal procedures and the organisational practices, as well as to a better understanding of the rationales behind discourses and action. The results are discussed in relation to the findings of other authors in the literature.

For the analysis of the impact of the formal quality management programme of the SPS on aspects of job design, satisfaction and control, the procedure used was different, since the data allowed some quantification of results. The interviews with governors and technicians were transcribed, and the results were quantified and presented in tables. The respondents were asked to identify if a specific situation concerning job structure was higher, lower or had no significant change after the implementation of the quality management programme. The data related to prison officers could not be quantified, due to the circumstances in which the interviews were held. They were presented in content matrix. Nevertheless, it is believed that they provide a reliable picture of prison officers' vision on these issues, as detailed in chapter 5 and chapter 6 where these analyses are demonstrated. These results were then discussed and compared with findings reported in the literature.

For the comparison between the Scottish and the Brazilian views on quality definition, rationale of quality definition, and customer identification, a clustering process was performed between prisons in the same country. This procedure had the objective of getting a general result for each country. The results were then displayed in a content matrix to allow a better visualisation of the differences and similarities between the prison services in Scotland and in Brazil regarding quality initiatives.

Next the results of each country were discussed in a comparative form. Interpretations and explanations for the results are based on the characteristics of the institutional contexts in which organisations in both countries operate. Based on institutional theory arguments (Scott 1995; Scott and Meyer 1994) and in cross-cultural comparative research studies (Kohn 1989) an institutional framework for the more interpretative stage of the research was considered adequate.

4.5. Limitations of the Study

This study presents some general limitations related to the method used, as well as some others directly related to the techniques employed.

Qualitative methods of research are often criticised for being too subjective in contrast with the alleged scientific objectivity of quantitative research. It is in fact true that qualitative research normally has a greater subjective dimension. However, this does not imply that scientific procedures could not be established. An explicit definition of research questions, concepts and variables as well as a detailed description of field procedures helps to assure that qualitative research has an acceptable degree of objectivity and allows replications to be made. This argument is defended by authors like Miles and Huberman (1994), and Morgan (1983) among others. It also has to be pointed out that all kinds of research methods must present a subjective dimension (Martin 1990).

Even having a more subjective nature, qualitative research offers a great degree of flexibility to the researcher for the adequacy of the theoretical framework to the study of the organisational phenomenon.

The author of this research assumes the position defended by Martin (1990) in relation to the need of breaking mono-method approaches to organisation studies. Different methods serve different purposes and mixed methods can only contribute to the advancement of knowledge in the field.

The other limitation of this research is related to the use of a case study approach, which is exploratory and descriptive in nature. Therefore, no hypothesis is tested and no generalisation of universal laws can be made. However, case-studies are particularly well suited for the study of a phenomenon about which there is no or little knowledge available. As stated before, this is the case of the study of quality initiatives in the public sector in general, and especially in prisons.

This leads to the problem of generalisation. Case studies do not allow a generalisation to be made. On the other hand, they allow an in depth understanding of the phenomenon under study. Moreover, the results of case study research can be used as the basis for further studies in the same or related areas.

In terms of specific techniques used in this research, three basic limitations were detected. The first refers to the use of interviews as the main source of information. Interviews can always contain a bias either in the questions or in the answers (Yin 1994). However, they allow the data collection to be targeted, that is, to be focused directly on the case study topic. They also provide a valuable insight as they allow flexibility to both the interviewer and the interviewee. A cross-checking of the data collected in different sources eliminates the possibility of bias in conducting interviews.

The second is related to the limited sense in which the research question on the impact of quality management on job structure and control was operationalised. However, that impact can only be determined in the presence of a formal quality management programme, which is true only for the SPS case. Given the strong cross-cultural nature of the research, that analysis cannot be the most central one. Moreover, given the broad scope of the study, such an operationalisation (based on Child 1984) was considered reasonably adequate.

The third refers to the difficulty of access to prison officers. The officers were allocated to the interviews by the organisation, as stated before. This could have caused a great bias in the results, particularly in the Scottish case, where opinions are

divergent between new and old prison officers. However, informal interviews and other sources of information allowed this bias to be diminished. The results about officers in both the SPS and the BPS-SC are therefore limited to a general picture of the perceptions of officers about the issues raised by the author. Nevertheless it is believed that the data about prison officers presents a sufficient degree of reliability (both of method and sample) to be taken into consideration as basis for further studies.

Chapter 5: Quality, Job Structure and Control in the Scottish Prison Service (SPS)

5.1. Organisation of the Scottish Prison Service

The Scottish Prison Service as it is known nowadays owes its formation to William Brebner, Governor of the Glasgow Bridewell, who almost single-handed established in 1824 a system of separation of prisoners (fewer prisoners per cell - which would lead to a just one inmate per cell in the modern prison system - as well as the separation of inmates by categories), several years before a similar system was introduced into the Philadelphia Penitentiary and became famous as the "Philadelphia System" (Coyle 1991).

Historically the prison system in Scotland was clearly recognised as part of the criminal justice process, since it has always been responsible for the incarceration of prisoners sentenced by courts (custody and control). However, that relationship became blurred over the last half century, since a concern with rehabilitation started to grow into the system in opposition to that traditional emphasis on custody and control. In fact, the system appears to have been transiting between a justice and custodial model and a therapeutic and social welfare model (Coyle 1991).

Beyond this process link with the criminal justice, the prison system is subordinated to Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons for Scotland. The Chief Executive of the Prison System is responsible for implementing the recommendations of the HM Chief Inspector which are accepted by the Secretary of State for Scotland and which fall within his delegated authority (SPS 1993a).

The Scottish Prison Service is a public organisation, headed by a Chief Executive whose appointment is approved by the Secretary of State normally following open competition. The Chief Executive is answerable to the Secretary of

State for Scotland for the operation of the Agency and for its performance. The Chief Executive is also supported by a Prisons Board, which comprises the Deputy Chief Executive (who also acts as Director of Prisons), the Director of Strategy and Corporate Affairs, the Director of Human Resources, and the Director of Finance and Information Systems. The Prisons Board may include two non-Executive Directors appointed by the Secretary of State for Scotland.

The Scottish Prison Service has some 4,600 staff. Most are unified Prison Service grades or civilians employed in the 21 prison establishments around Scotland. Responsibility to Parliament for the SPS belongs to the Secretary of State for Scotland, and within the Scottish Office the Scottish Home and Health Department are principally involved in administering the Service.

In November 1973 the prison welfare role was formally integrated with local authority social work services, whom are responsible for the after-care of those who have left penal establishments after serving their sentences.

The Service itself is composed of the Headquarters based in Edinburgh and 21 prison establishments. The Headquarters' organisational structure, at the time of the field-work, was headed up by a Chief Executive, accountable for four major Directors:

1. Strategy and Planning
2. Human Resources
3. Prison
4. Finance and Information Systems

In terms of prisons, the system comprises 14 establishments for persons aged 21 and over. Among these prisons, 13 are for male and one is for female prisoners. These prisons have normally two basic functions: a) holding adults on remand; and b) holding adults after they have been sentenced.

There are two general types of prisons in Scotland: regional prisons and local prisons. Regional prisons do not accept admissions direct from court. Only prisoners

from other prisons who have been selected as suitable may be transferred to the less-restrictive or open conditions of regional prisons. Local prisons receive all kinds of prisoners regardless of the category in which they are classified after entering the penitentiary system.

Prisoners are classified into four categories from A to D in accordance with perceptions of how dangerous they are. Prisoners in category A are regarded to be the most dangerous ones and they require a prison with a high degree of security. Categories B, C and D prisoners vary in the degree of danger in descending order.

In Service two institutions are solely for young offenders (offenders between 16 and 21 years of age), while three others have young offenders institutions within the prison. Young offenders are allocated to these institutions according to the length of their sentences and in the light of an assessment of their needs and abilities.

Two special units for prisoners displaying difficult behaviour were opened in Shotts and Barlinnie prisons. These units have a separate administration and are considered distinct establishments. The SPS is therefore composed of a total of 21 establishments.

The staff of the Scottish Prison Service comprises a total of 5,000 people, of which 4,300 are in the field. The number of prisoners is obviously variable. In the middle of September of 1994, when data collection in Scotland was considered finished, the number of prisoners totalled 5,500.

5.2. Quality Initiatives Within the Scottish Prison Service

In 1988 the SPS started on a change programme in order to deal with some management difficulties that the system was passing through in that period, such as *inter alia*, overcrowding, arbitrary and non-systematic privilege system regarding

prisoners, increases in the number of long term prisoners, and control problems especially from 1986 to 1988.

From 1988 to 1990 the organisation discussed and matured the ideas that would lead to the implementation of the change programme. That discussion originated the document named "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS 1990a), which formalises the new philosophy of the SPS.

According to the SPS (1990a), a long term prisoner system has to be based in a view of a better quality mainstream system. They affirm that "the main solution to the problem of prisoners with difficulties lies, not in providing them with purpose-built control units, but rather in providing a **better quality mainstream system** (bold in the original) in which even prisoners with difficulties will normally find they can co-operate reasonably well" (SPS 1990a:29).

This strategy comprises a different view of the prisoner - a view of a person who is responsible. Despite the fact that he or she has acted irresponsibly many times in the past, the SPS' new vision is that the System has to encourage the prisoner to accept responsibility for their actions by providing them with opportunities for responsible choice and personal development. In the SPS vision for change it is expressed that "causes of crime are complex, and the old view of the offender as a person in need of 'treatment' can be no longer sustained" (SPS 1990a:29). Moreover, the concern of the Service "should be related to that offender in ways which would assist the individual to return to the community more able to act as a responsible citizen and to cope both personally in himself and with his environment" (SPS 1990a:30).

Central to this strategy is the proposal for developing a sentence plan that includes provision of more information to the prisoner regarding the prison service, providing a self-analysis package for the prisoner to work through, enlargement of the scope of choices available to the prisoner regarding his or her opportunities and responsibilities and developing the role of the prison officer as the facilitator of the

process. This last item is rather complex and involves a massive investment in training in order to try to change the culture of the Service and, of course, the results are not totally predictable.

The change in the vision of the prisoner documented in "Opportunity and Responsibility" needs to be in accordance to the assurance of secure custody of those committed to prison by the courts. The document expresses that "the Scottish Prison Service fully accepts the responsibility to provide regimes which allow prisoners the opportunity to live as normal lives as possible, and as may be consistent with the requirements of security and order" (SPS 1990a:37). This principle is usually referred to as "normalisation" of the prison.

The document named "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS 1990a) also states that to obtain the aims of increased opportunities in accordance to normalisation aims, its practices should be reviewed in 3 main areas: access to families, quality of life and preparation for release.

Access to families is focused on increasing the opportunity for home leave schemes. According to SPS directors, to provide additional visiting facilities within already cramped prison sites would be difficult and expensive. Moreover it would just "increase the artificiality of the prisoner's access to his family" (SPS 1990a:38).

Quality life requires providing for the physical necessities of the prisoner's daily life and to promote and preserve their self respect. The accommodation in which prisoners are held is considered to be a key element in this aspect. In SPS's programme of building new accommodation and refurbishing the existing ones, two key objectives were set:

- every prisoner who wishes should have the opportunity of a room of his own; and
- every prisoner should have access to night sanitation, or have integral sanitation (SPS 1990a:39).

Until 1990 only 40% of the prisoners had integral or night sanitation due to overcrowding problems as a result of a mismatch between types of prisoners and available places.

Other improvements to achieve the quality of life target were concerned with the introduction of electrical power into cells, phone card schemes, introduction of automatic washing machines in halls etc. All these improvements were dependent on the resources available and the other priorities which emerge from the State strategy.

Preparation for release includes the provision of a range of activities, including manufacturing activities, general education, physical education, vocational training and recreation. Pre-release training and training for freedom were also objectives of the general programme of change.

According to the interviews which took place in the Headquarters and secondary data which was collected, it was realised that the new proposals for the management of the SPS were related to quality management principles and that these principles could be applied within the Service. The statement given by one of the Service directors says specifically that

"...in the Scottish Prison Service for a number of reasons we started on a change programme round about 1987-88. Now, it was not quality-driven. It was not actually anything to do with quality management, it was really when we were well into it that we recognised that a lot of things that we were doing were those that could be included in any TQM programme."

As stated before in this chapter, the initial changes represented basically a change in the perception of the prisoner from a delinquent person to someone who can act responsibly and re-establish an acceptable relationship with society. This required some changes in the physical structure of the prisons and its activities. Prison officers would have a new role as facilitators of inmates' re-habilitation. These initial changes represented a shift in the emphasis in the objectives of the Service in order to achieve a better balance between custody and rehabilitation. However, to the shift in emphasis in the objectives of the Service was added a set of managerial

principles regarded as quality principles. This occurred due to a momentum of greater change in the British public sector, as part of governmental policy. The new approach emerged then within an environmental framework of neo-liberal ideas in the political and managerial arenas, particularly in the public sector where pressures for cost-cutting, efficiency and separation of politics and management of operations started to occur.

In order to establish a further consciously quality-driven approach to change the SPS had to deal with some key issues, like the definition of quality and the adaptation of the concept and techniques from manufacturing/private sector to a service/public sector organisation. The SPS (1993d) has then formally defined quality in the Service in terms of seven basic characteristics as follow:

- top management commitment to quality and visible leadership;
- they know their business and who their customers are;
- knowing and meeting customer needs is a priority;
- employees are empowered and encouraged to take ownership of services to be provided;
- clear and effective communications;
- high priority to training; and
- set clear targets, seek continuous improvement.

5.2.1. Management Commitment to Quality and Visible Leadership

In the formal discourse of the SPS directors management commitment to quality and visible leadership is achieved through four strategies: 1) regular visits of the Chief Executive and the Board to each establishment (prison); 2) participation in the Board of Quality Scotland Foundation; 3) development of an open management style; and 4) commitment to the charter initiative.

Within a prison itself the governor is a visible figure and he is often present. According to information gathered in the Headquarters this situation was different some time ago; The governors used to distance themselves from the uniformed staff (prison officers). Now the Board and even those who are governors who are seconded to the departments are supposed to get out and about as much as possible so that everybody is seen. This could be observed during the several visits made by myself to the establishments studied. It was possible to see and talk to governors even in the galleries (residential inmates' areas) on almost a daily basis. Commitment to quality is also emphasised in regular newsletters and talks spread throughout the whole organisation.

The Chief Executive of the Service sits on the Board of the Quality Scotland Foundation. Quality Scotland Foundation started its activities in 1992 and basically consisted of a group of people who wanted to develop quality consciousness in Scotland. This group had the idea of founding an organisation which would have as its mission the aim to bring about a quality culture in Scotland. They decided to get major Scottish organisations in both the private and public sectors to become founder members of the Foundation. Thirteen organisations were approached: Baxters of Speyside Ltd., Clydesdale Bank plc, Scottish Prison Service, United Distillers plc, Strathclyde Regional Council, Alloa Brewery Company Limited, Dawson International plc, Ryder Airline Service Caledonian, British Gas plc (Scotland), Scottish Power plc, IBM United Kingdom Ltd., GEC Scotland Ltd., and The Royal Bank of Scotland plc. These organisations contribute with financial and human resources to try and get the Foundation operational.

The Scottish Prison Service is one of the founder members of Quality Scotland Foundation because it was considered a major public sector organisation in Scotland and the Chief Executive sits on the Board of it. The Board of the Foundation is based on the principle that quality will only be attained in an

organisation if there is commitment from the top. According to the interview with one director of the SPS

"the Foundation do not want anybody below the Chief Executive on the Board because they want a high degree of commitment to quality and they feel that is the way organisation would gain it."

Quality Scotland Foundation has no direct influence in the management of each organisation. They represent a kind of consultant *ad hoc* body for subjects related to quality, and exchange experiences and give advice to each other.

Quality Conferences for senior staff are considered another way to get commitment from the top. Quality Scotland Foundation organises seminars and a number of training courses on quality and people from the Scottish Prison Service and other organisations attend them. It again indicates that the formal quality approach in the SPS is top-driven. According to all interviews conducted in the prisons on different organisational levels all initiatives towards quality management in the SPS start at the highest managerial levels in the Headquarters. Managers confirm that it has to be this way because they are the ones responsible for strategic issues and quality is to be regarded as an issue of strategic importance. Employees on the lower levels seem to be limited in solving operational problems of daily activities.

The commitment to quality and visible leadership is expected to lead the Service to a more open managerial style, in which both the officers and the prisoners could have more access to the governors. The directorate is expected to accept critiques more openly as well as new ideas to improve the service.

The last strategy adopted by the SPS to achieve commitment to quality and visible leadership is a commitment to the Charter initiative. The Citizens' Charter is one of the ways established by the British Government in order to get more quality in

the public sector. The statement given by one of the SPS directors illustrates their position about the Charter initiative:

"it (the Charter Mark) is really a guarantee to citizens, the people out there, that if you use a public sector service you will be using a quality service. Most large public sector organisations have had to produce a Charter whereby they are guaranteeing to people this is the level of service you will get".

The Charter was an initiative of John Major's government - following others started in Margaret Thatcher's government - to improve efficiency in the public sector using managerialist principles of a service-oriented culture. The Charter is considered part of the "managerialist package" being applied to the public sector (Farnham and Horton 1993b; Pollitt 1993).

Dungavel Prison won the Charter Mark in 1992 which is a national award for its contribution to quality. One of the directors of the SPS gave the following statement on Dungavel's top management commitment to quality and open management style:

"governors in Dungavel Prison found out that once you have driven the initiative downwards and the staff has got over the culture and the staff begin to accept it and see the benefits it can offer, they actually will tend to drive it back up the way".

One of the examples of Dungavel's practice in open management style and commitment to quality culture is that in 1992 the staff came to the Governor of the prison to say that they would like to open the prison on Christmas Day. The number of staff that they offered to the Governor to open on Christmas Day was about 35% less than the number of staff they had used in the previous year to keep the prisoners locked up with no visitors coming. This is also an example of the alleged participative environment at Dungavel, where staff are expected to take the initiative and management is expected to accept, listen and help to implement changes.

5.2.2. They Know Their Business and Who Their Customers Are

In the SPS this quality characteristic is defined in terms of a mission statement, business definition and strategic plan. In this respect, one of the directors of the SPS stated that

"a mission statement and a business definition, we all produce those. We do a strategic plan for Scottish Prison Service establishments and for Headquarters Directorate. We identify our main customers and that is the prisoners and the staff. So that is knowing our business and who our customers are."

The document called "Agency Framework Document" (SPS 1993a) published by the Service contain all these three issues. According to this document, in April 1993 the former Secretary of State for Scotland Ian Lang established the Scottish Prison Service as an Executive Agency and delegates to the Chief Executive of the Service the authority and flexibility to manage the SPS.

In the foreword of the Agency Framework Document (SPS 1993a:3-4) the former Secretary states that the publication of the documents mentioned above to establish the Service as an Executive Agency was "the logical step in the process of change towards an ever higher quality of service on which the Service has embarked". Mentioning that one prison had already been awarded a Charter Mark (Dungavel Prison), the former Secretary stressed that the Agency Status "will assist the Service in fulfilling the principles of the Citizen's Charter in all aspects of its operations, and in meeting the commitments set out in Justice Charter for Scotland" (SPS 1993a:4).

The main aim of the transformation of the Service into an Executive Agency is to separate political from managerial/operational issues, decentralising responsibility for running the Service as well as providing the necessary financial resources for doing so. The following statement given by the former Secretary of State for Scotland illustrates the above point:

I remain accountable to Parliament for the activities of the Scottish Prison Service. In turn, the Chief Executive is answerable to me for the Agency's operation and performance. He will operate under this Framework Document and on the basis of a Corporate Plan approved by me and updated annually. Each year I will set challenging performance targets for the Agency. I am delegating to the Chief Executive full managerial authority for the Agency and its day to day operations. I am ensuring that he has from the start the necessary financial and managerial freedoms. For the future I envisage growing flexibilities to help the Scottish Prison Service meet increasingly targets and deliver a high standard of service (SPS 1993a:4)⁽⁷⁾.

It can be noted in this statement the commitment to a quality discourse which is, as stressed by Pollitt (1993:180), a characteristic of managerialism applied to public services. It also stresses the separation of politics and management, with the establishment of a Chief Executive who is responsible for all operational functions while the Secretary of State remains responsible for establishing the policy of the Service. Emphasis on effectiveness and efficiency is also a constant in the discourse of any change being implemented in the Service. The "agency" status then is about specifying clearly and publicly the tasks and responsibilities of the SPS and the level of service which must be delivered.

The Scottish Prison Service mission statement established is:

- to keep in custody those committed by the courts;
- to maintain good order in each prison;
- to care for prisoners with humanity; and
- to provide prisoners with a range of opportunities to exercise personal responsibility and to prepare for release (SPS 1993a:7).

The Framework Document also points out that the management task of the Service is to use as effectively and efficiently as possible the resources available to fulfil its aims. Therefore, the specific objectives of the SPS were set out as follows:

⁽⁷⁾ The establishment of Executive Agencies seems to be a tendency in the British public sector as a whole, aiming at separating politics from management. This would give more autonomy to the agencies to decide based on managerial expertise. However, that kind of attempt is not always successful. An example of that is the conflict between Michael Howard (the then Home Secretary in England) and Derek Lewis (the then Chief Executive of the Prisons' Agency in England) over responsibility and accountability for the effectiveness of the prison system. This conflict indicated the artificiality of the separation of political power from managerial action in the British public service, since that disagreement led to the dismissal of Derek Lewis.

- to operate a safe and secure service;
- to be responsive to the needs of those it serves;
- to deliver quality of service and value for money within available resources;
- to present prisoners with a range of opportunities to allow them to use their time in prison responsibly; and
- to strive to fulfil the Citizen's Charter principles in all aspects of its operations (SPS 1993a:7).

The Corporate Plan (SPS 1993c) sets performance measures for the Service and for each establishment, which will be presented and discussed in the topic related to the targets (subsection 5.2.7 - Set Clear Targets and Seeking Continuous Improvement) and in the specific case studies. But a strategic overview presented in the plan contains the reassurance of the ideas expressed in the document called "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS 1990a) and in the "Agency Framework Document" (SPS 1993a).

It also proposes improvements in the organisational structure, in terms of the reorganisation of Headquarters to produce a more streamlined structure under a Chief Executive and a Prison Board. Moreover, it proposes the transfer, over time, of decision-making away from Headquarters to Governors in Charge, together with the increase of delegation of financial responsibilities to establishments and down the hierarchy within prisons. It is important to note that delegation here refers to power for decision making over managerial issues, not political ones, that is, political strategies are defined by the Secretary of State and the Headquarters. The amount of financial resources to be allocated to the Service is also decided upon, by these bodies. For the establishments, the decisions on how to spend the amount of resources allocated, still remains.

The first set of changes took place in 1990 under the title "Organising for Excellence" (SPS 1990b). In 1994 a new organisational structure was proposed, now

under the title "Shaping the Future of the Scottish Prison Service" (SPS 1994a), but with the same objectives of flexibility and cost-cutting.

The Prison Surveys (SPS 1994b and 1992) is to be part of the strategic planning for the Headquarters and all the prisons. The next subsection (5.2.3 - Knowing and Meeting Customer Needs is a Priority) presents and discusses this issue.

Market testing is also in the organisational strategy for change. For the Service, market testing is an important way of controlling the quality of the service and improve value for money. The Corporate Plan contains a clear statement on this subject as follow:

"market testing has a contribution to make to maximising efficiency in the Scottish Prison Service, as in other Government services. Market Testing means specifying the level of the service required and then comparing the costs of carrying out the work by Government employees against bids from the private sector. If the private sector offers more competitive terms for the right quality of service the work is contracted out" (SPS 1992:18).

Market-testing is not a characteristic specific to the SPS. It has been used by the British Government as a way of measuring the competitiveness of public services in relation to the private sector. It is part of a wider strategy based on neo-liberal ideas of politics seeking to decrease the role of the State in economic issues, particularly reducing the number of services provided by the government through their privatisation and improving the efficiency of the ones remaining under public administration.

In terms of definition of customers in a prison service the issue is not simple. There are many theoretical and ethical issues regarding the subject. First of all the SPS is a public organisation and it brings in its nature all the difficulties of dealing with customers definition, expressed in the literature that analyses quality in the public sector (see, for example, Kerfoot and Knights 1993; and Rees 1992). The SPS has defined as its customers the prisoners, the staff and the public.

The construct "prisoners as customers" is not a straightforward one. The definition of customer implies choice and this dimension of the concept is lost when we talk about prisoners. Some of the governors have argued that prisoners do have choice, in some sense. They can, for example, choose to which prison they would like to go, according to their classification. Others argue that in some prisons in Scotland the prisoners can have the choice of a lunch and a dinner menu.

It seems clear that these choices are very limited to their condition of being prisoners and it appears at least naive to believe that it will make them customers. The primary choice must be the one of using or not the services of the organisation and this is not the case in the context of the SPS. Even having the sort of choice that prisoners are said to have, it can be argued that it makes them merely passive recipients of the services that the organisation provides.

The fact that prisoners are not exactly customers does not mean that it is impossible to talk about quality in a prison. It only needs a better definition of organisational members and networks, and avoiding simply transposing concepts from one area of activity to another, but trying to find their own path.

This is one of the problems that specialised literature on quality management shows about trying to adopt concepts from manufacturing/private to service/public organisations. Moreover it is questionable that the use of concepts of one area can be applied in others. Thompson (1993:201), for example, says "I have long believed that the further a body of knowledge travels from its origins, the worse and more vulnerable it gets". Ramos (1983a) also criticises the inappropriate use of concepts arguing that it can lead us down wrong paths and to misinterpretation of social reality.

The idea of the "customer" has become almost an epidemic one. Webb (1995:1) says that

"regardless of our political sympathies, most of us have learned to use 'customer-speak'. In higher education we are 'service providers' or 'deliverers' to our

'customers' - students. In our everyday exchanges we are 'empowered' to reject bad services as beneficiaries of the Citizens' charter, and the newest honour for public servants is to be in receipt of the Charter Mark, complete with lapel badge, for living up to customer expectations".

The "customer-speak" is a reflex of the diffusion of managerialist ideas in the society. It increased its influence after Oakland's (1989) idea of "quality chains" where everyone in the organisation is part of a chain, being a customer for the next person in the chain and a supplier for the person before, in the intra and inter-related organisational activities. This idea was adopted by other managerialist writers on quality (see, for example, Munro-Faure and Munro-Faure 1992). Webb (1995:105) also points out the importance of the political environment in the process of diffusion of these ideas when she affirms that "for more than a decade in Britain we have had a government which has sought to replace the ideology and structures of bureaucracy and regulations with those of enterprise and deregulation". That means to say that Britain has been subjected to a process of institutionalisation of new ideas on managing enterprises in general and the public sector in particular. The institutionalisation of managerialism in the British public sector originated in what became known as "the New Public Services". The SPS is then being affected by this process.

Regarding the idea of customer for the public sector Rees (1992) argues that the term is difficult to define. In the case of the prison service, Rees (1992:71) argues that "a wider group is involved in determining an acceptable penal system, partly by comparison with other developed countries and partly by comparison with generally prevailing standards in, for example, sanitation or access to education and recreation". She affirms that in the public sector people are defined by their interaction with a particular service, rather than as an interest group with common expectations across a range of services (e.g. hospitals/patients; library/borrowers etc.).

5.2.3. Knowing and Meeting Customer Needs is a Priority

Having identified the three major groups that interact with the organisation, that is, the staff, prisoners and general public, the SPS established the aim of knowing and meeting their needs. The Service did it through a prison survey of staff and prisoners and the results were taken into consideration in the strategic planning. The first survey was done in 1990-1991 and published in 1992 (SPS 1992) and the second was done in 1993 and published in 1994 (SPS 1994b).

From the first prison survey the SPS identified that most of prisoners' concerns with the service had to do with visits and improving food and prisoners' wages. These results have been a priority in the whole service. According to the interviews both in the Headquarters and in the prisons studied, every Scottish prison had to look to visiting structures and try to improve them. The Service has also allocated more money for food and for prisoners' wages, although the last one is a more difficult issue for the Service.

The prison survey also comes out at a local level, so that each prison will know what its particular group of "customers" are looking for and each prison is supposed to incorporate it in strategic planning. According to the statement given by one of the Service directors

"it is a requirement for each prison to feed into its planning, those particular customer needs. So our planning is being directed by our customer survey and that way we are being customer-oriented."

The survey is not oriented by the third group identified by the service as its customers: the public. Some of the governors argued that it was very difficult to deal with this aspect and that they face the problem of defining customers in a public sector organisation again. Nevertheless, they have some feed-back from the society through the prisoners' families that came to visit them or in their interaction with the social work department in the prison. The other way it was said to be done is through

the Citizens' Charter. These approaches are obviously very limited because they are restricted to two very specific groups within the wider society.

5.2.4. Employees are Empowered

The most evident characteristic of the empowerment approach in the SPS is decentralisation from the Headquarters to the field, that is, to each prison. The first action implemented towards the decentralisation was to give governors their own budgets. Until a few years ago a governor could not spend any money at all in his establishment without asking the Headquarters. The argument for the decentralisation of the budget is that each governor is more prepared to know where the money needs to be spent as well as the real need for a certain amount of money. The idea is that the governors should also decentralise the budgets through the establishment as well, so the employee in charge of the hall will have a budget. If it happens, it will represent a real empowerment of some of the officers on the lower levels of the hierarchy, as he or she could distribute the resources through the activities developed in the hall and have responsibility for it. For the time being, SPS is, in fact, undergoing a decentralisation process of financial resources, but it is in terms of one organisation to another, or from the directorate of the Headquarters to the governor of each prison. Within the prisons, it is still centralised.

The other aspect of empowerment is not so direct and represents a more complex issue. It refers to a change in the work arrangements and in the definition of each task. In the case of the prisons the normal procedure was to take all problems and requests from the prisoners straight to the governor. It made the governor overloaded with work and decreased the quality of the decision making process. According to one of the directors in the Headquarters,

"sometimes hours and even the whole morning was spent by the governor with a prisoner to deal just with a request for one more letter or an extra visit. Now, the

prisoner will ask the guy in the gallery for an extra letter. The guy in the gallery will say 'there is your extra letter'. He will ask, maybe, if the prisoner wants something more, like an extra visit. The guy in the gallery in most places has got the power to say 'yes, you can have an extra visit', or if the request is something major he will probably say 'I cannot give you that but the senior officer in charge of the shift, he can give it to you'."

In fact, it represents an empowerment of the individual responsible for the task and a degree of job enrichment. But, as pointed out by Dawson and Webb (1989) it is important to pay attention to the nature of this kind of job enrichment. The authors argue that whilst some quality management techniques give greater autonomy to the staff over the pace of their work, they remain without any influence in the corporate strategy and are subjected to environmental pressures. This point could be observed in this study and data with regard to this will be presented and discussed later in this chapter (subsections 5.4.1 and 5.4.2). There were explicit statements that quality commitment has to be top-driven and that changes in the SPS policy represent the need to survive in a new competitive environment.

Another aspect of the SPS empowerment strategy is that each prison prepares its own strategic plan, according to their budget and to the results of the prison surveys. At the moment there are parts of the budgets controlled by each establishment and parts controlled by the Headquarters. The SPS affirms that a management information system is the necessary tool for the decentralisation process and budget system to work well, and consequently a great investment is being done in this area. The eventual aim is to have all the Service controlled by computers.

5.2.5. Clear and Effective Communication

According to the SPS directors and SPS documents, clear and effective communication is part of the quality set up. In the beginning of 1993 the Service contracted a group of consultants to do an internal communication audit. Based on the results of the audit a communication strategy document was prepared. Most of the

difficulties related to communications were attributed to the organisational structure, which was considered very hierarchical and centralised.

Each establishment was asked to create a communication manager position and to produce its own communication plan. Other communication improvements were the production of a quarterly newsletter organised by the Headquarters, and team briefing activities. The team briefing starts off at Headquarters with the Chief Executive and it is done on a monthly basis. The objective is to feed down a few selected issues that the Chief Executive wants to get right down the organisation. He transmits it to the governors who transmit the message to the management teams in each prison. Then, the management team will feed it to the next layer, and the next layer will do the same with the layer below. It cascades right down the service. The statement given by one of the SPS directors illustrates this point:

"every month the same information is going to everybody in the Scottish Prison Service at the same time and so if the Chief Executive wants a message to go right down that is the way he gets it down. It happens at the same time throughout the Service."

In each level of the hierarchy a person can add new information regarding the general topic or to a specific matter of the prison.

Briefings can also be of question and answer type, if the topic in discussion is new or complex. A question or an issue will come down in the organisation and it will be worked out by those to whom it concerns. The results of these briefings are sometimes published in the SPS newsletters. Perth Prison uses this kind of briefing, according to its Governor in Charge, as can be seen in the following statement:

"we use those to get clear communications and it does have the advantage that what I am telling people at Perth Prison does not conflict with what my colleague in Edinburgh prison is telling his staff and so on and so forth. And it also means that I get the argument that otherwise I might not know".

5.2.6. A High Priority to Training

There is a specific organisation within the SPS responsible for training activities; the Training and Organisational Development Service (TODS), which has established the following key initiatives to be pursued:

- clarify TODS way of doing things;
- marketing TODS way of doing things;
- enabling line managers to play a fuller role in training and development;
- introducing information and finance systems to support the changes;
- to provide reliable supply of people with the necessary competence to deliver TODS business;
- introduce a library and resource service into TODS;
- negotiate an agreed Buildings and Facilities Development Plan; and
- project manage the Change Programme (SPS n/d:5).

TODS focus is on supporting line managers in the SPS. The document developed by TODS called "Facing the Future" expresses that "the budgetary authority and responsibility for training and development of the prison staff will lie with line managers in the Service. Line managers will have the ability to purchase training services to meet the needs of staff which they themselves will have to identify with support and advice from TODS" (SPS n/d:15).

TODS offers a range of training programmes which includes parole and criminal procedures acts, prisoner grievance procedures, industrial relations, quality initiative and managerial skills, among others. They are currently examining the training needs related to market testing.

The importance given to training programmes in the SPS is reflected in the budget. It is a large training budget according to one director of the SPS:

"there has been a four-fold increase in our training budget over the last three-year period. We spend just under 4 million pounds a year on training in the Scottish Prison Service."

The service also owns a college for training and unlike a lot of organisations through the recession where training has been the first thing to be cut, the size of the college has grown.

The training budget has been decentralised to establishments whereas previously it was centrally held. To have the control of a training budget for each establishment's staff means that each prison can do the training that is suitable for its needs rather than to have any kind of uniform national training.

The training is mostly directed to work groups. It means to identify a group of people who work together and take them away and train them as a group. The result is that they will be all using the new language and discussing and using the new ideas. It is supposed to solve problems of a lack of confidence amongst peers when they return to the work place. According to one of the SPS directors

"it is a way of cultural change".

The training "road show" is another aspect to the SPS training approach. During 1992 there was a concern that throughout the Scottish Prison Service the directorate wanted the staff to do new things but they did not always understand what. So the training college set up a training session that moved around the country. They chose central location hotels to perform it. Staff from different prisons in the area were brought in on a regular basis and they took part in a training programme which let them learn new developments.

5.2.7. Set Clear Targets and Seeking Continuous Improvement

The Scottish Prison Service has been setting performance measures and targets that are reviewed annually. These performances measures are the base for the evaluation of the organisational performance and for the overall quality of the service offered. The performance measures used and the key targets for 1993-94 are as follows:

Table 1: Key Targets and Related Performance Measures for the SPS 1993-94

Performance Measures	Key Targets for 1993-94
The number of prisoners unlawfully at large	No A category prisoners should escape. The number of escapes by B category prisoners should be no bigger than 2.5 per 1000 prisoners.
The number of significant incidents	A database will be developed and a target set for 1994-95.
The number of serious assaults on staff and prisoners	The number of serious assaults on staff should be no higher than 6 per 1000 staff. The number of serious assaults on other prisoners should be no higher than 11 per 1000.
Basic quality of life for prisoners	By April 1994 52% of prisoners will have access to forms of night sanitation.
The amount of available opportunities for prisoners' self development	That 80% of convicted prisoners should have the opportunity of at least 6.5 hours per working day of programmed activities.
Time out of the cell for unconvicted prisoners	On average 25% of unconvicted prisoners hours should be available for out of cell activities.
Average annual cost per prisoner place	To keep costs within 26,170 pounds per place available for use.
The level of absence through staff sickness	To reduce the average number of days lost per person per year through staff sickness to 16.

Source: SPS (1993a:45)

Part of the planning strategy for 1993-94 is that each prison has to set its own target. Each establishment is being asked to agree with the area director their set of targets. The intention is to spread the concept of "target" within establishments' functions, halls and so on. According to one of the directors of the SPS

"it is something that we will be throwing down... It is a long-winded definition of quality".

The model of strategic planning used by the SPS is the following:

- Review the present position.
- Feed in the stakeholders mandate, that comes down from the Board.
- Feed in customers' needs, that comes from the prison survey.
- Environmental analysis: external opportunities and threats and internal strengths and weaknesses.
- Identify key strategic issues.
- Set strategic priorities, review mission statement and business definition.
- List key initiatives to include targets and performance measures.
- Resource shift and communication strategy (SPS 1993b).

Each establishment is asked to prepare a strategic plan within the guidelines established by the Headquarters. The guidelines are supposed to fulfil the expectations of the performance measures and targets set in the Corporate Plan. To assure this the SPS established in the "Guidance for the 1994 Strategic Planning Round" (SPS 1993b) document examples of performance measures and targets for key areas of work, like custody, good order, care opportunities, value for money etc. It was also suggested that the 1994 plan of each establishment should have sections on:

- business definition;
- progress report from 1993-94;

- customer analysis;
- environmental analysis;
- strategic issues;
- on-going work;
- key initiatives 1994-95 to 1997-98;
- bids and savings for 1994-95: on-going work; and
- bids and savings for key initiatives 1994-95 to 1997-98 (SPS 1993b).

Given the formal definition of quality in the SPS through the seven elements described above, it can be argued that:

a) the SPS has embarked on a formal type of quality management programme; and

b) this programme has a managerialist rationale, since formal quality programmes in general are managerial in nature.

The characteristics of the SPS formal quality management programme basically involve the definition of quality and customers in the Service, changes in job design performance and attitude, and control mechanisms, once the establishment of targets seeking continuous improvement towards efficiency and customer-satisfaction circumscribes action in organisation. The next sections explore the implementation of the SPS' quality initiatives in two prisons within the Service. Data is presented and discussed on how peoples' perceptions of quality and customers match the proposed programme, and what the effects are of the formal programme in aspects of job design and control in the organisations.

5.3. Case Studies: Perth Prison and Dungavel Prison

5.3.1. General Characteristics

Perth Prison is an establishment located near the city centre of Perth. It holds mainly short-sentence local prisoners, including fine defaulters and those on remand, from Tayside Region and North Fife, in appropriate conditions of security. It was built between 1811 and 1812 as a military prison. Later in 1836 the Inspector of Prisons recommended it to be converted into a prison for criminals. This suggestion was accepted by the government in 1839.

The prison accommodates male prisoners, including category A ones from all over Scotland who are serving over 2 years and up to life imprisonment. A small unit within the prison provides secure accommodation and intensive staff/prisoner interaction for those who have been disruptive and have been kept out of association for extended periods of time. The prison has also a "training for freedom" hostel which houses a small number of prisoners who are approaching the end of their sentences. They work on various community projects or with selected local businesses to give them practical work experience for release. Perth Prison holds 350 prisoners and its staff includes 13 governors from grades 5 to 2, 6 technicians (social workers and psychologists), and 375 prison officers, distributed among 3 grades: 27 principal officers (PO), 47 senior officers (SO) and 301 officers. Given the fact that the prison held at the time of the field-work 350 inmates, a nominal officer/inmate ratio is 0.93 inmates per officer. However, the officers work in shifts, which would increase the ratio mentioned above. Information regarding the officer/inmate ratio taking into consideration the shifts as well as information about turnover among prisoners and staff were not provided by the organisation.

In terms of gender profile of the staff population, no information is available about prison officers. Technicians were all female and governors were all but one

male. Other demographic characteristics of the staff, such as age and length of service, were asked but not provided by the organisation.

As far as the sample interviewed is concerned, the gender profile is as follows: all 39 prison officers interviewed were male, 3 technicians were female, and one out of seven governors was female.

Dungavel is a semi-open establishment located in the countryside area near Stratheaven, Southwest of Glasgow. It houses long term prisoners of category C and D who are suitable for regimes that intend to facilitate prisoners' reintegration into society through community involvement and the fostering of family contact. Dungavel also develops a wide range of community projects. From April 1994 the establishment received the status of an open prison and now holds only category D prisoners. It has already won a Charter Mark Prize in 1992 for the quality of service it provides. Dungavel is considered a small establishment and holds about 150 prisoners. Its staff comprises 3 governors (2 grade 5 and 1 grade 4), 2 technicians, and 70 prison officers (7 principal officers, 9 senior officers and 54 officers).

The prison held at the time of the field-work 150 inmates. Therefore, a nominal officer/inmate ratio is 2.14 inmates per officer. Like in Perth, the officers work in shifts, which would increase the ratio mentioned above. Information regarding the officer/inmate ratio taking into consideration the shifts as well as information about turnover among prisoners and staff were not provided by the organisation.

In terms of gender profile of the staff population, no information is available about prison officers. The only technician was female and two out of three governors were male. Other demographic characteristics of the staff, such as age and length of service, were asked but not provided by the organisation.

The gender profile of the sample is as follows: all 12 prison officers interviewed were male, the technician was female, and both governors interviewed were male.

5.3.2. Quality Definition, Rationale and Customers Identification

Both prisons are subjected to the same approach to quality which originated in the SPS Headquarters but quality definition varies in each case due to the objectives and structural characteristics (particularly size and objectives) of the prisons, as well as the background and interests of its governors and other internal groups. Table 2 shows the opinion of the different organisational groups regarding quality definition. The answers to the interviews on quality definition for each organisational group were subjected to a clustering process in order to define the significant elements for the groups.

In Dungavel Prison quality is seen as related to providing good services and it is less related to quality management techniques than in Perth Prison. Expressions such as "quality management" and "TQM" are avoided in order to escape from the difficulties they cause, like the use of the term "customer" or the vision of new techniques as something separated from the reality that will soon be forgotten.

Although Dungavel's governors do not deny that quality is an essential managerial strategy, the way they implement it in Dungavel is different from Perth. Quality is defined by the prison staff in general as strongly related to its one-to-one relationship and its family-based approach. Due to the nature of this prison, which was a semi-open one by the time of the field-work and later, by the end of 1994, became an open prison, the establishment emphasises rehabilitation objectives. It is important to note that the degree of security, necessary to hold prisoners category C and D is much less than that necessary to hold category A and B ones in Perth Prison, which allows Dungavel to have its own particular characteristics in terms of rehabilitation procedures. In justifying why Dungavel is a quality organisation, one of its governors stated that Dungavel is a quality prison,

"because of our approach in relation to the prisoners and because of the nature of this institution, I mean, this is not a closed prison and the issues here are different. We work more closely to the community, we allow much more family visits in a much better environment than in the other prisons, and the relationship between staff and prisoners is better. We deal with the prisoners with respect in order to change their behaviour and to prepare them to live in the community again. Quality is all these things. Of course, the way people perform their jobs is very important."

The general environment in the prison is, then, more friendly when compared to other prisons in Scotland. Governors focus their efforts and resources more on making links with the community to provide a training for freedom which makes prisoners aware of their future conditions as workers, as well as the community more prepared to accept them back.

Table 2: Significant Components of Quality Definition at Dungavel and Perth Prisons

Groups	Components of Quality Definition	
	Dungavel Prison	Perth Prison
governors	one-to-one relationship treat people well work close to the community	top management commitment customer-driven approach empowerment clear and effective communication training clear targets (strategic planning) competitiveness (cost-effectiveness) quality circles and group activities do things right first time responsibility for action provide good services human relation exercise good custody
technicians	good standard of life for prisoners treat people well	provide opportunities for rehabilitation
new officers	one-to-one relationship family life focused approach	guidance and professionalism do things right first time delegation good custody provide good service
old officers	good custody	good custody

The size of the prison appears to be a strong factor in enabling Dungavel's whole approach to its activities. The number of prisoners and staff is smaller than in Perth which makes the so called "one-to-one relationship" easier, as everybody knows each other. As stated by one of Dungavel's governors,

"in order to improve our quality service even more we need to decrease a bit the number of inmates. We have 150 today and we think that the ideal would be something about 135".

To treat people well was one main element of quality definition shown in the statements given by all members of governors and technicians interviewed at Dungavel. It makes their approach to quality dependent on the personal ability of the ones who are "delivering the service". It demonstrates the aspect stressed by Carmen and Langeard (1980) regarding the inseparability of production and consumption in the service sector. Therefore quality is defined to a larger degree by the personal contact between consumer and producer.

Perth Prison's approach to quality follows closely the SPS general guidelines. It is related to managerial efficiency, professionalism and value for money, terms that are common in managerial literature. Expressions like "do things right first time" are common among organisational members and all the seven elements of the formal quality definition given by the SPS were quoted at least once in the interviews among the governors in Perth Prison, as can be observed in Table 2. The following statement given by one of the governors identifies the general quality approach in Perth Prison:

"quality is getting the product right first time, every time. For whatever the defined customer group is that we are delivering the service to, whether it be the prisoners, the staff, the courts, or any of our identified customer groups. That's what quality is."

It represents a transposition of the concept idealised for manufacturing firms. It can be noted that the discourse used, refers to "product" and "customers" meaning "service" and "prisoners".

Perth quality practices seem to be mainly the result of the efforts and commitment of the governor in charge. He was working in the SPS before going to Perth and he had an important role in the development of some of the ideas in the SPS change process, especially in the formulation of the strategic plan. He has also been delivering talks and speeches throughout Scotland on quality management in the Prison Service and on how Perth Prison is implementing it. This fact seems to have had a strong influence in the implementation of quality management practices in Perth in accordance to the general approach of the SPS. He can be considered to have a managerialist background, he holds, for example, an MBA degree and is committed to organisational success through the implementation of specific administrative practices.

Training is a relevant factor in the establishment of the managerialist quality approach in Perth. All governors stressed the importance of training in order to change the culture of the Prison, and the Service in general, from a traditional one to a more quality-driven one, as illustrated by the following statement:

"in the Prison Service there is a long traditional working practice, traditional ideas... you can note just by talking to people here. I designed a quality awareness package which the staff can also now deliver, and that involves how other organisations worked to improve their service to the customers. Cutting out certain levels of management, allowing people to make decisions at the shopfloor rather than wasting time going up. Lets think along the lines of quality. I get people from other quality organisations who go along the same road to come in and give talks to us.

The effects of training procedures were noted particularly among governors in Perth Prison and among new officers in general. In their statements they seemed to have internalised some concepts and important aspects of the SPS guidelines to

quality management and it has been a crucial element in the acceptance of the programme without major resistance.

Quality definition among the group of technicians in both prisons seem not to be very different and it is strongly related to rehabilitation objectives. This seems to be explained by the high degree of professionalisation and specialisation of this category. In the prisons, technicians are normally involved in treatment and rehabilitation purposes without having any power position in terms of running the organisation in a strategic sense. Their activities are normally limited to technical tasks with the inmates circumscribed by organisational rules determined by other more powerful organisational groups. The following statements given by one technician in Dungavel and one in Perth prison respectively, illustrates this point:

"Dungavel is a quality prison because we try to give to prisoners a good and decent standard of life. We try to treat them not as prisoners but as persons".

"Quality in a prison is to provide the opportunities for the prisoner's personal development and rehabilitation. Then he can go back to life outside, get a job, live a normal life and maintain good relationships with the community as a whole".

The idea of quality among technicians is clearly related to the objectives of their profession within the prisons, linked to rehabilitation purposes, and the quality management approach established by the SPS seems to have had no major effect on their vision of quality for the organisation.

Among the officers there are different positions in both prisons in relation to quality definition. New officers, that is, those who joined the Service since 1988, accept and share the same vision of the governors. The old ones see quality as something related to the achievement of the objectives of the organisation. The objectives referred to here are mainly custodial ones due to the link between organisational objectives and the activities that have been historically developed by

prison officers, namely custodial ones. When old officers speak about quality management it is seen as "the flavour of the month".

The idea of quality among new officers is a result of the strategy of selection and training in the SPS. After the first stages of quality management implementation in the SPS, the selection and training process was driven towards people whose background seemed to be more professional, including formal training and formal degrees. In the initial training programmes within the SPS they are exposed to the main ideas of the new management style of the Service. The following statement given by a new prison officer at Perth Prison shows the general view of this group regarding the subject:

"it is part of the Scottish Prison Service approach to quality (Opportunity and Responsibility). It is a forward document. I mean, I suppose if we are talking about quality it is a way of introducing the best quality into the establishment."

It can be noted from this statement that new officers have knowledge about the formal documentation on organisational strategies and changes which are expected to be the basis for their performance at work.

In general terms officers in Dungavel are, to a certain degree, more keen on the whole quality strategy of the Prison Service than in Perth. The number of old officers is smaller, and for this reason, there is a general agreement that prisoners should be given good opportunities to grow as individuals, as the following statement shows:

"Dungavel is a quality prison because we try to give prisoners some opportunities to grow and recuperate".

Old officers, despite their grades, are resistant to this view even in Dungavel Prison, where the environment is said to be friendly. According to the interviews with the social worker in Dungavel Prison, during the beginning of her work when she needed to talk to some prisoner she used to say:

"I would like to talk to Mr. 'X'".

The reply normally was:

"there is no Mr. 'X' here".

When she insisted, the answer changed to:

"Oh! Convict 'X'" or "prisoner 'X'."

For old officers the maintenance of good custody is the main function of a prison and if it is successful in achieving this aim then it can be considered a quality organisation. Although these officers are now of a smaller number, they tend to use their experience to influence the new ones, but the selecting and training programmes as well as the open managerial style of the prison seems to be working more effectively than the old officers' pressures.

Taking into consideration the results shown in Table 2 regarding the significant elements in quality definition among organisational groups in the Scottish prisons studied, it can be noted three different rationales behind the explicit discourse, as shown in Table 3.

Table 3: Rationale of Quality Definition at Dungavel and Perth Prisons

Groups	Rationale of Quality Definition	
	Dungavel	Perth
governors	humanist professional (rehabilitation)	managerialist professional (custody) humanist
technicians	humanist	humanist professional (rehabilitation)
new officers	humanist	managerialist professional (custody) humanist
old officers	professional (custody)	professional (custody)

The managerialist rationale is present only among members of Perth Prison. As said before, the link between this organisation and the SPS approach to quality management is stronger. It is therefore a view of quality related to efficiency and professionalism in the performance of the organisational activities.

Efficiency is attributed to the achievement of "value for money". It is an important aspect of the managerialist rationale of quality management discourse in general and in the SPS in particular. There is some disagreement in relation to the meaning of value for money as a quality issue within the prisons' groups. Governors in Perth and Dungavel, as well as the group of new officers in both prisons, believe that value for money in the SPS quality approach is related to a balance between the type of service offered and the amount of money allocated to the service. The prisons are believed to spend more resources than necessary to run their services. An example of this general view was given in the following statement of one of the governors in Perth:

"I still do not think we are anywhere near those sort of base levels where you get the balance right between delivering a quality, efficient service, and the cost it

will take to deliver that service, yet still giving value for money. There is always an inherent conflict, no matter when, still a conflict because the needs of the customer are always infinite, specially in a people business. But it is a matter of streamlining and realising that once you have reached your base level, certainly there has to be a certain stage where, if you go any further down, then the quality will suffer and the level of the service will suffer as well... but we are still very much in that process of finding the balance. We are still very wasteful in terms of our services as well. We are not very efficient and we have got to get a lot better that".

This view is not shared completely by Dungavel governors. Although they agree that it is possible to have a balance between value for money and quality they believe that in some cases the SPS is going too far from the acceptable level and they tend to believe that part of the quality discourse within the SPS is about cost-cutting and the political agenda of the Government based on neo-liberal ideology. The example given by one of Dungavel governors illustrates this point:

"we will not have two nurses full-time here anymore. We will have one and the other will be called in on an *ad hoc* basis. Considering our location, I mean, the difficult access to the prison, it is clear that the argument for this is not quality at all. It is cost-cutting."

It can be noted that although the need for "value for money" is a consensus among organisational groups it varies in its interpretation between the two prisons, as well as among groups within the same prison, in terms of the degree in which costs-cutting can jeopardise quality matters.

Professionalism in managerial terms, as it is seen in Perth Prison, is related to "do things right" in the best way possible. A governor in Perth stated that after the implementation of quality management, he started thinking if whether the simple task he had performed could have been done better before finally delivering the service or product of his activity. He also stated that he asks all his subordinates to do the same, and argues that it will ultimately save time and money, and it will contribute to a better performance of the staff.

A humanist rationale is present in both prisons among governors, technicians and new officers, although it received more emphasis among governors in Dungavel

than in Perth. It is related to issues such as treating people well, working closely with the community, and undertaking human relation exercises. The nature of Dungavel Prison explains the emphasis on these aspects of quality. As stated before, Dungavel is a open prison dealing with prisoners who require a lesser degree of security and who perform a series of community jobs. It concentrates mostly on the rehabilitation side of the prison's activities. Perth, on the other hand, holds prisoners who require a higher degree of security. This aspect is also consistent with the nature of the professional rationale that appeared in both prisons among governors and new prison officers. While in Dungavel they demonstrated a professional rationale linked to rehabilitation, in Perth both governors and new officers stressed the custodial role of the prison. Technicians in both prisons have their quality definition linked to a humanist rationale as well as a professional one related to rehabilitation.

The group of old prison officers in both prisons expressed their quality definition as related to custodial activities. For them, issues like value for money is just related to cost-cutting and redundancies. The following statement illustrates their position:

"the message is to cut overheads, to cut wages, to cut down costs. That is what it is all about. Whether they want to tell you it that way is another thing. That's my view, but they might say I am a crabby old, so and so..."

There is no difference among old prison officers between the two prisons studied and it seems that they represent a very consistent group regarding their ideas about the Prison Service as a whole.

In terms of customer definition the results are consistent with the rationale of quality definition among groups in both prisons as demonstrated in Table 4.

Table 4: Customer Identification at Dungavel and Perth Prisons

Customer Definition Among Organisational Groups		
Groups	Dungavel Prison	Perth Prison
governors	general public families	general public prisoners staff
technicians	general public families	general public
new officers	general public families	general public prisoners
old officers	general public	general public

The general public was a consensual category regarding customers definition in the prisons, although members of different groups in Dungavel Prison made a distinction between families and the general public. It can be explained by the importance attributed to the role of families in the activities stressed by this prison, that is, rehabilitation, re-education and preparation for release. As stated before, a family-based approach is an important element of quality definition in Dungavel.

The staff, as a customer group, appeared only in statements given by governors at Perth Prison. It can be explained by the managerialist approach to quality management in this prison and, again, the high investment on training, especially among managers who, even though in different degrees, adhere to the managerial discourse of quality in the SPS. For the same reasons, prisoners were identified as group of customers only by governors and new prison officers in Perth Prison.

One governor in Perth was an exception in defining the customers group. When speaking without referring to formal documents of the organisation, he identified as customers only the public that came into the prison, like lawyers and

prisoners' families. His observations about prisoners as a customer group can be seen in the following statement:

"it is a very strange philosophy to start with. The customer concept clearly means that customers are always right. But how can anyone apply that concept to the Prison Service? It just does not make sense. Customers you regard as being responsible people. How on Earth can you regard a prisoner as a responsible person? If he was responsible he would not be in prison in the first place. I am having difficulties in accepting that concept, and it is not meant to be taken seriously. It is just for people to start seeing prisoners in a different light. I think that it is the main reason for that. It is not that prisoners are to be taken seriously as customers. You know... it changes peoples attitudes in thinking and you are providing a service, and all of us are inside... you know, regardless of whether they are customers or not. Basically it changes the whole footing of how you regard the prisoners and other people. You cannot take it to the extreme, you know, like, 'oh yes, I am very sorry Sir. You were right.', you know?"

Nevertheless, all other governors interviewed have put prisoners and staff among their customer group. One example of how prisoners can be treated as customers was given by one governor in Perth Prison as follows:

"our two main customers are the staff and the prisoners. Right, and I have got to try and give them a quality service, not a service, but a quality service. If I get a paper from an officer, an officer might put something on a paper for me, I will acknowledge it to, to say I have got it. And I might respond to that paper in 2 or 3 days, once I have investigated and things like that. A prisoner comes and requests things everyday. Maybe I cannot give a man a decision that day, because I might have to investigate something. For example, a prisoner comes to me and he complains about his wages. I cannot respond to it that day. I will take a note of his complaint and I will see the officer who makes up his pay, the reason why he paid him that amount of money and was there any reason, or was that drop of wages for a different reason? The next day I will go back to him and tell him the reason. He maybe will not be happy but I have undertaken an investigation. So, it is not a case of me saying to the prisoner 'I will be back to you' and forgetting all about it. It is a case of 'I will be back to him with the information as soon as possible'."

Through this statement and other examples given by governors and new officers, the use of the word customer in practice seems to be related to the observance of prisoners' legal rights, that is, their rights according to the laws of justice and rules of the prison. The term customer can be regarded as being applied in a metaphorical sense, once it can be argued that it does not comprise the whole

dimension of it. Generally speaking, the limits of choice of action for a prisoner is much less than for a person living freely in society.

Among new officers there seems to be a certain degree of acceptance of the prisoner as a customer. Sometimes more than as a customer, these officers see prisoners as people capable to make decisions and to have responsibilities for their internal behaviour and activities, in accordance to the documents that expose the new approach to prisoners in the SPS, especially "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS1990a), as can be noted in the following statement given by one new officer in Perth Prison:

"total quality management does not just relate to manufacturing... everybody becomes a customer at some time. So what we are saying is that you should be trying to give a quality service and get it right first time. This will take a long time because we are trying to change people's attitudes and before it was always a sort of hierarchical system. Orders came from the top and we had to follow the orders but they are relying on people to use their initiative and start working together".

This can be regarded as an effect of the selection and training process at the SPS. In the statement above the managerialist discourse is clear and it could only come from an officer specially trained or from an officer with some managerial background. It is quality management as a strategic issue evolving an human resource policy.

For the old officers in both prisons the vision of the prisoners as customers is a nonsensical one because if they were responsible they would not be in prison. Moreover, they committed an act against the law and they deserve to be punished for this. Punishment is viewed as the main role of the prison, according to the group of old prison officers.

As stated in the beginning of this section, although both Dungavel and Perth prisons are subject to the same approach to quality originated in the Headquarters of the SPS, they differ in their interpretation of the general guidelines and their implementation. The differences seems to be related to structural characteristics of

the organisations, especially objectives and size. It also seems to be related to the degree of commitment to the Headquarters programme by the managerial group, particularly the governor in charge, in each organisation.

The next section presents and discusses data on the effects of the quality approach in each prison in specific aspects of job design, satisfaction and control.

5.3.3. Quality and Job Structure: Design, Satisfaction and Control

Data in this section is presented in two separate subsections because of the degree of accuracy of the data, due to the circumstances in which the interviews were allowed to be conducted.

The first sub-section presents data collected from the group of governors and technicians in each prison. These interviews were performed individually and the duration of each interview was not pre-established by the organisation. The only constraints regarding time were those imposed by the researcher aiming to get the best results possible, avoiding fatigue and other aspects that could jeopardise the results (e.g. governors and technicians time schedules). Moreover, the number of governors and technicians interviewed are representative of the total number of members in each of these groups, which allows generalisations to be made by the whole category, as mentioned in chapter 4 (Methodology). It was also possible to quantify respondents and related answers, once interviews were performed individually. The quantification in the terms that was done in this section provides a more accurate picture of the situation of the groups regarding the variables studied.

The second subsection presents data collected from the group of prison officers. The circumstances in which these interviews were undertaken did not allow any quantification of data. Due to the nature of the organisations studied it was not possible to perform a random sample of officers to be interviewed. They were allocated by the organisation to the interviews due to their availability. Security was

the reason alleged by the organisation for this procedure. Nevertheless, it was possible to interview a minimum of 10% of the total of officers in each organisation. The formal interviews had to be performed in groups which varied in size in accordance to officers availability. It was not possible then to keep regularity on the number of, for example, new and old officers, or any other category that seemed to be important beforehand. Although formal interviews could contain some bias, once the officers were specially allocated by the organisation, some informal contacts during intervals and observation techniques were used by the researcher to decrease this possibility. It was not possible to determine quantities or percentages of opinions related to new and to old officers. However, it was possible to identify tendencies of opinion among them and to allocate these opinions to old or new officers during the time of the interviews and informal talks, which allows one to describe a general picture of the officers group as a whole. Preliminary information was also given by different members of staff in both prisons about a major distinction between new and old prison officers in the way they perceive quality management and the process of change in their jobs. It helped answers to be allocated to each of the groups.

The results in the second subsection thus identified tendencies of opinion among new and old officers. Although representing tendencies instead of precise generalisable results, they are believed to have enough degree of reliability to be taken into consideration as the basis for future research in the area.

5.3.3.1. Governors and Technicians

This subsection presents data related to the effects of the SPS quality programme in aspects of job design, satisfaction and control among governors and technicians in Dungavel and Perth Prison. Six main variables were chosen to describe the situation of jobs within each prison: understanding of the function, managerial skills, delegation, number of team-working activities, job satisfaction and morale of the staff. For each of these variables it was intended to identify if the implementation of the quality programme in each prison made "no significant change" (NSC) on the way people perceived and performed their functions, or if it changed and how.

Table 5 shows the results for the first variable analysed, that is the scope of the understanding of the function performed by each respondent.

Table 5: Effects of the Quality Programme on the Understanding of the Function

Groups		Understanding of the Function						
		Dungavel			Perth			
		Higher	NSC	Lower	Higher	NSC	Lower	
Governors	(N=2)	1	1	0	(N=7)	5	2	0
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	3	0

It can be observed that most governors affirm the need for a broader understanding of the function performed, is now higher. It was attributed by governors to the new role of the prison as a customer-oriented service organisation. The following statement given by one governor in Perth illustrates this point:

"...we are now more accountable. Everything is now set to targets, measures, etc. The Service is changing and so is our jobs. We need to adapt to changes and start thinking about things like customers and quality management, which we knew little about really."

Competition with the private sector through market-testing and the threat of privatisation was the main reason appointed for the need of a broader understanding of the function. Governors think that the Service should not be privatised. Once the prisons are going to be market-tested the governors need to understand in depth all the elements involved in the process in order to be prepared for the coming competition.

One governor in Dungavel and two governors in Perth stated that their jobs did not change significantly in terms of the need for a broader understanding of the function. Among the possible explanations for these results, two seemed to be the most likely : a) possible lack of commitment to the quality approach being implemented; and b) the functional area of activity of the governor is not to be so affected by the programme due to the nature of the activities developed in such an area.

All of the technicians interviewed in both prisons stated that the quality programmes of their organisations were not affecting their jobs in terms of the understanding of their function. This is probably due to the level of specialisation required for this function which makes a managerial quality approach have little or no impact on their jobs. As demonstrated before, the idea of a quality prison for this group is not related to managerial techniques, but to tasks that will lead to the achievement of the rehabilitation objectives of the prison. The only aspect mentioned by the technicians relating to their jobs due to the implementation of the quality management programme was the increase in the amount of paper-work. One technician stated that:

"quality is that thing about rules and statistics. It has increased a lot the amount of paper-work to be done."

In fact, this aspect was mentioned by almost everybody in each of the groups studied.

Alterations in the need for managerial skills was the second variable chosen for analysis of job design, satisfaction and control. The results of the analysis of this variable for governors and technicians can be seen in Table 6.

Table 6: Effects of the Quality Programme on Managerial Skills

Managerial Skills								
Groups		Dungavel				Perth		
		Higher	NSC	Lower		Higher	NSC	Lower
Governors	(N=2)	1	1	0	(N=7)	6	1	0
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	3	0

Most managers argue that the need for managerial skills is now higher than before the implementation of the quality programme. Again, they were delegated tasks like budget control, strategic planning and performance measures for each functional area. These tasks were not performed before the quality management programme by governors of functional areas, as they were centralised in the Headquarters.

The position of a governor involves, by definition, possession of managerial skills. According to governors in both prisons the quality management programme made them more professional in this sense. Some governors started in the Service as prison officers. This is a position that requires different skills than those of a governor. Quality management then made them more aware of this fact. Some of

them realised that they would have to improve their managerial skills to perform the job properly under the new overall policy of the Service.

Exceptions among governors (1 in Dungavel and 1 in Perth) were likely to have occurred for the same reasons stated before, that is, singularities of the functional area or lack of commitment to the quality programme.

Technicians stated once more that managerial skills required for their jobs were the same as before the implementation of the programme.

Table 7 shows the results of the effects of quality management in the delegation process. Delegation here is considered for both activities and the scope of decision-making in relation to those activities.

Table 7: Effects of the Quality Programme on the Delegation Process

Delegation								
Groups		Dungavel				Perth		
		Higher	NSC	Lower		Higher	NSC	Lower
Governors	(N=2)	2	0	0	(N=7)	7	0	0
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	3	0

The results show that all governors stated that they were delegated new tasks and that they had more scope of decision-making. The emphasis on delegation can be seen in most of the documents in the SPS, where it is stated that employees are empowered and encouraged to take ownership of services to be provided. In fact, there has been a delegation process. The Headquarters have been delegating tasks to the prisons' governors and they, in turn, are delegating to the officers' levels. The process of delegation is changing the content of jobs in the prisons.

In terms of managerial work, there is a consensus among the governors in Dungavel and Perth that the quality management programme is affecting their jobs because they are now more accountable. Within the prisons everything now is set to targets, measures etc. By the time of the field-work governors were starting to be involved in it more directly and intensively because of market-testing and the threat of privatisation, as stated before. They feel that now they have to justify what they are doing each working hour of work and it represents new pressures that are making jobs more demanding and stressful. The following comment made by one of the governors in Perth expresses this point clearly:

"we really have to condense our jobs and make sure that we are working all the time. For example, although the supervision of prisoners is the main job here, officers have to realise that if there are no prisoners in the hall most of the day then they are not supervising prisoners and so they have to take on other activities during the time that the prisoners are out of the hall. Previously they would have probably just stayed in the hall, walked about the gallery and done checks etc., but now they have to justify every minute they are employed, basically. We have to make sure that everything is monitored".

Governors need to make sure that all these activities are monitored. They have to make sure that the staff are kept busy at all times and that they are doing their work to the standards that are expected, according to the targets that were previously set. An example of the targets that have to be achieved now is related to prisoners' requests. If a governor has to deal with a prisoner's request, he or she has to make sure that there is a time schedule for answering the request. If the officer cannot answer, the prisoner goes to the governor and he or she has to make sure that an answer will be given in 24 hours.

Apart from being involved on budgets, planning and supervision of delegated tasks to lower levels under their responsibilities, governors must also deal with some new operational issues. The following example was given by one of the governors:

"before the implementation of the quality programme... well, you have here certain categories of prisoners. You had to get permission to change their category from B to C. You had to ask the department for that decision of

changing a prisoners' security category. I always, in the past, had to get the department to sanction that, and often that authority was given to me by someone who did not know any prisoner, never seen a prisoner in their life. But they were making that decision. Now I make that decision, and we are the people who know the prisoners and we decide on their security categories. It is something that took maybe six weeks in the past which is now done in two days. By the time the administration is done locally the prisoner knows he is up to be considered for a reduction in security category, and the decision is there the next day. It took six weeks in the past."

It seems that jobs have become more demanding but also more enriched as a consequence, once power for decision making was also delegated to middle level governors (or governors of functional areas) together with their new activities. It gives them more control of their activities.

No significant changes occurred in relation to the jobs of technicians regarding delegation. The increased amount of paper-work caused by the introduction of the quality programme seems, in this specific case, to represent job enlargement. New tasks have to be performed by technicians that relate specifically to fulfilment of forms and written reports. The increase in the number of tasks does not represent in this case any kind of delegation of authority for decision-making.

The number of team-working activities also increased among governors in the Service but remained without any significant change among technicians, as can be observed on Table 8.

Table 8: Effects of the Quality Programme on the Amount of Team-Working Activities

Team-WorkActivities								
Groups		Dungavel				Perth		
		Higher	NSC	Lower		Higher	NSC	Lower
Governors	(N=2)	2	0	0	(N=7)	7	0	0
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	3	0

Governors take part in different kinds of team-working activities like quality circles, team-briefings and others. Technicians, on the other hand, did not have their jobs affected in great deal in relation to team-working. The activities in which they were involved before, the nature of their tasks and the small number of members of this group, can be taken as factors that enabled them to have already been involved in different kinds of team-working. After the implementation of the quality programme they started taking part in few other group tasks with other organisational groups, but mostly on an *ad hoc* basis.

Governors take part in different kinds of team-working activities exclusively designed for governors, as well as others where governors and other members of the staff take part. An example of a team-working activity designed for governors was given by one of them in the following statement:

"Perth has changed governors recently and this kind of activity will depend mainly on the governor in charge, that is, if he agrees with the way we are proceeding or not. During the period of our previous governor we had what they called Perth Improvement Groups - PIGs for short, which really is not a very nice name. PIGs to me were very similar to quality circles in many respects except, I think, for it being more management lead. And what we were looking at was management dictated. I think that the basic philosophy was different there. I think quality circles, as I understand, would be the same, but instead of being management sort of lead, told and therefore open to suspicion by workers, it is something that employees could do as they want. And maybe different approach would give different results."

Another example was given by one governor who takes part in systematic meetings with his staff which is a kind of quality circle, as explained in the following statement:

"this group activity is basically giving and receiving information, besides how our group is working; if they are working well, and how we can improve these areas. Is there any improvement we can make? Are we doing everything right? There is always something else coming up and we have got to see it and how best we can tackle this job, but we are always striving to improve what we are doing. Give them a better service and visits, changing some things in the reception, the movement group with escorts. We have got so many problems with escorts, seeing how we can improve with escorts; this is a continuous thing."

The aim of such growth in the number of team-working activities seems to be consistent, as demonstrated more clearly in the statement above, with the managerialist rationale of quality definition identified in the SPS, particularly in Perth Prison, towards continuous improvement in the services. Many team-working activities are also related to the elaboration of the strategic planning for each prison.

The results of the impact of quality management on job satisfaction demonstrates an increase in the level of satisfaction among governors. Among technicians the results show a division between the categories "no significant change" and "lower", as shown in Table 9.

Table 9: Effects of the Quality Programme on the Job Satisfaction

Job Satisfaction								
Groups		Dungavel				Perth		
		Higher	NSC	Lower		Higher	NSC	Lower
Governors	(N=2)	2	0	0	(N=7)	7	0	0
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	1	2

All governors interviewed stated that they were more satisfied with their jobs. They stated that although jobs were now more demanding, the delegation process represents enrichment of their jobs. One of the governors mentioned his enthusiasm about their new activities as follows:

"so, I thought, initially... when the governor happened to call all the staff and say 'right, I know that you've got all these jobs. Now you've got another job, and you know, you will have to find about it' OK... there is more work to be done, and how are you going to find time to do it? But apart from few people, the rest of the staff thought 'this is my opportunity to shine, to prove what I can do'".

It seems that although quality made jobs more demanding for governors it also increased the degree of job satisfaction among them. It seems to be explained by an increase in the degree of discretion regarding their activities. The following statement given by one governor illustrates this point:

"it (the delegation process) gives you more job satisfaction. In the past you were very often frustrated about the amount of time taken to get a decision. Now the decision can be made, so you get the satisfaction of seeing what you have started finished. Before, you had to wait on the governmental administration, which takes time. We can do it quicker now. We can see the results of our own action."

Among the technicians the position in relation to job satisfaction is mixed. Fifty per cent of them stated that their satisfaction in the job was still the same, as the content of their jobs had not changed significantly. The other 50% stated that although their jobs were still the same, they disliked the fact of the increase in the amount of paper work originated by quality management.

It is interesting to note that although job satisfaction increased significantly among the governors in the organisation, the morale decreased significantly, as shown in Table 10.

Table 10: Effects of the Quality Programme on Staff Morale

Morale								
Groups		Dungavel				Perth		
		Higher	NSC	Lower		Higher	NSC	Lower
Governors	(N=2)	1	1	0	(N=7)	1	0	6
Technicians	(N=1)	0	1	0	(N=3)	0	1	2

Although employees expressed an increase in the degree of job satisfaction, the decrease in the morale of staff is explained by the lack of job security in the Service.

A general sense of insecurity within the Service was caused by a plan to restructure the organisation in order to make it more flexible. For the SPS administration, the structures of their Headquarters and their prisons are not adequate to the quality approach. By the time of the field-work there was a ongoing study on the restructuring of the Service whose objective was to make the SPS structures more flexible. This fact was causing insecurity and it was contributing to lowering the morale of the staff, since nobody in the Service knew exactly what would happen to their jobs.

The general expectation was that the biggest changes would occur in the managerial levels. It was believed that the number of governors were too high and the organisation could operate better, in a more flexible way, with a decrease especially in the middle levels of the hierarchy. According to one of the governors interviewed:

"there is a staffing review being done just now and the indications would be that the management structure at the moment is quite heavy. Like in Perth we have got a governor 2, we have got a governor 3, 3 governors 4 and we have got about 6 governors 5... They will flatten that down to maybe just two grades of governors, so our jobs are being looked at quite closely at the moment... We might all get offered redundancy packages or have to move or whatever so there is a wee bit of concern at the moment. We do not quite know what is happening, I mean, by January I may be moved on, my job maybe will not be here".

The flattening of structure seems to be linked to the degree of delegation already in process in the prisons. Governors interviewed in Dungavel and Perth gave the following statements on the subject:

"the changes that we are passing through and the ones that are being studied are affecting us a lot. The morale of the staff is very low at the moment. There is a lot of uncertainty and it causes insecurity about our future. In reality, we do not know what is going to happen to us."

"our job might go down to a PO; it might be a principal officer that might do it or they will retain it. I do not know. It might mean that I will have to move sideways and take on a different job or even move to a different establishment altogether. Or, if I was old enough, retire. We do not know yet, so there is a bit of concern for everybody".

There is disagreement among the governors about these changes. Despite the lack of security and even facing the possibility of moving to another position, some governors think that it is unnecessary to have so many middle levels of managers. The following statement illustrates this point:

"I should not have to go to my governor 4 who has to go to the deputy governor who has to go to the governor for a decision. One big boss, one level of functions, the other people supervisors, it should improve everything. It should improve the quality. It should make better communications, it should make less time waiting for the authority to come back. I think it would be an improvement, but it is a long time coming".

On the other hand, others are arguing against the possible changes, as follows:

"if we lose 4 governor grades here, who is going to do the work? It is going to come to me and all the rest of the governors more work. Consequently we have got to push more work down and some of them are saying 'I cannot cope' and there are difficulties with that. People down there have not had the training to receive additional responsibilities quite a lot of the time".

Some other governors do not have an established opinion about this issue. It has to be considered that it was a new issue in the SPS during the field-work. Therefore, governors and staff in general had relatively little information about the real nature of the changes that were being prepared. The only consensus was that it was causing great insecurity which was responsible for the low morale among the staff during the time of the field-work.

Technicians also stated concerns about their jobs. They were also likely to be affected by the restructuring project. One of the governors gave the following statement about restructuring and technicians jobs:

"we employ, for example, three psychologists. one is a grade A salary; A, B and C are the grades. One gets a salary of 28,000 pounds, the next one is 23,000 pounds, and we have one probationary with 17,000 pounds. Do we need psychologists at that level? Could we not have one maybe at that level? Do we need two at the 20.000 pounds barrier? That is a saving of 8,000 pounds. Every department should look at this. Social workers: do we need so many social-workers? The money would be saved, definitely."

Prison officers were also affected by quality management. The next section examines the effects of the SPS quality approach in prison officers' jobs, particularly in aspects related to job design, satisfaction and control.

5.3.3.2. Prison Officers

As stated in the begining of this section it was not possible to quantify the results of the impact of quality management in prison officers' jobs due to the circumstances in which the data was allowed to be collected. It was possible, however, to identify the general perception of officers about the issues raised. It was also possible to identify a divergent position within the group which could be related to two sub-groups, as shown in Table 11.

Table 11: Quality Management and Aspects of Job Design, Satisfaction and Control Among Prison Officers

Aspects of Job Design, Satisfaction and Control	Organisational Groups	
	New Officers	Old Officers
	Dungavel and Perth	Dungavel and Perth
understanding of the function	higher	higher
managerial skills	higher	higher
delegation	higher	higher
team-working	higher	higher
job satisfaction	higher	lower
morale	lower	lower

Officers interviewed in both prisons stated that their jobs became more demanding since the need for a broader understanding of their function, the need for managerial skill and the amount of activities and decision making they were doing was now higher than before the implementation of quality management.

Officers have been given new activities and responsibilities within the prisons. As far as governors are receiving new activities they are also delegating some others to lower levels in the organisational hierarchy. One example of one of the activities that has been delegated is concerned with solving operational problems in the galleries. Before quality management all problems in the galleries had to be reported to the senior and principal officers or even to the governors for a decision to be made. Now, if there is a complaint about an issue like the quality of the food, for example, the prisoners have to report to the gallery officer. He or she has to deal with that complain within 24 hours and if the prisoner is not satisfied with the answer he can go to the principal officer and discuss the complaint. There is, then, a new deadline of 24 hours for an answer. After this process such a complaint could go to the governor, if necessary.

Officers also received other responsibilities, such as looking after materials, recreational equipment, furniture, etc. Their new responsibilities on this matter is not limited to the care of the material. Officers are also encouraged to develop ways of managing materials efficiently (e.g. developing ways of saving money in purchases). This involves, therefore, a certain degree of managerial skill. It also demonstrates that the delegation process to officers does not involve only job enlargement, but in fact an enrichment of the tasks. The following statement given by one prison officer in Perth Prison illustrates this point:

"what is happening now is that management has at long last realised that staff have it within their capacity to be able to deal with a lot more than the mundane goings-on of the prison. Maybe mundane is not quite the right sort of answer but we can deal with a lot more of the responsible decision-making within a prison, in the halls especially, with requests and the prisoners day-to-day needs. Why not? I

mean the staff are actually working in halls so yes, I think we should be responsible for that. I think that is what has happened, that staff are now taking on more ownership of what is going on in the hall. Management are actually passing down a lot of decision making".

Officers are also becoming involved in the planning of the halls' activities as well as they are becoming aware of budget availability. They have to learn to deal with costs efficiently. The scope of activities they can perform and the decisions they can make are dependent upon the amount of money predicted in the budget and allocated to each activity.

There are two different points of view among officers in relation to their new activities and the changes in their jobs. New officers tend to accept more easily their new tasks, even with a certain degree of enthusiasm. According to the interview with a technician, the major problem in accepting changes is among the old ones. Although they are not the majority in both Perth and Dungavel they still have some influence among the new ones. This can justify the identification of an increase in the level of job satisfaction among new officers and a decrease in the level job satisfaction among old prison officers.

The more favourable vision of the new officers about the issue is due to the more professional background that the SPS has been looking for during the selection process and an intensive training programme. The following statement given by one prison officer illustrate the increase in the level of job satisfaction among new officers:

"I think it is good. Yeh, but I mean we are actually getting to see what is going on. We are actually getting to decide what is going on in our halls as well, so yes, it has got to be a good idea. I think we actually come in now and we feel we are part of the prison and we are responsible for making choices and decision, so it has got to be a good thing."

The opinion showed in the statement above does not represent a consensus among officers. Some of them are resistant to engaging themselves in new tasks. One of the technicians interviewed has attributed the background of some of the prison

officers, particularly the old ones, as being the main source of resistance to change in the content of their jobs, as shown in the following statement:

"although some of the changes can be for better, the officers will not accept it easily. It is being asked from them much more responsibility than before, even some managerial skills. We must remember that, in general, they are people with a low level of formal education who came from a low working class background. They applied for a job which was just to lock up prisoners, above who they would have great authority. Now, we are asking much more than this and the most difficult thing is to change the idea of a prisoner from who is 'something' that only deserves to be locked up to somebody who can be responsible and deserve some respect."

The statement given by a prison officer in Perth also demonstrates the awareness of two different existing visions among them in relation to changes in their jobs, and to quality management, as follows:

"it varies from staff to staff (the level of job satisfaction). In general I suppose. I think for too long staff have been quite happy to sit around and do nothing, you know, let the world go by as long as nobody is knocking on the door asking for anything then it is quite OK to drink coffee or have a cigarette and call the time. It does vary. Some staff felt that it is a benefit to have more to do. They like to be quite involved in the writing of reports but there is a certain percentage of staff who will never like to be involved. They will rather just like to come to work and do the bare essentials and I think they are the sort of staff that need to be, if you like, got rid of. They are of no value whatsoever. Now you find them mostly among the old ones. But some of the new are also like that and some of the old prefer to be involved in new activities. It varies."

In order to achieve the change in officers' perceptions of their jobs, the SPS is using two major strategies: training and early retirement. It is not a short-term process because it involves a general cultural change in the Service.

There is a great degree of uncertainty among officers, as well as the other organisational groups, about the future of their jobs since they are still in the middle of a changing process. Other changes are to come, especially related to careers, job designs and payment system as an outcome of the ongoing studies on restructuring. This fact seems to be responsible for the indication of a low level of morale among officers, as occurred among governors and technicians.

Officers did not know what would happen with their jobs but most of the new ones stated that changes would be mostly in the content of their activities and not in the number of positions. They stated then that the restructuring review could change things for the better. According to new officers, in general, there are too many governor levels. The following statement given by one officer illustrates this point:

"we actually work on the shop-floor and some of the decisions related to our work are made by 'an obscure man' in the office upstairs who hardly knows the reality of a prisoner".

However, when officers discussed the possibility of changes in their positions their opinions changed radically and there seemed to be no difference between new and old officers, as expressed in the following statement:

"Oh no! In this sense (redundancies and job lost) this restructuring review is causing a lack of security, I mean, we do not know yet the extent to which the changes will affect us. The morale is very low at the moment because of all these things."

Officers also link the low level of morale among staff to market-testing and to the threat of privatisation, as can be noted in the following statement:

"we are here to serve the public, which means to keep these guys behind these four walls. I think it is just a big cost-cutting, that is what it is - a cost-cutting procedure. I mean, we do not know whether our jobs will be safe, I mean, I could not tell. We may be market-tested in a year or 2. Whose to say we are going to be in a job? When I signed on 10 years, I says this is going to be a job for life, which I thought it was, that was me until I was 55, but it does not work like that now. See, the works have just won a big contract there, and I mean this is only a 5 years contract. What are these people going to do after 5 years, you know, if the Governor no longer wants them if he can get somebody in a bit cheaper. I mean its, the morale is right down."

Quality management changed jobs at officers' levels. It was observed that jobs became more demanding and enriched. The effects of job changes on the morale and satisfaction of officers seemed to be different among old officers and new officers. The former group seemed to reject the changes acknowledging that they caused a

decrease in job satisfaction and morale. The latter group seemed to be in favour of the changes and prepared to accept them. Their stated low degree of morale is said to be due to the general insecurity about the future of their positions in the organisation and not related to new responsibilities.

5.4. Discussion and Conclusion

The SPS quality approach is characterised for being a formal programme of quality management, therefore having a managerialist rationale. Presentation and discussion of data collected in two Scottish prisons demonstrates how the SPS quality approach is operating in practice.

Although Dungavel and Perth prisons are subjected to the same general approach to quality emerging from the SPS quality definition, there are variations between and within each prison, in accordance to both structural characteristics of the organisations (in this case particularly objectives and size) and organisational groups' interests and backgrounds.

These results suggest the importance of taking into consideration structural characteristics when analysing quality in organisations. It also suggests that those characteristics affect the perceptions of quality within an organisation. This relationship was also observed by Benson, Saraph, and Schroeder (1991) and Zeithaml, Berry and Parasuranam (1988), although these studies relate quality perceptions to other structural characteristics (see chapter 2, subsection 2.3.2) than the ones identified in this research. The differences are likely to be explained by: a) the type of organisations studied; and b) objectives and methodological aspects of each research. What is important to note, however, is that there is evidence that quality definition in organisations is related in a certain extent to structural characteristics. The literature on quality has been neglecting this issue when

accepting generic and universalistic definitions of quality, as managerial ones (Oakland 1989 and most of quality "gurus") or definitions based only on customers' perception and satisfaction (Munro-Faure and Munro-Faure 1992; Leonard and Sasser 1982).

Wilkinson and Willmott (1995:1) point out that the term "quality" has been used to justify and legitimise different generical procedures in the name of a "self-evident good". The results of this research suggest that the "good" is not so "self-evident". Organisational groups differ in relation their perceptions of quality in the organisation. Therefore, organisational groups are expected to influence the type of quality initiatives within the organisations, as well as the management of these initiatives. One organisational group will always be favoured in relation to others in the organisation. In the case of the implementation of a more formalised quality management programme, managers are expected to be the most favoured group, since they have the initiatives regarding the design and the implementation of the programme in accordance with their objectives (Farnham and Horton 1993; and Pollitt 1993).

The results presented and analysed in this chapter also relate to the impact of quality management on aspects of job design, satisfaction and control. It was observed that quality management significantly modifies the work activities, as also argued by Procter et al. (1994), Dawson and Palmer (1993), Hill (1991a), Hill (1991b), and Dawson and Webb (1989), among others. Therefore, the empirical evidence presented in this research contradicts the arguments that quality management as a strategy in the pursuit of flexibility does not represent, in general terms, significant changes in the work practices (Pollert 1991; Tomaney 1990; Pollert 1988).

The extent in which changes affect jobs varies according to groups of professions and tasks performed. This is consistent with Dawson and Webb's (1989) findings. Governors and prison officers' jobs were the most affected while

technicians' jobs seem not to be affected significantly. This can be explained by: a) the degree of importance attributed to technical work for the achievement of organisational goals; and b) the degree of professionalisation and specialisation of the functions.

Regarding jobs that were affected to a greater degree, it could be observed that quality management made them more demanding, since it was asked from the workers an increase in the need for the understanding of the function performed, an increase in the need for managerial skills, and an increase in the delegation process. The nature and content of these changes in the jobs of governors and prison officers, as described in section 5.3, represents an enrichment of jobs and a reverse in the process of de-skilling. Workers become more aware of their entire function and of the role of the function in the whole set of organisational activities. Moreover delegation of authority occurs and it increases significantly the scope of decision-making, as also noted by Dawson and Webb (1989). Nevertheless, some variation was observed in relation to the degree of such empowerment for different functions. Officers in the galleries, for example, seemed to be more empowered than those responsible for escort activities.

Empowerment and job enrichment does not necessarily lead to a better participative work environment of trust relations, as argued by Hill (1991a); Hill (1991b), Piore and Sabel (1984). The results of this research show that although there was an increase in job satisfaction among most employees, the morale of the staff decreased significantly. This result also differs from that of Dawson and Webb (1989). These authors argued that the "no redundancy policy", favourable rates of pay and employment security of the organisation they studied contributed to a relatively harmonious environment in which quality management operates. In contrast, within the SPS there is a high level of insecurity about the future of the jobs in all organisational groups due to an ongoing study (by the time of the field-work) on the

restructuring of the organisation. This fact was indicated as responsible for the low level of morale among the staff.

Control over tasks has increased with the delegation process. However, delegation is being accompanied by an increase in the amount of paper-work, mostly in the form of reports, due to the establishment of targets and performance measures for a wide variety of activities. This represents an emphasis on output control.

Quality management is therefore affecting the control strategies used by an organisation. Direct and personal supervision is still largely used due to the nature of the organisation studied but there seems to be an attempt to establish more precise and "hard" output measures for organisational activities.

The process of delegation discussed before is accompanied by the establishment of targets and performance measures. It allows management to keep some degree of control of the activities that they delegate. It can be said that it represents centralisation through a decentralisation process, as pointed out by Child (1984). Workers become more free to find a better way to perform specific tasks towards the achievement of a specific target, but the targets to be achieved are set in accordance with the objectives established by managers for the organisation as a whole. The results of this research also suggest that delegation and job enrichment caused by quality management are limited to the operational levels. Managers at the higher levels of the organisation and, in this specific case, politicians, remain accountable for the control over policy and strategy (Dawson and Palmer 1993; Dawson and Webb 1989).

There is a clear attempt to create a stronger identification with management values and goals. This is being done by a massive training programme and changes in the profile of the people that the Service aims to contract through the selection process. Initial training is done through a quality awareness package which is introduced to the staff, followed by specific training for each of the main points of the quality ideology within the organisation. This finding supports Kerfoot and

Knights' (1995) argument that a human resource policy is important to promote a higher degree of success of quality programmes. It can be argued, as Dawson and Palmer (1993) suggest, that quality management works as a cultural control device once it incorporates a human resource management policy.

Chapter 6: Quality, Objectives and Groups in the Brazilian Prison Service - State of Santa Catarina (BPS-SC)

6.1. Organisation of the Brazilian Prison Service (BPS-SC)

In Brazil there was, at the time of the field-work, a total of 297 penal establishments. However, it is not possible to refer to a "Brazilian prison system". In Brazil the prison services are provided and managed by state government, as opposed to federal government, and each state of the federation has an independent and singular structure. The only federal institution formally linked to state prisons is the National Council for Criminal and Penitentiary Policy which is subordinated to the Minister for Justice, and plays a consulting role.

In the State of Santa Catarina, particularly, the prison service, as it is nowadays, is relatively small and very young if compared to the Scottish Prison Service. The older penitentiary, for example, dates from 1930. The prison system is subordinated to the Secretary of State for Public Security.

In its short history, the prison system in Santa Catarina has been closely linked to the criminal justice system in terms of philosophy, and therefore, it has a strong emphasis on custody and control. However, administratively the relationship between the prison and the criminal justice systems is very poor and distant. By law both the judge and the public prosecutor should control closely the execution of sentences. Nevertheless, that almost never happens because there is a lack of formal rules to guide that shared responsibility. The main implication is that the prison system tends to manage the execution of the sentences without supervision, therefore running the risk of becoming less accountable towards society (Hoffmann 1992).

The establishment responsible for running the Service is the Directorate of Penal Administration (DIAP). In March 1991 DIAP passed through a period of

restructuring and became part of the Secretary of State for Public Security. Before this period it had been part of the juridical system and a branch of the Secretary of State for Justice. At that period the prison service was called penitentiary service and comprised only three penitentiaries, the open establishment and the hospital of custody and psychiatric treatment. Now it is part of the Secretary of State for Public Security together with the Civil Police Service, the Military Police Service, the Directorate of Traffic and the Directorate of Civil Defence. The director of each of these organisations reports directly to the Secretary of State. This change was made by the new government which won the elections for Santa Catarina State in 1991, as part of a general policy of cost-cutting and attempting to improve efficiency in the State administration.

The general objective of DIAP is the “planning, programming, co-ordinating, executing and controlling of the activities related to the penitentiary and prison policy of the State of Santa Catarina, as well as the distribution and concession of places to the penal establishments” (DIAP 1993).

DIAP is responsible for 3 penitentiaries, 1 open establishment, 1 hospital of custody and psychiatric treatment and 8 *presídios*⁽⁸⁾. For this research the focus is on two of the State penitentiaries which will be called “prisons” in order to establish a comparative framework with the Scottish organisations that have the same basic functions. The main difference between the Brazilian and the Scottish organisations regarding their functions is that a penitentiary in Santa Catarina holds only prisoners after they have been sentenced. Adults on remand are held by the *presídios*, while Scottish establishments hold both adults on remand and sentenced prisoners. Size and other functions of the Brazilian and the Scottish organisations are basically the same.

(8) establishments normally smaller than the penitentiary that, in a normal situation, hold only prisoners on remand.

By the time of the field-work the prison service in Santa Catarina was holding 3,012 prisoners distributed as follows: 376 in Florianópolis Prison, 368 in Chapecó Prison, 333 in Curitibanos Prison, 91 in the Hospital of Custody and Psychiatric Treatment, 36 in the Open Establishment, 1,385 in the *presídios* and 423 in other small local establishments.

6.2. Issues on Quality in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC

In 1990, as stated before, the prison service in SC State passed through some structural changes. These changes occurred under the new administration of the State right after the election for the State Governor and parliament members. The new government had its political roots in the right wing faction of Brazilian politics and its party was one of the central supporters for the military government period (from 1964-1984). This party still has great influence and now appears to have stronger popular support, due to both the dissemination of neo-liberal ideas in capitalist countries and the failure of Brazilian left-wing parties to turn their ideas into operational proposals which could be reflected in popular vote during the elections.

BPS-SC does not have an explicit well established quality management programme. It does not mean, however, that it does not have an idea about what is or is not quality in relation to the services that it offers. Quality as a general concept is not restricted to a set of specifications and management techniques. It is a characteristic intrinsic of a product, service or even an organisation that makes it appreciable by a certain number of people.

Most of the work that has been carried out on quality management in the organisation studies field analyses and discusses theoretical and practical aspects of the subject in organisations that have driven themselves into a quality management

programme in any of its variations. Others analyse quality under the perspective of customer satisfaction.

This chapter discusses quality practices in BPS-SC, an organisation that has not implemented any type of quality management programme. To do so, the concept of operative objectives (Perrow 1978) is taken as a central variable (see chapter 2, section 2.4 "The Role of Operative Objectives in Understanding Quality Initiatives in Organisations"). It is suggested that in organisations like BPS-SC, quality issues can be understood by the identification of the operative objectives of different groups within the organisation. Power struggles among groups as well as institutional pressures will determine the organisation's objectives which, of a structural level, will correspond in a certain degree to the quality philosophy of the organisation. Moreover, shifts in the importance given to specific managerial practices in the organisation reflect shift of attention given to different organisational roles or objectives. In the case of BPS - SC, for example, the fact that the new management group, which took over after the State elections, has promoted change in the Service shows that, in their perception, there were previously problems related to the way the organisation was being administrated towards the achievement of its objectives.

6.3. Quality Initiatives and Structural Objectives Within the BPS-SC

The analysis of quality related issues in the BPS-SC starts with the restructuring occurring in 1990, when the new government of the State of Santa Catarina began its activities by choosing a new management team for the public sector organisations in the State.

Before 1990 the Prison Service belonged to the Secretary of State for Justice. In that period it was given relatively high autonomy in terms of allocation of

resources and training. The new government, however, introduced a policy of cost-cutting and reducing the administrative size of the government. They aimed, among other aspects, to decrease the number of Secretaries of State. For example, there was no longer a Secretary of State for Justice but a Secretary of State for Administration and Justice. The Prison Service changed from the Secretary of State for Justice to the Secretary of State for Public Security. The effect of this change in the Service was significant. The Service grew a lot in terms of size, with the aggregation of new small service organisations which were under the responsibility of the Secretary of State for Public Security, as stated in topic 5.1 of this chapter. These changes represented, according to the interviews conducted throughout the Service, a loss of status, and consequently power, of the Service within the State administration.

While in the Secretary of Justice, there was a great emphasis on the work of technicians within the Service. Technical work is related to the tasks of psychologists, social workers, teachers, doctors, etc. There was also a major concern in the Prison Service over selection and training procedures, since these elements were regarded as fundamental in the fulfilment of one of the main objectives of the Service, namely rehabilitation. The following statement given by a governor at DIAP illustrates this point:

"we had a director here who had a preoccupation with qualification of people. Once there was an opportunity through an agreement with the Ministry of Justice. They would select people from the three States of the south of Brazil to do a postgraduate course in criminology in Rio Grande do Sul State. There were two vacancies available for Santa Catarina and our director, who was a judge, selected people based in two criteria: a) we had to have a permanent job at the Service; and b) we had to have a university degree."

The importance given to the role of technicians within the Service under the old administration was also justified as the means of achieving a better balance between custody and rehabilitation. Prisons were seen not only as custodial institutions but also as treatment institutions. As part of the legal system, the Service has been receiving increasing attention concerning resource allocation (particularly

for training and infra-structure) and administrative vision. A shift in the importance of training, for example, under the new administration, can be seen in the following statement given by a governor at DIAP:

"what happened with us is that really after the change in the government there is no support anymore for training. There was a new course like the old one that I told you. There were two more vacancies available for Santa Catarina and there was no indication of any person this time. Moreover, the ones who made the first course were never called to present the results and perhaps to contribute in a more direct way with the Service."

Therefore, from 1990 there was a shift in the focus of attention on the objectives of the Service as part of the ideology of the new State administration. Its aim was to cut down the costs of the Service. After the reorganisation of the State, the Service lost importance. As part of the Secretary of State for Public Security it became a powerless organisation. Civil and Military Police have stronger political support, and the Service was seen simply as a place to lock up prisoners. The allocation of resources to the Service became more restricted and centralised, and its administration became influenced by the philosophy of the Police Forces. In this sense, rehabilitation lost importance as one of the main objectives of the Service, although it remains formally defined as such, and custody became the focus of attention, instead.

The shift in the emphasis on rehabilitation tasks is evident when Chapecó Prison is taken into consideration. There is no psychologist or social worker position there anymore. The Governor of Health and Education is a social worker, but with her responsibilities as a Governor she cannot give enough attention to social work activities. She tries, however, by personal commitment to her job, to attend social work and sometimes even psychological activities with the inmates.

This situation was also observed in the DIAP. The governor responsible for giving support and assistance to the inmates who were about to be free became, in fact, an adviser for administrative matters of the DIAP's Director. This happened

because the governor in charge of these activities was, at the time of the field-work, a very experienced person in the Service. According to this governor,

"my responsibilities could not be developed here. How can you receive an inmate in an environment like this, I mean, in a sort of sophisticated building in the city's administrative and financial centre? We have to be in the field. This is why my colleagues who were under my supervision left. Now it is just me and my secretary. My activities are restricted to provide statistical surveys and advice for the director and rarely am I able to do some work on education and preparation for release. I stayed just because I need the money."

Here there is an indication of a shift in the quality philosophy and practice of the organisation as a result of a shift in the dominant group. The dominant group, during the former administration, had a view of the prison as an organisation in which training was important in order to provide good services and to enable effective rehabilitation for prisoners. This vision was shared by the central administration and the technicians, who were normally involved in rehabilitation tasks.

The main focus of the Prison Service in the administration from 1990 to 1994 was clearly an emphasis on: a) the juridical and legal procedures of the Law of Penal Execution; and b) custody.

The emphasis on the juridical and legal aspects of the Law is of great importance for the Service administration, as they are considered to be the minimum that can be done to guarantee a fair treatment for the inmates based on the observation of basic human rights. Moreover, the general administration could concentrate more directly on these aspects, without spending a great amount of financial resources, therefore complying with the policy of the State administration, and also without a great degree of interference and pressures from other groups within the organisations (prisons), like the prison officers and the technicians, since it would not affect their jobs a great deal.

The juridical and legal aspects of the Law are related to prisoners' rights in terms, for example, of deadlines for appeals, requests for freedom when the

sentence is ending, etc. These aspects are regarded to be the main focus of management activities by the Director of DIAP. According to him,

"Santa Catarina is maybe the only State in Brazil where you cannot find a person whose sentence has finished that is still in prison. We provide all the necessary paper-work 60 days in advance and there is no need for lawyers whatsoever. So it is for this reason, for the agility of the DIAP and the Penitentiary Council (we have the best penitentiary council in the country) that a request for freedom, for example, does not take more than 25 days, while in other States it can take about 8 months."

In a comparative framework it can be considered reasonable but in fact, it could be done much faster if much of the bureaucratic difficulties of the Brazilian public sector management were cut down. In a formal dimension, the Brazilian public sector is considered to be extremely legalist with a great amount of laws, rules and regulations in each level of the governmental services. This contributes to give formal authority to specific groups within the government administration, since the rules are interpreted differently in specific situations enforcing power positions of groups or individuals.

It is interesting to note that there is little specific managerial concern *per se* in DIAP administration in terms of a long term strategic vision for the Service. Most managerial issues are related to legal or political procedures. When asked to clarify what the so-called "agility" of the Service (stressed as a main characteristic of his administration) actually consisted of the Director of DIAP said:

"it is a conjugation of efforts. Today there is an 'agilisation' within DIAP, within the Penitentiary Council and within the *Varas de Execuções* ⁽⁹⁾ because also in this aspect Santa Catarina is different from other States. Our *Varas de Execuções* are decentralised. We have one for each prison while in other States they are centralised in the capital. Instead of having 20 or 30 judges spread out in the State they are all in the capital. It makes the system slow. Although we have other problems similar to other States, like lack of resources and personnel, we supersede these difficulties with our agility."

(9) *Varas de Execuções* are the organisations responsible for judging and deciding about prisoners' requests.

Again, it can be noted that the idea of managerial activities is strongly related to legal procedures.

Also stressed as one of the causes of the good performance of Santa Catarina Prison Service according to its Director is the fact that the population of the State is well spread. Considering the Brazilian pattern, there are no big cities in the State and this contributes to the non-concentration of criminality in one city.

One of the reasons that led to the implementation of the so-called organisational "agility" (flexibility) was the increase in the prison population over the last few years in the State. There are few prisons available and they are too small to support a large prison population. Therefore, in order to avoid the problem of over population, it was decided to free prisoners who had already fulfilled their sentences as soon as possible, which would free more places in the prisons. It can be observed that what is considered to be a quality characteristic of the organisation and of its actual administration is no more than the fulfilment of their formal legal role, that is, to follow what is established by the law.

The establishment of a strategic view for the Service and related administrative practices was not observed. The organisation seemed to continue following the administrative routines established throughout its existence. According to a statement given by one governor at DIAP

"it is necessary to build a philosophy of work because we do not have one here... There is no unified action within the Service because there is no interaction among the organisations that compose it".

There is, for example, a planning department within the Secretary for Public Security, but according to most of the governors interviewed at DIAP and in the prisons, people who really know the penitentiary system do not take part in this group. In their opinion the planning department only issues general and quantitative targets, sometimes unrealistic, and it is not able to provide the Service with an

ideology of work or strategic vision. Moreover, the planning group never meets with people in the organisations who perform the Service's activities. They are seen as a centralised bureaucratic group detached from the organisational reality.

As a consequence of the lack of administrative vision for the Service, it is in a situation where the main preoccupation is to maintain administrative routines, emphasising the custodial role of the Service.

Prisons, like mental hospitals and other "total institutions" (Goffman 1968), are seen as performing a kind of integrative function. Normally it is argued that they are successful in doing so, in the way that they confine criminals within prison walls, thus directly protecting society (Foucault 1987; Thompson 1980). Through punishment prisons protect the society reinforcing values against crime, constraining potential criminals, and re-educating inmates as agencies of social reintegration. Punishment, discouragement of crime and reintegration are legitimised by society as being objectives of the prison.

The last objective, that is, reintegration through education is more recent than custody. In Brazil it is mostly in the field of formal discourse, apart from a few specific institutions spread throughout the country. Priority has mostly been given to custodial objectives and activities. Although there are some efforts towards rehabilitation objectives, the society as a whole imposes pressures in the direction of custody as the main role of the prisons (Thompson 1980). If there are failures concerning security in the prisons, for example, almost immediately investigations start to identify the problems. On the other hand, treatment failures are hardly ever discussed. Thompson (1980) emphasises that escapes and rebellions in prisons lead to vigorous protests, mobilise the press, generate changes in the organisational positions and determine punishment to the ones considered guilty. However the same does not happen concerning a failure in the rehabilitation objectives. In this sense, societal pressures lead the governors in the system to give priority to custodial objectives through regimes of rigid discipline. According to Hoffmann (1992) it

jeopardises the initiative of the prisoners which is a necessary factor for rehabilitation.

Quality initiatives at the BPS-SC are related to the establishment of organisational flexibility seeking the upholding of prisoners legal rights and to the maintenance of good custodial conditions.

Organisational flexibility represents the Director of DIAP's perception of a quality prison service. He states that a quality prison service is one that guarantees the perfect functioning of the benefits that the prisoners have the right to have. In his opinion the prison service in Santa Catarina State offers a quality service because prisoners' rights are respected in the terms stated before. In this sense, the penal sector (functional area) of the three prisons in the State are well organised. They are able to request any of the prisoners' rights (evolution for semi-open regime, reduction of the sentence, etc.) in time. According to DIAP data all three prisons have been doing it very regularly because it also contributes to the decrease of tension within the prisons.

The emphasis on the custodial role of the prison as an element of quality definition at the BPS-SC is determined by government ideology and its intended political image for the Service, and also by social legitimacy.

In the next section quality perceptions in two prisons within the Service are identified and discussed in relation to BPS-SC general quality initiatives and guidelines.

6.4. Case Studies: Florianópolis Prison and Chapecó Prison

6.4.1. General Characteristics

Florianópolis Prison is located in Trindade district, which is a residential area of Florianópolis City, the capital of Santa Catarina State. It was built in 1930,

specifically as a prison, to hold 81 inmates. During the 1940s, its capacity was expanded to hold 310 prisoners, but by the time of the field-work it was holding 362 inmates. Although it caused some concern, this over-population was not considered very problematic when compared to other prisons throughout the country, especially in the large urban centres.

Florianópolis Prison holds male prisoners aged 18 or over who come from different parts of the State. Prisoners are distributed among three different locations within the prison. The ones who are considered to require a maximum security regime are located in a small unit. Inmates who require a high or medium security regime are distributed among the galleries, and those with low-security requirements stay in the semi-open regime, in collective accommodation within the penitentiary complex.

The activities developed by the prisoners in Florianópolis prison include workmanship, mattress shop, tailor's workshop, furniture workshop, printing plant and other craft-related ones. Some prisoners in the semi-open regime also develop some activities in the community outside the prison such as maintenance and cleaning of public buildings.

Florianópolis Prison has 6 governors (1 Governor in Charge and 5 governors of functional areas), 3 technicians and 75 prison officers. Given the fact that the prison held at the time of the field-work 362 inmates, a nominal officer/inmate ratio is 4.82 inmates per officer. However, considering that those officers work in four shifts, at any time the prison will not have more than 19 officers, which leads to an actual minimum ratio of 19.05 inmates per officer. The turnover among prisoners is approximately 30% per year and among the staff it varies according to the category. Among officers and technicians it is close to zero, since they are public servants with job security. The governors, however, are normally replaced every four years.

In terms of gender profile of the staff population, all prison officers were male, one technician was male and two were female, and four out of six governors were male. Other demographic characteristics of the staff, such as age and length of service, were asked but not provided by the organisation.

As far as the sample interviewed is concerned, the gender profile is as follows: all 12 prison officers interviewed were male, and since all technicians and governors were interviewed, their profile is the population profile, presented above.

Chapecó prison is located in Chapecó town in the west part of Santa Catarina State. This region is mostly rural. The industries located there are almost all related to rural activities like food-processing industries. It was built in 1973, specifically as a prison, to hold 120 inmates. During the 1980s its capacity was expanded to house 400 inmates, but by the time of the field-work it was holding 445 inmates.

The prison is a rural establishment which houses male prisoners aged 18 or over. Like Florianópolis Prison, it works with 3 different categories of prisoners allocated to their respective regimes of imprisonment: maximum security, closed and semi-open.

Although this prison has some workshops similar to the ones in Florianópolis Prison, most of its activities are related to agriculture and other farming related tasks.

Chapecó Prison has 6 governors (1 Governor in Charge and 5 governors for functional areas), 1 technician⁽¹⁰⁾ and 35 prison officers. Given the fact that the prison held at the time of the field-work 445 inmates, a nominal officer/inmate rate is 12.71 inmates per officer. However, considering that the work is also done in 4 shifts, at any time the prison will not have more than 9 officers, which leads to 49.44 inmates per officer. Notwithstanding this high index, both Brazilian prisons studied count on the local military police to provide external security. The turnover among

⁽¹⁰⁾ By the time of the field-work the technician was occupying a governor position.

prisoners is approximately 20% per year and among the staff the turnover is similar to the one in Florianópolis Prison.

In terms of gender profile of the staff population, all prison officers were male, the only technician interviewed was female, and one out of six governors was male. Other demographic characteristics of the staff, such as age and length of service, were asked but not provided by the organisation.

As far as the sample interviewed is concerned, the gender profile is as follows: all 10 prison officers interviewed were male, the technician was female and 4 out of five governors interviewed were male.

6.4.2. Groups, Objectives and Quality Definition

In terms of those responsible for running the prisons and its activities, three main groups were chosen for study within Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons: governors, technicians and prison officers. Each of these groups have a general idea about what quality means in relation to their activities, and the role that these activities represent for the organisation. The quality perception of each group was noted to correspond to the objectives of the function of each group within the Service. It was also noted that the operations that represent these objectives are influenced by both power issues within the organisation and by institutional issues.

The responses to the interviews conducted with members of the groups were subjected to a clustering process in order to identify the significant elements in the quality definition for each of the organisational groups. As stated in chapter 4 (Methodology) the interviews with governors and technicians were conducted on an individual basis, and the results represent the perceptions of all members of the groups. As far as prison officers are concerned, the interviews were conducted in groups which varied in size. The officers were allocated to the interviews by the organisations, due to security reasons. As in the Scottish case, it was possible in the

Brazilian case to identify of tendencies among officers' opinions, although no significant difference of opinion regarding the questions posed was observed. Therefore, in the Brazilian case, this group is called "prison officers" with no distinction among, for example, new officers and old officers.

6.4.2.1. The Governors

The group of governors comprise six positions in the organisation. The first in the hierarchical rank is the General Director or Governor in Charge. Traditionally, in both prisons, this position has been occupied by professionals who are linked to organisations responsible for the enforcement of law, that is, organisations known as social regulators.

It is important to note that there is no career structure for governor status in the prison service. All positions are filled in accordance to political criteria every four years, as a result of elections in the State. In the Prison Service, the recruitment of personnel to these positions is the personal choice of the Governor of the State. The Governor's choices are shaped not only by his or her personal preferences but also as a result of coalitions and agreements that his or her political party had to make in order to win the elections. The Secretary of State for Public Security and the Director of DIAP, who are also personal choices of the Governor of the State, also have some influence and interests in the choices of the prison governors. It is a power and bargain process.

Due to the fact that there are no career prospects in the Prison Service, the position of general director has been filled by those who come from outside the penitentiary field.

The Law of Penal Executions (Brasil 1986), which regulates the prison service in Brazil, establishes the necessary qualifications for the position of general director as follows:

"Art. 75. The occupant of the position of director of the establishment must satisfy the following requirements:

I - to have a university degree in Law, Psychology, Social Science or Social Service;

II - to have administrative experience in the field;

III - to have high morales and recognised skills for the performance of the function.

§ - The director must live in the establishment or nearby, and will dedicate full time to his or her activities".

Although the Law establishes some general criteria for the filling of this position, it does not guarantee an identical background, since people can come from many different areas with the experience and qualifications required. It is also important to note that the item about "administrative experience" in the field is very flexible and allows many justifications for personal choices. In Florianópolis Prison, for example, since 1957 this position has been occupied by lawyers, prosecutors, officers from the military police, police delegates and others. By the time of the field-work the general directors of both prisons studied were lawyers with past experiences highly distinct from each other.

The 10 other governors in the two prisons vary in relation to their background, from people who have only high school degrees to ones with university degrees in Portuguese Language, Law, Social Work and Management. Nevertheless most of them are lawyers who had occupied a position of delegate of police before. The governor for Health, Education and Social Promotion is a social worker in both of the prisons studied. This seems to be the rule for most Brazilian prisons. Governors in Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons defined quality using a variety of elements, as shown in Table 12.

Table 12: Significant Components of Quality Definition Among Governors at Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons

Groups	Components of Quality Definition	
	Florianópolis Prison	Chapecó Prison
Governors	prisoners legal rights good physical structure financial autonomy work activities (occupational) work activities (professional) re-education specialised technicians self-maintenance	prisoners legal rights security discipline work activities (occupational) work activities (professional) re-education training

In terms of general guidance, the DIAP's view of quality in the Service is well accepted and shared amongst the governors. The observation of prisoners' legal rights was quoted in almost all interviews conducted in both prisons. This seems to be explained by the high degree of centralisation of the Service and by the direct supervision of its Director over the fulfilment of this requirement. This element of quality definition is emphasised especially among Governors for Penal Executions who are the ones responsible for dealing with matters regarding prisoners' sentence. In both prisons they claim that all prisoners' rights, in terms of legal assistance and deadlines for legal procedures, are totally in accordance with the law.

Although they have the common objective established by the DIAP's Director, there is a difference in other elements of the quality approach between Florianópolis Prison and Chapecó Prison. While in Florianópolis Prison the Governor in Charge claims that more independence is needed in terms of financial resources, in Chapecó Prison the Governor in Charge emphasises the role of discipline and order. This is likely to be explained by the distinct professional backgrounds of these governors.

It was observed in Florianópolis Prison that there was some managerial concern as the Governor in Charge and the Governor of Operational Support saw

themselves powerless and unable to try to create and implement a well structured plan for the prison because of the lack of resources. The following statement given by the Governor in Charge of Florianópolis Prison illustrates this point:

"I do not have any financial autonomy at all. Everything that we want to buy we have to ask authorisation from the Secretary of State and most of the time he argues that there is no money available. It is very difficult to run an organisation in this situation. It is almost impossible. Before 1991 we had an annual budget like any company and then we could make plans for the organisation. Now it is almost impossible."

The fact that the prison service has no budget at all is evidence of the high level of financial and administrative centralisation of the State Government. It makes it difficult to establish and achieve any managerial initiative in strategic terms.

In Chapecó prison, on the other hand, this managerial concern is less evident. The Governor in Charge instead emphasises the guidelines given by the DIAP's Director, as well as the disciplinary aspects of the management of the prison. This observation is supported by the following statement given by the Governor in Charge of Chapecó Prison, regarding the main characteristics of his administration:

"Because of my own professional experience I like the penal side of the prison. So, first of all what I would say that is the main characteristic of my administration is to update all the legal benefits that the prisoners have... Second, the discipline. The prisoners have to have discipline. We have a reduced number of officers here in relation to the number of inmates. There has to be a rigid discipline. Sometimes I am even called nazi or something like that. The prisoner arrives here and it is immediately put in his mind that he has to have discipline."

The role of discipline in Florianópolis Prison is also important, but it is treated with in a different perspective, as stated by its Governor in Charge as follows:

"I am very liberal. They think (the officers) that I am too liberal. When I arrived here there were many complaints of prisoners saying that they were punched. I do not agree with that. I started to end this practice. Is there anything worse than to live behind bars? Why would someone deserve more?"

Because of the lack of independence to act and make strategic plans and decisions, the Governors have to limit themselves to internal issues which differentiate each administration. There is little enthusiasm to fight for a change in this situation because all governors' positions are temporary, that is, they are a political choice. They change with the Government.

There seems to be agreement about one element of quality definition within the prisons and this concerns the work activities of prisoners. However, there are two distinct approaches to the subject. The first emphasises these activities as a matter of therapy that would keep the prisoners occupied, contributing to order and security within the prison. The following statement given by one governor at Chapecó Prison illustrates this approach:

"...I think that while they are working (the prisoner) they find no time to think about something bad or about something that will not contribute to the maintenance of the order in the prison. So, we give them school, sport and mainly work. I think that a mind with no occupation is a tool for the devil. Many of them are here because they had no occupation outside."

The second approach to work activities within the prison is related to developing skills which will, according to the supporters of this view, contribute to the re-integration of the prisoner into society after the sentence. The following statement given by a governor in Florianópolis Prison illustrates this point:

"working activities are one way to re-think the prison; to build prisons that offer conditions to professionalise the prisoner. They (the prisoners) recuperate themselves better in the work; they become professionals. They leave the prison with some skills to work outside and it is likely that they could find a place to work. Leaving the prison without any qualification, in the same way that most of them arrived here, there is no re-habilitation. Then, they will leave and not find any support of the community because they do not know how to do anything. We have this responsibility, this role, that is, to give them some kind of profession for them to make it possible to find a job outside."

It is important to stress that both approaches were observed in both prisons. The approaches to working activities within the prisons seems to have no

relation to the formal educational background of the governors and appears instead to be related to their personal past working experiences. Governors who have a degree other than in Law, and who have part of their working experience outside the Military and Civil Police, seem to approach working activities for the prisoners as having a re-habilitation and educational function. Governors whose background is based on their experiences in the police service, seem to understand working activities as a occupational therapy⁽¹¹⁾, that is, a way of keeping prisoners occupied avoiding free time, when the inmates would be tempted to elaborate escapes and rebellions or any other thing that could disturb the established order of the organisation.

As expected, Governors for Health, Education and Social Promotion, who were social workers, put strong emphasis on the rehabilitation objectives of the prison, particularly in re-education and preparation for release. They also emphasise the importance of having a board of technicians who are highly prepared and specialised, as well as training for officers, as way of efficiently achieve rehabilitation purposes. In Florianópolis Prison the Governor for Health, Education and Social Promotion argued that prisons should be self-maintained through the work of inmates as shown in the following statement:

"I think that there should be a total restructuring of the Service in the whole country. A prison should be self-maintained through the work and productivity, because the inmates are not worthless people. It would also contribute to the prisoner's re-education and rehabilitation for life outside the prison."

Self-maintenance is a characteristic of a quality prison for this governor. However, this view is not shared completely by the technicians and other members of the different organisational groups, who think that the prison service is primarily a Government responsibility, although they do not deny the possibility of investing more in the work of the inmates.

⁽¹¹⁾ Some of the governors use the term "labour therapy" to address the work of the inmates.

There is a general consensus that a better physical structure is needed for both custodial and re-habilitation purposes, particularly in Florianópolis Prison. Although the buildings of the two prisons studied are relatively new there is a lack of security and, in some areas, a lack of decent living conditions for the inmates, as illustrated by the following statement given by a governor in Florianópolis Prison:

"our biggest problem is the physical structure. The Government does not invest in prisons. Hardly. During these three years and something that I have been here there has been no money invested here and I did not get any money from outside to be invested. The Government always has other priorities like schools, roads, hospitals and the Service is being always left behind. While there is no rebellion, it will remain the way it is."

This can be taken as an indication that within society the prison service is not seen as a priority. Perhaps because, even in a State considered rich by national standards, when the whole country is taken into consideration, there are other areas where investment is more important than those related to people who had to be excluded from social life for breaking its established rules and norms.

The vulnerability of governors' positions seems to be the main factor leading to both a lack of action in terms of plans for the organisations, and for the variety of perceptions of quality within the group of governors, since it is a very heterogeneous group. It is likely that the elaboration and implementation of a strategic plan, as well as special training for the governors, would provide a more homogeneous definition of quality among them. The actual situation of the Service concerning governors positions, and the lack of strategic action, contributes to the imposition of the DIAP's guidelines to quality initiatives. These guidelines are likely to change often due to elections every four years in the State, causing a constant change of view within the prisons as well.

6.4.2.2. The Technicians

In this research the board of technicians of the prisons is considered to consist of social workers and psychologists. The main difference between the two prisons is that in Chapecó there is no formal psychologist position, and instead, the social worker provide some support for the psychological needs of the prisoners, even without being specialised in this area. The elements of quality definition for technicians are strongly linked to the objectives of their profession in the organisations, that is, rehabilitation purposes, as shown in Table 13.

Table 13: Significant Components of Quality Definition Among Technicians at Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons.

Groups	Components of Quality Definition	
	Florianópolis Prison	Chapecó Prison
Technicians	training work activities (professional) education effective social work	career for technicians work activities (professional) good physical structure small size local prisons security

Most of the elements considered to be important as determinants of a good quality prison for technicians are related to rehabilitation tasks which represent the objectives of this group in this kind of organisation.

It is important to note that these professionals do not compose the staff of the prisons in a formal way, that is, there is no career prospects in these positions. Therefore, training and career were elements heavily stressed by technicians in both prisons. At present, similarly to what happens in the SPS case, the technicians are provided by other State organisations for periods of time that are not well defined in

advance. There is thus, a high level of turn over in the prisons regarding technical jobs. According to Hoffmann (1992) the factors responsible for this situation are: a) the lack of formal position for these professionals in the prison service; b) the temporary nature of these positions; and c) no adaptation by the professionals since the organisation has high risk factors, among others.

Technical work in the prisons is normally related to re-habilitation objectives. These objectives are the ones that aim to re-integrate the individual into society. The idea is that, when leaving the prison, the inmate can interact with others in the community free from the factors that could have influenced him or her to act against the law in the first place. In the view of the technicians, re-socialisation is a qualitative and continuous process through which the individual is prepared to be re-integrated in the society. Also it has to allow for the development of the individual's potential for a new lifestyle in a familiar, social and professional environment. It is believed that the prevention of deviations stimulates the dynamics of maturation of personality in a balanced and harmonious way. This would enable the man to contribute in an effective way to the improvement of his social environment.

The rehabilitation process, according to the technicians, allows individuals to make decisions taking into consideration the opportunities to enhance his or her personal development. It contributes to emotional and psychological maturity which will help to guarantee that he or she does not become involved in activities that will make them return to the prison.

Through interviews conducted in Florianópolis and in Chapecó prisons, and based on Hoffmann's (1992) findings, six factors were identified as components of rehabilitation work that were linked to the perception of quality in the two prisons studied:

- work activities: after passing through a initial phase or period of adaptation (between one and two weeks) all the prisoners are assigned to work in one of the sectors provided by the prison. This decision is made by the General Director

after consulting the Chief of Security who is a prison officer and the Governor for Agricultural and Industrial Activities. There is a possibility of taking into consideration the past professional experience and knowledge of the inmate. Information gathered within the prison shows that most of the allocation of prisoners to work activities is in reality made by the Chief of Security, also for reasons of security matters. The technicians think that sometimes it can jeopardise the process of education through work, because the prisoner could feel less motivated to do a job that is not of his speciality.

- technical assistance: consists in the work of psychologists and social workers. The work of psychologists and social workers is more directly linked with the rehabilitation process in term of trying to promote a change in attitude of the inmates towards life outside the prison. This work is carried out with the inmates within the prison through interviews with them and their families, and outside the prison through a programme of assistance for the ones who are leaving the prison. According to informants in the Service, although the psychologists and the social workers act in therapeutic activities, a great part of their work consists of evaluations and investigations. These kind of activities give them the responsibility of analysing and judging inmates for legal purposes, which jeopardises their therapeutic role in the sense that they do not get access to prisoners' real thinking because the latter knows that in the future the same technician will be giving a statement about his situation to the prison management.
- education: the school works inside the establishment. All teachers are appointed by the Secretary of State for Public Security. The classes contain both specific subjects similar to any other school in the State, and special issues regarding the life of the prisoners as well as themes that could contribute to effective rehabilitation.

- religion: religious work is done by volunteers from four different religions: Catholic, Spiritism, and two Evangelic groups. Each group performs its religious activities twice a week. On Sundays there is a formal mass for Catholics and Spiritists practitioners. All such activities are restricted to the principles of each religion and there is no influence from the technicians or from the prison administration, apart from those of security.
- system of rewards: this system is prescribed by the Law of Penal Executions and by the internal regime of each prison. It concerns benefits for prisoners who would like to receive more visits and to use radio and television sets in the cells. The criteria used to give these benefits are the result of the analysis of prisoners' behaviour, his performance at work and his wishes to collaborate with the prison management.
- seminars and other events: these seminars are mostly related to issues that concern the inmates in his life inside and outside the prison like alcoholism, drugs and AIDS. They have a preventive nature.

Because of their background, technicians believe that these factors all together should contribute to the rehabilitation of the inmate, although they cannot guarantee this. This lack of guarantee is one of the reasons for the powerless situation of the technical group within the Service, as expressed in the following statement given by a technician in Chapecó Prison:

"we work in an organisation with conflicting objectives. How is it possible to discipline, punish, and at the same time to give individuals moral conditions for life outside? As a technician I want to believe that it is possible at least to improve the situation, but we cannot prove it. We do not have any proof that our work is able to re-habilitate someone and it causes some lack of credit in our job. However, the directors of the establishments and also at Government level like to say that they are re-habilitating people. But for me it is just the formal discourse."

Some of the technicians interviewed in both prisons studied stated that the lack of a formal career for them in the Service does not allow continuity in the

work, which also jeopardises long term projects aiming at rehabilitation, since they are subject to moves among different organisations in the public sector in the State.

Training was also a factor strongly emphasised by technicians as a component of quality definition. Lack of proper training was then a factor referred to by the technicians as contributing to the difficulties in carrying out rehabilitation work. There is no specific course for people who work in the prisons. The exception occurs in relation to prison officers who receive an initial training on security matters and on some legal procedures. There is an initial course for those who are commencing their activities in the Service. But there is no periodic and systematic training. Moreover, the preparatory course is questioned by the technicians who argue that the officers receive the training in the Academy of Civil Police, in accordance with its guidelines and in the future will perform a totally different job.

Sporadically, the technicians take part in courses outside the organisation but it is not common, due to financial constraints as well as the difficulty in getting permission to leave the job.

An appropriate physical structure was also referred to as an important element in the perceptions of quality in a prison for technicians. Not only for them, but also for governors, a good physical structure in the prisons enables the development of rehabilitation activities providing appropriate space and adequate security, which is a necessary aspect of this kind of organisation.

Technicians normally find themselves in a dual situation related to their work in prisons in general. At BPS-SC it is the same. Inmates do not like the technicians for both technical and personal reasons. Concerning technical reasons the inmates find it difficult to trust most of the technicians and tell their real problems since the same technicians will be part of a committee that will analyse the inmates requests for progression in their sentences. The inmates believe that a great degree of openness could jeopardise the process. Also the inmates do not like to see themselves as sick persons among their peers.

The prison officers are also in constant conflict with the technicians as they see rehabilitation activities developed by the technicians as contributing to an increase in the number and the stress of their own tasks. They argue that the inmates will be walking through the prison, therefore demanding more attention to security matters. Moreover, they are anxious over the fact that the inmates will be talking to the technicians over whom they do not have total control. They also have concerns because they do not know the content of the talks between, for example, psychologists and the prisoners.

In this sense, technicians are in a context of power struggles as the weakest part. But, at the same time, their performance is not assessed in relation to the overall performance of the organisation, which is normally related to custodial objectives. Therefore the group of technicians lose their stimulus to work and start to perform their tasks on a daily routine, following the basic norms of their hierarchical superiors.

6.4.2.3. The Prison Officers

Prison officers in Santa Catarina State are required to have had primary school education.

Prison officers operations are those aiming to guarantee the accomplishment of the sentence which determines that the future inmate must be under one of the regimes offered by the prison (closed or semi-open). They are also related to the provision of food, to keep discipline and security in the environment, and other activities related to custody. Their perception of quality in a prison is summarised in Table 14.

Table 14: Significant Components of Quality Definition Among Prison Officers at Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons.

Groups	Components of Quality Definition	
	Florianópolis Prison	Chapecó Prison
Prison Officers	good custody punishment	good custody punishment security

The prison officers' view of quality in a prison is mainly related to the maintenance of good custody. Part of the custodial operation can be classified as administrative tasks like, for example, the provision of food and uniforms, laundry, mail, etc. On the other hand, the operation that mobilises most of the efforts and attention of all individuals who work in a prison are the ones related to the guarantee of the imprisonment with the decrease or even total annihilation of the prisoners' power of action, always in an environment of very rigid discipline. All movements of the inmates have to be foreseen, calculated and controlled. An example was provided by a prison officer at Florianópolis Prison as follows:

"when medical assistance is required for an inmate under the closed regime he has to require this from the nearest prison officer. When the assistance is confirmed and scheduled, the inmate is called. The security service has to make sure that there is only a specific number of prisoners in the social welfare services in the organisation at the same time (3 in Florianópolis Prison and 2 in Chapecó Prison - note from the author) for security reasons. Also, before arriving in the part of the building where the assistances are performed the inmate passes through a series of locked gates that are opened by prison officers notified beforehand. When the inmate passes through the last gate he receives handcuffs and he passes through a rigorous physical examination. When the medical assistance is finished the same procedure is repeated and the prisoner returns to his cell.

In the custody and security operations it is taken for granted that at any moment a prisoner or a group of prisoners can and will put into practice a plan to escape. Moreover there are concerns that rebellions, fights and other factors that put at risk the discipline and order in the establishment will occur.

In order to guarantee an organisational routine free from incidents, it is intended that all time scales are thoroughly planned, and that officers try to avoid movement of prisoners within the organisation as much as possible. Moreover, there are constant checks in the cells, accommodations, and workplaces. Parents and other visitors pass through the same procedure of verification of their belongings and physical examination. Group formation is strictly forbidden when the inmates are in recreation time.

The Military Police who are responsible for the external security of the prison sometimes perform some training, including physical activities, target practice and others, to remind the prisoners of their presence.

According to Thompson (1980) there is a conflict between the theoretical and the practical objectives to be executed by the officers. In terms of theoretical objectives they are seen as agents for effective prisoner rehabilitation, that is, there is a component of re-education in their activities as well as the security ones. Most of the officers, however, concentrate solely on security because they argue that the re-education of prisoners is for people specialised in the subject, who can say and think whatever they want without sanction for any mistakes that they would possibly make. Thompson (1980) also points out that the target of the prison officer is punishment, intimidation, suffering and regeneration. They see the last as a result of the first ones. In this sense, their arguments are basically that the prisoners have to be locked up, and have to walk facing the floor as a symbol of respect. Movements from one part of the prison to another for treatments is considered to be something that does not contribute to anything but the disruption of the order of the establishment.

The emphasis on the security aspect of their activities is clearly seen in the interviews conducted and other documents about the officers' activities. In a document about the procedures of the officers made by the Chief of Security at Chapecó Prison, almost all procedures stress the importance of items like attention at work, discipline, security and rigour. The only item that could be regarded as related to rehabilitation, at least indirectly, is "to always act with respect and politeness to contribute to a good work environment." (Penitenciária de Chapecó 1993:2)

In a survey conducted by the group of technicians of Florianópolis Prison about the prison officers, they found out that the level of knowledge that the prison officers have about their functions is reasonable (Penitenciária de Florianópolis 1992). It is considered that the lack of training is the most predominant factor for the great number of those who did not have any idea about what their jobs were about. It is also clear that most of the prison officers identify themselves more with activities related to surveillance and discipline. The secondary group of activities the results of this survey show, are the ones related to re-education. Most of them, however, believe that they are re-educating the prisoner. According to the interviews conducted, re-education in the mind of the prison officers is linked to surveillance and punishment as illustrated by the following statements given by prison officers in both prisons studied:

"Our responsibility is security. It is to assure that nobody will escape. If they escape... outside of the prison limits, we do not have anything to do with it. Out of the prison we have no responsibility whatsoever."

"The officer is a teacher, but we cannot punch the prisoners anymore. This administration made our work worse and in some sense made it better for these bastard vagabonds."

There are many controversies about the nature of prison officers' tasks in relation to the objectives of the prison. At BPS-SC, prison officers are a minority when compared to the number of inmates and they have to maintain control of a large

number of people kept there against their will. Prison officers need the means to guarantee the fulfilment of the norms and rules established. In this sense they are forced to choose between the enforcement of the organisation's rules, which would put them in a tense situation with the prisoners, or to soften law enforcement, which could cause security problems to the prison. The way officers found to manage this situation in the BPS-SC is the same as described by Thompson (1980). Prison officers have a series of limited rewards that they use to benefit those who collaborate with them (e.g. ignoring certain faults committed by the "collaborative" ones).

In a study of Brazilian prisons Freitas (quoted in Hoffman 1992) analyses the conflict within the organisations and points out three factors that contribute to stabilise the routines between prison officers and the inmates: 1) hierarchical and moral limits (although they are never clear); 2) the degree of tolerance of infractions; 3) the degree of interdependence between the prison officers and the inmates. These factors act in a dynamic way and also receive the influence of other internal and external factors (e.g. influence of other groups within the organisation, like, for instance, the group of managers). The theoretical and practical duality of the work of officers results in it being mostly restricted to surveillance and punishment activities. These activities conflict in some of its operational issues with the re-habilitation ones.

The next section discusses the rationale behind the perception of quality of each group within the prisons.

6.4.3. Rationale of Quality Definition and Customer Identification

The results of the clustering analysis of significant components of quality definition in the two prisons studied enables the identification of the rationale behind the quality perceptions of each group within the organisations, as shown in Table 15.

Table 15: Rationale of Quality Definition at Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons

Groups	Rationale of Quality Definition	
	Florianópolis Prison	Chapecó Prison
Governors	legalist managerialist professional (custody) professional (rehabilitation)	legalist professional (custody) professional (rehabilitation)
Technicians	professional (rehabilitation) managerialist	professional (rehabilitation) managerialist
Prison Officers	professional (custody)	professional (custody)

Among governors there were a variety of rationales identified. This is explained by the lack of homogeneity over the definition of quality among this group as shown in Table 12 (subsection 6.4.2.1 of this chapter).

The legalist rationale is related to a view of quality linked to the accomplishment of legal procedures regarding prisoners' rights. As stated before, in both prisons the DIAP's guidelines in relation to the observance of prisoners rights are strongly followed. It is due to the history of the Service which was originally created as part of the Legal System in the country, and which maintains this main characteristic, even though it is now part of the Police and Security System. Moreover public administration in the country has a strong legalist character with a great amount of laws and legal rules determining the performance of public sector organisations. In the Prison Service the Law of Penal Execution is the main guideline for the Service administration. It is also due to the strong commitment and supervision to the DIAP's Director with the aim of following this aspect of the legal procedures established.

Professional rationales related to custody and rehabilitation were also identified among governors in both prisons. The rehabilitation side of the

professional rationale was identified in the discourse of the two Governors for Health, Education and Social Promotion. They are both social workers and such rationale is linked to the nature of their professions and their objectives within the prisons. The custodial dimension of the professional rationale was identified by almost all other governors. It can also be related to their backgrounds, since most of them had past experience as police delegates. The following statement given by a governor in Chapecó Prison supports the above argument:

the main focus of my administration is first of all to update all prisoners' benefits and rights. The prisoner has to have all his benefits updated. If he has the right to an open cell or parole, for example, the Judge is who decides if he is going to get it or not. But all his requests for the benefit have to be updated. Second: discipline. There has to be a strong discipline to keep a normal environment within the establishment."

The managerialist rationale is present only among governors at Florianópolis Prison. It is related to the need for financial independence in order to provide more flexibility for action towards organisational improvements. The Governor in Charge of Florianópolis Prison has some administrative experience and this seems to account for the identification of this rationale among officers in the organisation.

As stated before, among technicians a professional rationale linked to rehabilitation purposes was identified, due to the nature of their profession. Some managerial concern was noted, particularly related to the need of training and to the need for a career plan. However, even this kind of managerial preoccupation is primarily related to the achievement of rehabilitation objectives.

Prison officers demonstrate a rationale based on the history and the nature of their profession, as well as the technicians. In this case, their profession has strong historical links with custody as the main purpose of a prison.

In terms of definition of the customers of the prison there is a consensus among the three groups examined, as shown in Table 16.

Table 16: Customer Identification at Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons

Groups	Customer Definition	
	Florianópolis Prison	Chapecó Prison
Governors	general public	general public
Technicians	general public	general public
Prison Officers	general public	general public

There is a consensus among all groups in both prisons studied that the general public is the customer of the Service. It seems to represent the absence of customer definition as a managerial issue related to quality within organisation, since the BPS-SC is not involved in any type of formal quality management programme.

The general public was identified by the interviews in two basic ways. Some of the interviewees referred to the general public in terms of the society as a whole. Others referred to the specific part of the community that performed commercial transactions with the prisons, in the form of suppliers of raw materials or as the consumers of the output of prisoners production. There was no reference at all to customers in the sense that is expressed in the quality management literature and no connection was made between customers and quality in the prisons.

6.4.4. Dynamics of Quality Initiatives: Objectives and Power in the BPS-SC

Three main perceptions of quality were identified in the BPS-SC that, in this specific case, are linked to objectives of three different groups within the organisation: a) re-habilitation; b) custody; and c) accomplishment of legal procedures.

Re-habilitation and custody are related to the objectives and operations of the group of technicians and the group of prisons officers respectively. As said before, there is a constant conflict between these two objectives since the activities regarding one are said to impact negatively on the efficiency of the other.

Although the prison has both objectives of custody and re-habilitation, there is a clear emphasis on custodial ones. The objectives of re-habilitation are constrained by many security matters. According to Hoffmann (1992: 128)

"it has to be noticed that even having a number of activities to be performed established in advance, they are not developed with the same degree of importance. The activities related to re-habilitation, for instance, receive a series of restrictions. They face limitations regarding time schedules, space, number of appointments and the effort of others in this activities are to be put forward. On the other hand, regarding security activities, everybody has the obligation to take unconditional care, even when it does not belong to the sector that is specifically responsible for them".

This is related to the fact that there are no major arguments concerning the success or failure of the therapeutic action, in contrast to the possible failures in the security operations. For the latter, there is even the possibility of a formal enquiry and legal prosecution.

As Hoffmann (1992) points out, and as was described in section 6.4.2.3 of this chapter, the extent of rules is significant in order to keep the organisation under strong control. The main concern is to guarantee the success of security tasks. The daily activities need to be developed in such a way that the period of the inmates' sentence cannot suffer from rebellions, escapes and other alterations of the

organisational order. The activities of the prisoners and also of the employees are determined by a great number of rules that aim to guarantee predictability and control. These rules are both written and un-written. Un-written rules are normally established by the prison officers as long-standing traditions without which security and order of the prison would be at risk. An example of this is a norm established by the officers in Chapecó Prison regarding classes and teachers. There are two teachers in Chapecó Prison and the Chief of Security has decreed that if one of them does not go to work, the other cannot as well, for security reasons. He argues that it requires much more effort to guarantee the safety of one woman (both teachers are women) than of two. Another example is that although the technicians argue that it would be better to have classes in the morning, the officers have decided that classes should be in the afternoon. There is a constant conflict of interests between these two groups and it seems clear that the officers have stronger power to impose their practices which represent, to a certain degree, their quality perception for the organisation.

There is another important point stated by the Chief of Security in Florianópolis Prison. Although there are formal written rules in the prison they are not followed and are substituted by non-written (without formal character) ones established by the officers themselves, especially within the galleries. For example, if there has to be a written sanction against one of the inmates, the officer will sometimes use his power to negotiate the annihilation of this sanction. A written sanction implies the loss of some of the days that the prisoner had gained to decrease his sentence as a benefit for work or good behaviour. The officer instead applies a physical sanction (the use of violence), or cuts some benefits like cigarettes or television in the cell for one shift and does not register the sanction. The Chief of Security argues that often the prisoner accepts and even prefers this attitude. For the officers, it is perhaps a way to relieve some of the more immediate tension of his work and his own private life outside the organisation, and at the same time it is a more tangible way to feel and show that he still has power. It represents the misuse

of norms and rules to enhance the power of action and establish a relationship of dominance.

According to the Chief of Security of Florianópolis Prison punishment is regularly carried out by the prison officer because the view is that some of the faults committed are seen as personal disputes between prisoner and officer. Then, in this sense, it is better if it does not go to the written faults book because this kind of punishment impacts badly on the benefits that a prisoner could have. The Chief of Security also stated that, in his opinion, some of the punishments should be strengthened in order to maintain security that is not very good nowadays because of the small number of officers.

It is argued by the technicians that this kind of behaviour damages all the re-educational processes that they are trying to implement and that nobody else in the organisation is able, or wants to do anything to correct the situation. It is important to note the great significance attributed to the Chief of Security who is subordinated to the Governor for Penal Executions. All the activities that have direct or indirect relation or that could end up in some contact with the inmates have to have the agreement of the Chief of Security. It is also important to note that although he is subordinated to one specific governor he normally has free access to the Governor in Charge. In this sense, the security sector ended up having great influence on time schedules, routines, disciplines, number of assistance, movements of the inmates within the prison and the other employees as well, in most of the organisation, and it included activities that would not normally have been of their concern in the first place. This fact is normally sufficient reason for conflict with other sectors, as can be seen throughout this chapter. As one technician at Chapecó Prison has pointed out

"the priorities given to avoid escapes and to the maintenance of order seems to direct all the attention and all movements of the officers for those objectives, which contributes to the weakness of any other objective that the prison could have".

Although there is an emphasis on the custodial objectives and operations and on the power of the prison officers in both prisons, there is also a difference in the degree of control of the officers' actions by the management in both prisons.

As stated before, in Chapecó Prison there seems to be a more similar approach between management and officers, especially between the General Director and the Chief of Security. In one of the interviews, the General Director stated that the Chief of Security in Chapecó Prison is still in this position despite all the pressures against him because of his (the governor's) personal influence. The Chief of Security is considered a very rigid person who interferes in other sectors, particularly those related to treatment and rehabilitation. He is considered to be the cause of some conflicts between the sectors in the organisation and between the prison and external organisations, like human rights ones. On the other hand, the General Director considers that the way he acts is very important for the maintenance of discipline and order within the establishment.

In Florianópolis Prison the tension between management and officers is greater, mainly because some of the decisions made by the general director are considered by the officers as being too supportive of the prisoners. This would put them in a delicate situation concerning security issues. But it is, in fact, an issue of power. The following statement given by the Governor in Charge of Florianópolis prison supports this argument:

"When I arrived here there was a great amount of complaints among the inmates. They were saying that many of them were punched far more than they deserve (they think they deserve to be punched sometimes). Others used to say that they were punched for no reason at all. I stopped all of that. I started to open legal enquires and today we have some officers being prosecuted in court. The prison is calm nowadays, but on the other hand my situation among the officers is worse now, because I took some of their power. They thought that they had the right to practice physical aggression against the inmates, but they do not. It is not legal. The prisoner is in the prison as a punishment for his crime and that is it. The officers do not think like this. They think they deserve more. Last year the officers tried to make a rebellion among the inmates, that is, they deliberately gave all conditions for a rebellion to happen but none of the inmates wanted to, because the situation is better for them now."

One of the officers at Florianópolis Prison stated that:

"the power of the officer was decreased by the actual administration of the prison and it is causing discontentment."

It is important to note that the previous Governor in Charge of Florianópolis Prison is the actual Governor in Charge of Chapecó Prison, where management works more closely to the officers. One of the informants in Florianópolis Prison gave a statement that illustrates this point:

"our last Director had great familiarity with the officers. He gave great support to them, and he was a very secure person in terms of order and discipline within the organisation. All the employees were acting in a very disciplinary way. The actual one is a good person, but he is too far from the employees. He is very punitive and there is no dialogue between him and the employees."

The power of action of the officers has also been restricted in both organisations by the action of human right organisations like the organisation that represents the lawyers in the country (OAB - Organisation of Brazilian Lawyers), some groups of judges within the legal system and others. This perhaps shows that the civilian society, or at least part of it, had started to become worried and had begun to debate the role of the prison, especially after the dimension of the incidents in the last ten years in the prison service in Brazil (e.g. *Massacre de Carandiru* [Massacre of Carandiru Penitentiary] as it became known, in São Paulo State, and the increase amount of drug related issues in the prisons).

Although the power of the officers has been limited by such articulations, internal and external to the Prison Service, they still remain the most powerful group in the system. Therefore, in the daily activities within the prisons, officers impose their practices towards the achievement of their objectives, namely custody. Thus objectives express the quality perception of this group.

The first reason for this situation is the greater importance attributed to custodial objectives in relation to re-habilitation ones. This still seems to be legitimated by society as a whole.

The second is the more specific issue of the public sector management characteristics in Brazil. It was expected that the management of the prison would provide some strategic view for the organisations. This strategic view would provide more clear definitions about the role of each operation within the organisation. But the inertia of the management of the prisons is due to the nature of the governors' positions, and lack of investment in the Service.

The position of Governor in the Service is political. As stated before, it causes vulnerability for its occupants in terms of power. There is no long-term commitment with the Service since they all know that in a period no longer than four years they will not be in that position anymore. The officers are always there and they are regarded as the ones "who know" the service best, which gives them greater power.

The political nature of the governor position is also responsible for the general lack of managerial vision. People are chosen for these positions according to criteria that satisfy political requirements. Thus, those who are in these positions usually do not have any managerial training, which contributes to a view of the Service only in legal terms. It seems that all issues regarding strategic decisions are limited to legal procedures.

The lack of investment in the Service contributes to inhibiting any attempt to run the prison in a more managerialist way, as noticed in the case of Florianópolis Prison's Governor in Charge (see section 5.4.2.1 of this chapter).

The very political nature of the high hierarchical levels in the Service imposes a vision of quality highly, if not totally, related to the legal aspects of the Service. In the case of DIAP, by the time of the field-work this view was related to the attendance of prisoners' legal rights. It was easily achieved since it was not

directly related to the activities of the other groups that also compose the organisational arena within the Service, and who are more closely related to views of quality that reflect the conflicting objectives of the prison.

6.5. Discussion and Conclusion

This chapter analyses quality initiatives within the BPS-SC, taking into consideration the concepts of operative objectives (Perrow 1978) and organisational groups. It was argued earlier (chapter 2, section 2.4) that in organisations that are not involved in a formal quality management programme and have a problematic definition of customers, quality initiatives can be understood to a certain degree through the identification of the operative objectives of different organisational groups. The powerful group as well as institutional pressures will determine the quality philosophy of the organisation.

Three main groups were identified as responsible for administrative functions in the prisons studied, that is, governors, technicians and prison officers. The results suggest that there is a degree of correlation between objectives and quality definition among organisational groups. Quality perceptions of each group seem to vary in accordance to their specific objectives within the organisation. The results also support the suggestion that changes in organisational groups, in terms of power positions, will produce changes in the emphasis of organisational objectives (Scott 1992; Carvalho 1993; Mintzberg 1989; Clegg and Dunkerley 1980; Perrow 1978; Galbraith 1967; Drucker 1961) and that these changes, in turn, will cause changes in the overall quality philosophy of the organisation.

In terms of quality, the governors have a variety of visions, emphasising the DIAP's general guidelines, as well as objectives of custody and rehabilitation. The lack of consensus among the governors towards a quality definition can be

explained by: a) their very different backgrounds; b) the lack of strategic vision and action; and c) by the vulnerability of the positions, since these positions in the organisations are filled according to political criteria, as also noted by Rago (1994) and Swiss (1992).

For the technicians, quality is primarily related to the re-habilitation objectives of the prison. An organisation that offers a quality service in this sense, therefore, would provide the necessary conditions to recuperate and re-educate the inmates for their return to society through technical work (psychological help, social work, formal education, etc.). The results of this research suggest that the implementation of this vision of quality is constrained mainly by: a) the emphasis given to custodial objectives within the Service; and b) by social legitimacy of custody as being the main objective of the prison.

Prison officers' perception of quality in a prison is related to custodial objectives. Although they sometimes argue that they act as agents for re-education, it is always done through custodial practices.

These three groups interact within the organisation, trying to impose their own objectives and therefore their own quality perception. Prison officers are the most successful concerning the organisations daily activities. Their success is measured not only by the extent to which they are able to keep a large number of prisoners from escape or any other statistical measure, but by the legitimacy of their social role. These results sustain Scott's (1992) argument that social legitimacy is an important element in the setting of organisational goals.

The vision of quality of the DIAP is a strong element of quality definition and in the overall quality philosophy in both prisons. It is a legalist approach to quality with emphasis on the aspects that do not interfere strongly in the prison officers' daily routine, therefore avoiding conflict. These results are consistent with Carvalho's (1993) findings, and with Clegg and Dunkerley's (1980) and Georgiou's (1973) argument that the objectives of an organisational group can be modified and

limited by its interaction with other organisational groups. Since the DIAP has formal power over the prisons, its own philosophy of quality is the one that appears formally and publicly as being the quality image of the Service as a whole. In the BPS-SC this image is related to the respect and fulfilment of all prisoners' legal rights.

Chapter 7: Quality in the Brazilian Prison Service - SC and the Scottish Prison Service: a Comparison

Two different approaches and dynamics of quality management initiatives were presented in chapters 4 and 5 regarding two different organisational contexts. This chapter compares these approaches to quality management and discusses them in relation to their specific institutional contexts.

Although it is likely that institutional contexts are not the only elements shaping organisational structures, it is believed that they are important in the cases studied, not only for shaping but also for constituting structures (Scott 1995) and, as indicated before, quality perceptions .

7.1. Quality Definition, Rationale, Customer Identification and Organisational Groups

In order to proceed with a comparison between quality definition in the BPS-SC and in the SPS, the significant components of quality definition in each prison in their specific context were aggregated. Therefore, the components of quality definition presented in Table 17 relating to the BPS-SC, represent Florianópolis and Chapecó Prisons, and those relating to the SPS represent Perth and Dungavel Prisons. Such components for each prison service were submitted to a clustering process in order to aggregate the results previously shown in Table 2 (chapter 5) and in Tables 12, 13 and 14 (chapter 6). The same procedure was adopted to get the results shown later in this chapter (Tables 18 and 19).

Table 17: Quality Definition and Organisational Groups in the BPS-SC and the SPS

Groups	Components of Quality Definition	
	BPS-SC	SPS
Governors	prisoners legal rights good physical structure security work activities (custody) work activities (rehabilitation) financial autonomy re-education specialised technicians training discipline self maintenance	top management commitment customer-driven approach empowerment clear and effective communication training clear targets (strategic planning) competitiveness (cost effectiveness) quality circles and group activities do things right first time responsibility for action one-to-one relationship treat people well work close to the community provide good services human relation exercise good custody
Technicians	training work activities (professional) education effective social work career for technicians physical structure small size local prisoners security	good standard of life for prisoners treat people well provide opportunities for rehabilitation
Prison Officers	good custody punishment security	good custody one-to-one relationship family life approach professionalism delegation provide good services do things right first time

The element of quality definition mostly emphasised by governors in the BPS-SC was the observance of prisoners' legal rights. As said before (chapter 5), this occurred due to the strong legalist tradition of the Brazilian public administration in general, and of the BPS-SC in particular, and also due to the personal influence and

tight control of the DIAP's (organisation responsible for running the Prison Service in Santa Catarina State) Director. SPS-SC is a very centralised organisation. The high degree of centralisation, combined with the fact that the governors' positions are filled in accordance to DIAP's Director choice, accounts for the strong power of the latter over governors in prisons. During the time of the field-work, the DIAP's Director was a lawyer who strongly believed that the legal system was the main source of any managerial activities within the Prison Service. Therefore, his background is an important factor to consider as an explanation of the strong emphasis on law enforcement as a determinant element of quality in the BPS-SC.

Governors in the SPS mostly emphasise managerial factors as being the main characteristic of quality definition within the Service. Although there are some differences regarding each prison in Scotland, they are both subjected to a formal quality management programme originating from the SPS Headquarters. The SPS quality programme emphasises the commitment of top management to quality initiatives, identification of customers, empowerment of employees, training and strategic planning, among other managerial factors (as detailed in chapter 5), as essential elements of quality definition. These elements were all stressed by governors in the SPS prisons. Although SPS is more decentralised than BPS-SC, managerial initiatives on quality, as strategic orientations for the Service, have to be followed. The results of such initiatives are controlled by the SPS Headquarters, particularly in relation to the targets and the performance measures set out in the strategic plan for each prison.

The differences regarding the prisons in the same institutional context are limited to the way they implement the general guidelines of the respective headquarters. In Brazilian prisons the results show no difference in relation to the observance of legal rights of the prisoner. Differences were observed, however, in other aspects of quality definition not directly related to DIAP's guidelines, but to the emphasis put on organisational activities related to the organisational objectives of

custody and rehabilitation. In the SPS, on the other hand, the results show differences in the way the two prisons interpret and apply the SPS general guidelines. This fact can be explained by the higher level of decentralisation of the SPS in relation to the BPS-SC, as well as by structural characteristics of each prison (size and objectives) studied, as explained in chapter 5.

Elements of quality definition related to custody and rehabilitation were observed in the perceptions of the governors' in both contexts. They emphasised rehabilitation objectives and activities, although custodial ones were also mentioned as important components of quality in a prison service. While in the SPS the emphasis on rehabilitation was noticed to be part of the formal quality programme, in the BPS-SC it was noticed to remain on the level of formal discourse, therefore having little or no effect on the organisational daily routines.

The formal approach to quality in the SPS comprises a new image of the prisoner as a responsible person, as stated in the document called "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS 1990). It emphasises then rehabilitation as an objective of the Service. Rehabilitation was also seen as a way to decrease tension within the prisons caused by the strong emphasis given to custody in the 1980s and before. Nevertheless the role of security was also stressed due to the nature of the organisation. Moreover, governors in the SPS seem to understand that it is important to maintain a balance between custody and rehabilitation. This understanding appears to be reflected in the organisational daily routines.

In the BPS-SC governors affirm to emphasise rehabilitation objectives more than custodial ones as components of quality definition in the Prison Service. However, data collected through interviews, field-observation and documentary analysis show clear evidence that rehabilitation remains in the field of formal discourse. Organisational objectives are mainly related to custodial activities and the maintenance of daily administrative routines established throughout the organisational life, as detailed in chapter 5.

Technicians in both countries relate their quality perceptions to the activities of their professions. Technicians' professions are mostly related to rehabilitation purposes in the form of therapeutic action, preparation for release and further assistance after release. The only significant difference noted between technicians in the BPS-SC and in the SPS is that in the Brazilian case they show a higher degree of managerial preoccupation. This fact could be explained by the negative effects that a lack of strategic action in managerial terms in the BPS-SC has over their activities, as detailed in chapter 5. On the other hand, the very objective and managerial nature of the SPS administration does not seem to affect the work of technicians significantly, as described in chapter 6. It clearly specifies the role of every position and function within the Service.

The group of prison officers, as well as governors, show a great degree of difference in the two countries. Prison officers in the BPS-SC present similar views in their perceptions of quality compared to those of the group of old officers in the SPS. They relate quality in the prison service to the custodial role of the prison, that is, security and punishment. It has to be noticed, however, that punishment was quoted explicitly by Brazilian officers while Scottish officers preferred to refer to it indirectly through emphasis on security and good custody. A possible explanation for this could be the stronger power of the Scottish Headquarters in relation to the Brazilian Headquarters (DIAP) to impose a tighter control over a whole set of organisational daily routines.

New officers in Scotland differ from both Brazilian officers and old Scottish officers. They relate quality in the Prison Service to managerial techniques (empowerment through delegation, professionalism, etc.). This perception is not present among Brazilian officers since it is considered to be the result of the extensive training programme introduced by the SPS, as part of the quality programme, aiming at preparing officers for a new overall perception of the Service as well as at diminishing resistance against change (chapter 6).

There are differences in quality perceptions in both the Brazilian and the Scottish contexts in all organisational groups studied. However, the major differences were found among the group of governors and prison officers. The rationale of quality definition for each group makes the distinctions and similarities between both organisational sites clearer, as show in Table 18.

Table 18: Quality Rationale and Organisational Groups in the BPS-SC and the SPS

Groups	Quality Rationale	
	BPS-SC	SPS
Governors	legalist professional (custody) professional (rehabilitation) managerialist	managerialist professional (custody) professional (rehabilitation) humanist
Technicians	professional (rehabilitation) managerialist	professional (rehabilitation) humanist
Prison Officers	professional (custody)	professional (custody) managerialist humanist

The strong emphasis on legal procedures leads to a legalist rationale as the main one behind governors' quality definition in the BPS-SC. This originates from the also strong legalist character of the Brazilian public administration. In the Scottish case the emphasis is on a managerialist quality definition which implies, therefore, a managerialist rationale, whereas this kind of rationale of quality definition in the BPS-SC is limited to the personal vision of the Governor in Charge of one of the prisons studied. The humanist rationale is present only in the Scottish case, as described in Chapters 5 and 4 respectively. The other two kinds of rationale

are directly related to the objectives of the organisation, that is, custody and rehabilitation.

The rationale of technicians' definition of quality is professional, towards the achievement of rehabilitation objectives in both the Brazilian and the Scottish Prison Services. A managerialist rationale was identified among Brazilian technicians as a way of enabling them to achieve their objectives as an organisational group (chapter 6). A humanist rationale was identified only in the SPS, particularly in Dungavel Prison due to its nature (Chapter 4).

Officers in the BPS-SC and old officers in the SPS defined quality mainly through the performance of activities related to custody. Therefore, a professional rationale linked to custody was identified. In the SPS a humanist and a managerialist rationale was identified among the group of new officers, which is explained particularly by the intensive training programme developed by the SPS (see chapter 4 and SPS n/d).

In terms of customer identification it was observed that in the SPS it was consistent with the rationale behind quality definition of each organisational group. Nevertheless, in the BPS-SC the general public was quoted unanimously by all groups as being the "customers" of the Prison Service, as shown in Table 19.

Table 19: Customer Identification and Organisational Groups in the BPS-SC and the SPS

Groups	Customer Definition	
	BPS-SC	SPS
Governors	general public	general public prisoners staff
Technicians	general public	general public
Prison Officers	general public	general public prisoners

As demonstrated in Table 19, the general public as customers was a category also identified by all organisational groups in the SPS. The category "general public" in Table 19 comprises prisoners' families, a distinction that was made by most organisational groups in Dungavel Prison. The main difference between the BPS-SC and the SPS is that governors and new officers in the SPS have defined prisoners as customers, following the managerialist rationale of their quality definition. In the same sense, governors in the SPS have also identified the staff as a customer group.

Based on the results of this research described and discussed throughout chapters 5, 6 and 7, and on the results of works by authors like Rago (1994), Dawson and Palmer (1993), Hill (1991a; 1991b), Dawson and Webb (1989) among others, it seems possible to affirm that organisational groups are an important factor to consider in the study of quality within organisations. This research shows that quality perceptions and definitions can vary among different organisational groups as well as among similar groups in different institutional contexts. Based on the results shown in Tables 17, 18 and 19, the next section describes and discusses the overall quality image of the BPS-SC and the SPS. It also argues that the overall quality image of the organisations studied are determined both by power struggles between organisational groups and by characteristics of the institutional context.

7.2. The Overall Quality Image of the BPS-SP and the SPS: Power and Institutional Context

Although different organisational groups perceive quality differently within the organisations, one perception, or a combination of perceptions, is established as the general quality image of the organisation. By general quality image of the organisation is understood the philosophy and initiatives that the organisation shows

through its formal documents and practices. The results demonstrated in Table 20 show the general quality image of the BPS-SC and the SPS.

Table 20: Overall Quality Image of the BPS-SC and the SPS

Overall Quality Image of the BPS-SC and the SPS	
Organisations	Overall Quality Image
BPS-SC	legalist professional (custody)
SPS	managerialist

In the BPS-SC the general quality image is characterised by a legalist rationale and an emphasis on the custodial role of the organisation. In the SPS the overall quality has a managerialist rationale.

The emphasis on legalism and custody in the BPS-SC as the main rationale of quality definition can be explained by the institutional context in which the organisation is established, as well as by power disputes among organisational groups.

Until 1930, the Brazilian public administration was influenced by a strong legal tradition, that is, an essentially juridical system based upon a legalistic tradition. This characteristic has its source in Portugal, France and Germany, and is consistent with the strong European influence on the formation and development of Brazilian society. In this period the main objective of legislative and administrative action was the law *per se*, as a kind of dogma. It was believed that social reality should be adapted to the law, in most cases, based on models imported from Europe (Sander 1977).

During the 1930s there was a movement of reform and change in public administration, this time influenced by ideas originating from in the United States of America. The focus of attention shifted from legalism to managerialism, that is, the application of administrative principles to the public services. Administrative principles, at that time, were the statements of scientific management. "There is an emphasis on the normative and process nature of administration and a generalised belief in a moral reform of the diligent elites, of the managers, and of the public services in general as a way to solve Brazilian administrative problems" (Sander 1977:33). This focus on management prerogatives condemned the interference of politics in administrative matters, nepotism and recruitment of inappropriate human resources for the public service. In the late 1980s new managerial ideas based on concepts like quality, excellence and flexibility led the Government to create the PBQP (Brazilian Programme of Quality and Productivity [Brazil 1990]) with the objective of enhancing the quality of public services and the competitiveness of Brazilian industries abroad.

In this sense one could expect an approach to the management of the public sector more similar to the Scottish managerialist approach. Nevertheless it did not occur in the case studied, as the results on Table 20 show. A more institutional framework (Scott and Christensen 1995; Scott and Meyer 1994; Meyer and Scott 1992) to the understanding of Brazilian administrative practices helps to explain the results of this research.

Two main characteristics of the institutional context of the BPS-SC seem to explain maintenance of the legalist and the custodial approach to quality despite the rise of a managerialist discourse in the counties' administration: formalism (Ramos 1983, Riggs 1964) and patrimonialism (Faoro 1989; Cardoso 1977).

As described in chapter 3, the way the legal system was historically established in Brazil has a strong formalistic character (Faoro, 1989; Schwartzman 1988), that is, a gap between what is formally established and the real practice.

The legalist character of the BPS-SC is evident according to the findings of this research, since most of its managerial practices are fundamentally based on the accomplishment of law requirements. There is very little managerial concern *per se* in terms of running the Service efficiently. The main focus of the Prison Service administration is on the juridical and legal procedures of the laws that regulate the Service, mainly the Law of Penal Executions. These aspects are related to prisoners' rights such as requests for freedom and requests for changes in the regime of incarceration. The DIAP's Director stated that this was the main focus of his administration as well as his vision of a quality prison system.

The formalistic nature of this approach can be observed when the fulfilment of governor' positions in the Service is taken into account. Although the Law of Penal Executions establishes that the general director of a prison can be chosen from among different professionals, such as psychologists, social workers, sociologists, managers and lawyers, most of the positions are taken by lawyers. Exceptions are normally made in relation to the Governors of Health, Education and Social Promotion who are, in most of the cases, social workers. Moreover, the lawyers who work in the Service have in almost all cases spent some time in their professional careers working as delegates of police, a position that requires a degree in law. This fact indicates the links between the management of the Prison Service and the legal system, as well as the importance attributed to custodial objectives in the Service.

The emphasis given to the custodial aspects of the Service is an interesting characteristic regarding the distance between governors' formal discourse and their day-to-day practices. While among governors one can observe a discourse towards rehabilitation, their professional background shows the importance attributed to custody for those responsible for running the Service. The interviews conducted demonstrated that at Governmental level the discourse is towards rehabilitation of people. But in operational terms there is a generalised lack of credit attributed to the

work of the technicians who actually perform the work of rehabilitation. The rehabilitation objectives are limited to the formal discourse.

The legalism limiting most of the activities in the Prison Service seems to be a strong element of formalism in BPS-SC, since the laws seem to prescribe things that the organisational structure and the human and financial resources allocated to the system do not support. As the data described and discussed in chapter 5 indicates, although a series of treatment programmes and activities are prescribed there are no compatible resources allocated for that, which leads some technicians to perform different tasks or even leave the Service.

In a formalistic environment it seems that the fulfilment of few legal aspects can be considered an element of good administration. If one takes into account the reasons given by DIAP's Director for considering BPS-SC a quality service organisation, it becomes clear that all of them are directly related to the accomplishment of some items established by the law. In terms of administrative practices, as said before, the organisation seems to follow the routines established throughout its existence just to enable the enforcement of the law.

Formalism in the BPS-SC can also be noticed in the policy of human resource management, or the lack of it. First the dualism in the way personnel is contracted in the system has to be considered. There are two forms of contract. The first is done through public concurrence and the second occurs through special laws that regulate the entry of people in public services without public concurrence to take special positions considered strategic. It is believed that a governor needs assistants of his or her personal choice and trust, since these positions would be strategic for the development of the governor's activities. This fact damages the image of public concurrence as the only and fair way to become a public servant in Brazil. Moreover, it constrains the establishment of objective performance controls characteristic of a more managerialist approach.

The existence of this kind of characteristic in Brazilian law in general, and in Santa Catarina State law in particular, as well as the policy of allowing the undertaking of private service companies to perform activities within the public service, is evidence of the patrimonialist dimension of public servants employment policy, through a selection criteria linked to nepotism and clientelism (Mattos 1990). In this respect Seibel (1993, 1994) explains that patrimonialism is a form of the organisation of power and domination originated in the feudal system of organisation. It is characterised by its legitimation in the figure of the patriarch (who is normally a charismatic leader) and by the inseparability of the public and private spheres of life, that is, the patriarch uses the public dimension of public administration as if it belonged exclusively to him. Hickson and Pugh (1995), Ramos (1983b), and DaMata (1979) also comment that the importance of personal relations in Brazilian society allows aspects like friendship, personalism and nepotism to affect impersonal and rationalised procedures in administration matters.

The same pattern of behaviour is used to fill comissionate positions in BPS-SC administration and this practice jeopardises the establishment of a career system for the Service, since there is no possibility for the servants to achieve positions of greater complexity and better remuneration. The problem related to professionalisation in the Service can be observed by the non-institutionalisation of a career like, for example, the technicians. There is no definition of role of the positions, or the promotion mechanism or of a training and incentive plan either. Moreover, the number of comissionate positions are so high that this limits the career prospects for the servants on the low levels of the hierarchy and gives possibility for the application of patrimonialist practices such as personalism, nepotism and overlaying of functions. Examples of these practices can be observed throughout the BPS-SC. In Chapecó Prison, for example, the Chief of the Officers was a personal choice of the Governor in Charge despite all the pressures against him (chapter 5). Moreover, the Governor of Operations in Florianópolis Prison was a person totally

unknown in the Service who had been a personal choice of the Governor in Charge because they knew each other from outside the Service.

These practices seem to be considered normal and were stated without any concern. Most of the governors, and also some other servants in the Service, believe that this is the right way to fill governors' posts and they do not seem to relate this factor to the lack of career possibilities for them. As Hickson and Pugh (1995), Ramos (1983b), DaMata (1979) and others point out, personalism is a cultural characteristic that affects the administration of public and private enterprises in Latin countries in general.

The overlaying of functions is also common in the Service as a whole. It seems to be related to power struggles between groups within the Service, or to forms of adaptation to job requirements or lack of any other opportunity. Examples of this aspect of the Service can be seen when the Chief of Security allocates inmates to different working activities. He is, in fact, interfering with a function that should be performed by the Governor for Working Activities with the specialised support of the technicians (chapter 6). Other examples are: a) a Governor at DIAP who became an advisor for the General Director instead of performing her activities related to preparation of inmates for release (chapter 6); b) technicians in Chapecó Prison who perform social work to supersede the lack of this position in the prison (chapter 6); and c) officers in Florianópolis Prison changing written rules of the organisation for non-written ones established by themselves in relation to the application of penalties for the inmates (chapter 6).

These elements have a strong negative influence on the professionalisation through a career system in the BPS-SC, jeopardising the policy of human resources. The competence and professionalism of the public servants are not considered and the functional criteria of bureaucratic procedures are established from links of personal trust and political obligations.

The public bureaucracy in the country presents a clear institutional stratification where the presence of a set of traditional and archaic routines, together with a series of modern ideas that could perform an important role in the development of the country's public administration instead of performing just a symbolic role, is constant.

The formalistic and patrimonialistic nature of the legal character of the BPS-SC administration is also related to an overall image of the Service in terms of custody. The legalist approach *per se* is an indication of the emphasis put on the custodial role of the prisons. Such emphasis was also evident when one takes into consideration the indication of lawyers, who have carried out the role of police delegates, for the filling of most governor positions in the prisons. Moreover, these positions are vulnerable, since they are fulfilled by political criteria for relatively short-term performance. This fact contributes to the lack of power for governors to try and implement administrative initiatives different from those that the Service has been performing throughout its existence. Therefore, because of the lack of long-term strategic vision for the Service and the prisons, the group of prison officers found the ground to establish themselves as the powerful group based on security arguments and justifications, as well as on the degree of legitimacy of their operations granted by society as a whole.

Situations like the ones described in this section would cause concern in countries with other patterns of rationality, that is, with other institutional contexts limiting organisations, as seems to be the case in Scotland. As part of Great Britain, Scotland has adopted managerialist ideologies to the management of the public services that are reflected in the case studied, namely the SPS.

The reasons why managerialism has found ground to establish itself in the British context still lacks agreement (Hood 1991). However, the same author argues that a set of social conditions established after the World War II period are likely to explain the institutionalisation of managerialism in Britain, as follows:

- a) changes in income level and distribution, serving to weaken the coalition for government growth in the electorate, and laying conditions for a new tax-conscious winning electoral coalition;
- b) changes in the socio-technical system associated with the development of the lead technologies of the late twentieth-century, serving to remove the traditional barriers between 'public sector work' and 'private sector work';
- c) a shift towards 'new machine politics', the advent of a new campaign technology geared towards making public policy by intensive opinion polling of key groups in the electorate, so that professional party strategists have greater clout in policy-making relative to the voice of experience from the bureaucracy; and
- d) a shift to a more white-collar, socially heterogeneous population less tolerant of 'statist' and uniform approaches in public policy (Hood 1991:7).

Although there are a variety of explanations for the establishment of managerialism in the British context, it emerged most evidently in 1975 with the "New Right" of British politics, when the Conservative Party was a majority and Margaret Thatcher was elected Prime Minister. It does not mean that managerialism is only a characteristic of conservative ideologies (see the case of the Australian labour government, for example - [Hood 1991]), but in Britain it coincides with the arrival of the Conservative Party in power.

The discourse, as stated before (chapter 3), was that the public sector had grown too much and had become costly and inefficient. The solutions suggested by the 'New Right' were based on management practices of the economically successful private sector. Therefore, it would be necessary to privatise all un-necessary companies run by the government. For the remaining services the recipe was for the introduction of market-like mechanisms, such as cost-cutting for competition, contracting-out, and the separation of management and politics among others. In the SPS the threat of privatisation and market-testing were quoted by organisational members as elements relating to the Service quality management approach.

These ideas were the core of the 'New Right' proposals for the country. As Farnham and Horton (1993b:240) argue

"the New Right favoured economic liberalism, unregulated markets, free enterprise and deregulated economy. The private sector was held up as a model of economic efficiency, business competitiveness, wealth-generating enterprise and rational approaches to management... Privatisation or the introduction of private sector management practices into the public sector were the remedies offered by the New Right to solve the 'crisis of the State'."

Changes in the public sector management towards managerialistic approaches in Britain have been incremental. Nevertheless, the SPS in the 1990s became very different from what it was in the 1970s and in the 1980s.

Managerialism continued with the succession of Margaret Thatcher by John Major. It is believed throughout these four consecutive conservative governments that public sector management needed and still needs to improve its productivity. Productivity would be achieved by the combination of maintenance or increase of service quality and cutting down costs.

Language and discourse of private enterprises such as value for money, empowerment, corporate culture and customers, were adopted by public managers. These terms were constantly quoted in the discourse of the SPS organisational members, particularly governors and new prison officers. As Pollitt and Bouckaert (1995:9) comment

"during the 1980s and early 1990s neo-liberal conservative administrators were therefore able to redescribe major public services such as health care and education by using the private sector, market-oriented language of 'customers', 'providers' and 'contracts'. Thus, in the UK, there has been a tendency to try to divorce quality improvements activities from consideration of politician/citizen relationship."

Walsh (1995:92) also comments on the issue, arguing that "the purpose of these changes is to separate the management and delivery of services from politics, and to establish the citizen as a customer".

When managerialist ideas became widespread not only within the government but in the society as a whole and principles of economic efficiency became widely accepted, effective changes took place in the British public sector context. This is to say that institutionalisation of managerialism had occurred. The works of Farnham and Horton (1993a), Pollitt (1993) and Pollitt and Bouckaert (1995) show examples of changes aiming at the implementation of managerialistic ideas in the European, and particularly in British public services. Most of the work draws attention to the cases of the National Health Service (NHS), the Education Sector and the Civil Service. Pollitt (1993:83) provides a good summary of the changes in these three sectors of government activities as follows:

- regime of tight cash limits and cash planning;
- staff cuts;
- the introduction of a system of performance indicators which stress economy and efficiency;
- the introduction of merit pay schemes, linked to appraisal;
- proposals for more devolved budgetary systems, giving greater budgetary responsibility to 'line managers';
- proposals for more extensive management training;
- the introduction of new planning systems which emphasise the achievement of concrete, short-term targets; and
- considerable rhetorical emphasis on responsiveness to the consumer, although only in schools (and there only to a very limited extent) has the individual consumer been given a significant direct presence in the decision-making process. More frequently the consumer is envisaged as a collectivity ("business", "industry", "employers"). Alternatively, consumers are represented *de facto* by central government (e.g. in the shape of the Manpower Service Commission [MSC] purchasing courses from Local Education Authorities [LEAs]), or by

professional providers (such as the General Practitioner [GP] in the proposed NHS internal market).

The results of this research add the SPS to the set of British public organisations covered by the managerialist ideology in the public sector.

By the end of Margaret Thatcher's government and the beginning of John Major's government there was clear evidence of the limitations of the managerial approach that had been adopted. According to Pollitt (1993) and Farnham and Horton (1993c) the first ideas and changes in the public service were performed based on Taylorist elements of good management. However, such principles were not totally suited to public sector activities. Pollitt (1993), for example, points out that it is still a strong value in the British society that services such as health care and education are of government responsibility. Lack of resources for these services or even tight budgets are not acceptable. This aspect can be noted in the case of Dungavel Prison, where organisational members think that in some cases the quality approach in terms of cost-cutting have gone too far and can jeopardise its activities towards rehabilitation of inmates.

In the beginning of John Major's government, the publication of the White Paper 'The Citizen's Charter' provided further evidence of government concern with the image of the public services. The 'Charter' provides a set of principles with the objective of achieving improvements in the provision of public services in the 1990s. Farnham and Horton (1993b) point out that the 'Charter' comprises four major themes: quality, choice, standards and value. "It seeks to achieve: published standards of service; consultative arrangements with the public; clear information; courtesy and efficiency from named staff; user-friendly complaints procedures; and independent validation of performance" (Farnham and Horton 1993b:50). The 'Charter' proposals cover all government services, including the SPS, and it represents a shift on the focus of managerialist approach from the management generical principles of the 1980s to a more service-oriented culture of the 1990s (Farnham and Horton 1993b).

The whole new set of proposals for the management of the public sector in the 1990s is presented by Pollitt (1993:180), as follows:

1. a much bolder and larger scale use of market-like mechanism for those parts of the public sector that could not be transferred directly into private ownership (quasi-markets);
2. intensified organisational and spatial decentralisation of the management and production of services;
3. a constant rhetorical emphasis on the need to improve service quality; and
4. an equally relentless insistence that greater attention had to be given to the wishes of the individual service user/'consumer'.

Pollitt also points out that this set of proposals became known in the academic literature as the "New Public Service" (NPS). That set of proposals is also frequently referred to as "New Public Management" (NPM).

Data presented and analysed in chapter 5 indicates that managerialism is present in the quality approach adopted by the Scottish Prison Service. The first, and perhaps the most obvious, evidence of this is that the SPS is involved in a formal quality management programme. The main characteristics of this programme were presented in chapter 5. Beyond this evident element of managerialism, other evidence can be traced in a chronological order that mark a sequence of events that lead SPS to its actual overall quality management approach. These events were marked by the publication of four major documents by SPS: "Opportunity and Responsibility" (SPS 1990a), "Organising for Excellence" (SPS 1990b), "The Prison Survey" (SPS 1992; 1994), and "The Agency Framework Document" (SPS 1993).

"Opportunity and Responsibility" is a document published by the SPS in May 1990 that marks the beginning of a more rational approach to the management of the Service with an emphasis on long term projects and realising the necessity of strategic thinking and management.

As stated in chapter 5, the document sets the ground for forthcoming changes in the Service towards a more managerial approach. It critically reviews incidents and deficiencies of the Service until 1990, with emphasis on incidents occurring in the 1980s, namely overcrowding, liberalisation of regimes, drugs and deterrent sentencing, and physical limitation of the prisons. It is argued that these factors contributed a great deal towards the increase of the number of long term prisoners, who are the most problematic ones, since they require more resources of the Service as a whole.

In practical terms, the document discusses the development of a new sentence planning system, together with the revision of the link between opportunities and progression through sentence. It seems to represent the initial movement towards a "customer"-driven approach in the management of the Service. This preoccupation is also made clear later in the document when it discusses the balance between security, order and regime. This discussion is founded on the premise that prisoners should be kept in the lowest security category consistent with the need to ensure secure custody and the protection of the public. It is suggested that more prisoners could be placed in security Category C on entry to the prison system. The need for more options for prisoners at the outset or in the early stages of very long sentences it is also argued.

The "Opportunity and Responsibility" document is subtitled "Developing New Approaches to the Management of the Long Term Prison System in Scotland" which, again, shows the increasing importance of a managerial strategic thinking in the Service. It also became known as a "vision for change" document, which also seems to be a sign of an awareness of the importance of continuous change in the management of the organisation in order to achieve success.

In December 1990 the SPS published a document entitled "Organising for Excellence". This document proposes a new organisational structure for the Service aimed at creating executive units with delegate responsibilities for service delivery. It also aimed at flattening the organisational structure decentralising decision-making.

The structure of the SPS was organised on the basis of seven headquarters' divisions headed up by Deputy Directors responsible for defined areas of activity. The divisions were established as follows:

- Division IIIA - Administration
- Division IIIB - Operation
- Division IIIC - Personnel
- Division IIID - Regime Services and Supplies
- Division IIIE - Planning and Development
- Division IIIF - Estates (reporting through Operations)
- Division IIIG - Training and Organisation Development Support

Although this structure was argued to have some strengths (see SPS 1990b:13) it was their argued weaknesses that provided the basis for the proposed structure. These weaknesses were addressed in terms of constraints to the Service's efficiency and effectiveness in responding to the clearly identified need for change (SPS 1990b). The weaknesses identified were mainly: a) lack of effective integration between strategy and operations; b) operational focus of the Prison Service Management Group, or lack of strategic thinking; c) centralised control of key operational issues; d) limited delegation of financial budgets to prisons; e) inadequate financial control and information systems; f) lack of a coherent, integrated line management structure; g) lack of a unified service culture; h) fragmentation of human resource management function; and i) lack of specialist finance and management information system functions. If one takes into consideration the points considered as weaknesses of the Service's organisational structure in 1990, it can be noted that the changes proposed on them are coherent with the nine characteristics that Farnham and Horton (1993:238) point out as characteristics of managerialism in the public sector that led to the New Public Sector management.

The proposed organisational structure was elaborated to enable the Service to reflect its strategic thinking and to enable the operationalisation of the strategic plan.

In the proposed structure SPS is headed up by a Chief Executive, accountable for four major Directors:

1. Strategy and Planning
2. Human Resources
3. Prison
4. Finance and Information Systems

It is interesting to note that the changes in the nomenclature are based on private sector management.

Later, in February 1994, a new document called "Shaping the Future of The Scottish Prison Service" (SPS 1994) was published. This new document proposes new reforms in the Service maintaining the already established idea (among management, at least) of continuous changes. It also follows the developments of managerialism in the 1990 (Pollitt 1993:180). The document was produced bearing in mind three main headlines:

- the need to identify the roles and supporting staffing structure required to deliver the business of the SPS in an effective and efficient manner;
- the identification and development of a job evaluation system capable of measuring and weighting all SPS jobs; and
- the need to design and develop a new reward, appraisal and performance management strategy for the Service (SPS 1994:2).

The continuous emphasis on efficiency and effectiveness as well as a new concern over building evaluation criteria and performance measures can be observed here.

In March 1992 the Service published the first "Prison Survey" (SPS 1992). Having identified its "customers" as being the staff, the prisoners and the public, the Prison Survey was an attempt to assess facilities in the prisons, to judge standards, to measure the atmosphere and the relationships in prison and to discover how prisoners and staff wanted to see the Scottish Prison Service developed. All prisoners and staff

were asked to participate in the survey. The second "Prison Survey" was published in 1994 (SPS 1994), following the plan to perform a new survey every two years. Although it did not comprise the third group of identified customers namely the general public, the surveys show the increasing public service orientation and, in the words of Farnham and Horton (1993:238), a demand-led service to the extent of which the results of the surveys are used in the elaboration of the Service strategic planning, as reported in the interviews conducted in the Headquarters of the SPS.

The Agency Framework Document (SPS 1993) establishes the SPS as an administrative or executive agency. As part of a managerialist ideology of the British context, it aimed at the separation of politics and administration. In this sense, politicians would provide the overall philosophy of the Service while its administration would be "free to manage" (Hood 1991).

The documents described here are a formal and concrete indication of the managerialist characteristics of the Scottish Prison Service and explains its overall quality image. The secondary data presented and discussed in this Section supports and explains data from the interviews conducted in the SPS.

7.3. Discussion and Conclusion

The BPS-SC differs significantly from the SPS in terms of quality definition and initiatives. While the former presents a legalist understanding of quality in the organisation, the latter presents a managerialist quality image, based on a formal quality management programme.

The results presented and discussed in this chapter support the results found in chapters 5 and 6 concerning differences on quality definition among and within organisational groups in the same institutional context. Moreover, they indicate that quality definition, and therefore the rationale of quality definition, varies within the

same organisational group in different institutional contexts. There is a strong indication that the variation on quality perceptions and definitions (as organisational factors) among different contexts are, to a certain extent, determined by the characteristics of the institutional environment in which the organisations operate, particularly on professional, political and ideological issues. These indications would be coherent with the arguments and findings of Karnøe (1995), Scott and Meyer (1994), Meyer and Scott (1992), DiMaggio and Powell (1991) among other institutionalist authors.

Another important issue offered by the results of this study is that the concept of "customer" does not seem to be appropriate for the Prison Service. First there is a great degree of difficulty of accepting and applying the concept to internal groups, particularly to prisoners. Second, there seems to be an attempt by managers in the Scottish case to impose the concept to the Service as part of their managerialist perception of quality, which does not seem to be natural to this kind of organisation. In the Brazilian case, where there is no formal quality management programme, and quality is defined by other means, no relation was made between organisational internal groups and the concept of customer, as was the case in Dungavel Prison in Scotland. Moreover, the general public was considered to be the "customer" group in all cases (in some of them the word customer had to be induced by the author). The results support the arguments that the concept of customer is problematic in the public services sector, since the general public is the ultimate "customer" (Pollitt and Bouckaert 1995; Rees 1992; Swiss 1992).

The results of this research also show that the overall quality image of an organisation varies in different organisational contexts. There are indications that the overall quality image, as an organisational characteristic, is defined both by characteristics of the institutional context of the organisation (Scott 1995; Scott and Meyer 1994; Meyer and Scott 1992, Clegg 1990) as well as by power disputes among

organisational groups (Scott 1992, Clegg 1980; Perrow 1986, Perrow 1978, Georgiou 1973).

In both contexts studied, a managerialist discourse in the political and governmental arena was identified. However, it finds ground to be established and developed in Britain but not in Brazil.

The Scottish case has been limited by managerialist ideas and practices since the mid 1970s. Despite the arguments about its applicability to the public sector it has been implemented successfully in a variety of public services in Britain. It led the SPS to move from an idea of quality probably related to its conflicting objectives of custody and rehabilitation to a formal managerialist approach to quality management. These results follow and add to Farnham and Horton (1993) and Pollitt (1993) data, among others, on public British organisations that have been characterised by managerialist administration.

In the Brazilian case, managerialism is still not a strong institutionalised value in the public sector, although there are some indications that it is growing (see, for example, the Brazilian privatisation programme started by President Fernando Collor and continued by Presidents Itamar Franco and Fernando Henrique Cardoso). Nevertheless, it still remains the culture of public bureaucracy, that in Brazil is characterised by a strong formalist and patrimonialist nature (Souza 1991; Casate 1990; Mattos 1990; DaMatta 1987; DaMatta 1983; Sander 1977). This leads the BPS-SC to a legalist approach to quality with emphasis on the custodial role of the Service, since the patrimonialist and formalist characteristics of the public services strengthens the role of the prison officers in the organisational internal power disputes.

Chapter 8: General Conclusion and Recommendations

The central issue of this study has been the identification and comparison of quality perceptions and initiatives between the Scottish and the Brazilian Prison Service. These two organisations have specific approaches towards quality management. The Scottish Prison Service is involved in a formal quality management programme while in the Brazilian Prison Service quality concern are determined on a more abstract level. Furthermore, these two organisations operate in different institutional environments which have specific implications on quality perceptions and initiatives.

According to the proposed research problem and the specific objectives stated in chapter 1 (Introduction), a set of four general conclusions have been drawn from the results presented and discussed in chapters 5, 6 and 7. The conclusions are related to: 1) quality definition in the SPS and in the BPS-SC; 2) the impact of the formal quality management programme on the job structure of the SPS; 3) the significance of objectives and groups for quality perceptions and initiatives in the BPS-SC, as well as in the SPS; and 4) the significance of the institutional contexts in explaining quality perceptions and initiatives in both organisations.

1) quality definition: the specialised literature on quality management has treated the concept in a universal form. It has been regarded as a managerial philosophy and related techniques, that could be applied to all sorts of organisation everywhere. Although studies have questioned this assumption, there is still very little empirical evidence on the subject. The results of this research provide empirical evidence of the variations in quality definition within and between organisations. The nature of quality definition in the organisations studied in this research was determined by the identification of significant components of quality definition as

perceived by members of different organisational groups. These led to the identification of a rationale behind the quality definition of each organisation.

In the SPS, although Dungavel and Perth prisons are both subjected to the same general quality programme, quality definition varies between each prison. In Dungavel it seems to be related to an emphasis on the rehabilitation purposes, the size of the prison, and the commitment of internal groups with the process of rehabilitation of the inmates. In Perth, quality seems to be related to a greater emphasis on managerial practices, in order to increase efficiency in the performance of the organisational activities.

In Florianópolis Prison and in Chapecó Prison quality is defined by the accomplishment of prisoners' legal rights as well as an emphasis on the custodial role of the prison. Variations between the two prisons were observed in terms of specific practices towards custody. In Chapecó Prison, for example, the issue of discipline and punishment was raised while in Florianópolis the need for a good physical structure for incarceration was emphasised.

The more similar quality definition between Brazilian prisons is likely to be explained by the weaknesses of the rehabilitation goals in that context, due to the situation of the group of technicians, as detailed in chapter 6. It is also likely that if an institution in Brazil with a greater emphasis on rehabilitation had been analysed, the divergence of quality definition and initiatives would have been greater, due to the conflicting nature of the objectives of custody and rehabilitation⁽¹²⁾.

These results suggest that there is a relationship between structural characteristics and quality initiatives in organisations. Moreover, they suggest that

(12) The conflict between objectives of custody and rehabilitation is inherent to their nature, as pointed out by Foucault (1977) and Thompson (1980) among others. Therefore, it is also present in the SPS case. Dungavel Prison, which is mostly a treatment prison, for example, holds only prisoner categories C and D because they require less caution in terms of custody proceedings. It is believed that a higher degree of freedom contributes to a higher degree of success in terms of rehabilitation tasks. In Perth Prison, on the other hand, rehabilitation activities seem to be more limited by security and custody purposes and the personnel responsible for rehabilitation tasks have a more limited scope of action. This conflict can also be noted in Tables 2 and 3 (chapter 5) regarding the components and rationale of quality definition among organisational groups and between the two prisons.

such characteristics affect the perception of quality within organisations, as some studies in the area have already provided initial evidence.

In comparative terms between the prison service in the countries considered in the research, it was observed that there are significant differences among both organisations, as well as some similarities. The similarities are mostly related to the formal objectives of the prison service in general. Quality in the organisations of both countries is related to a certain extent to the objectives of custody and rehabilitation. These objectives are the basic formal goals of the prison service world-wide or, at least, in western societies. The differences are related to the way the group or groups responsible for running the organisations pursue these objectives.

In the Scottish case, it is done through the establishment of a formal quality management programme which implies that managerial strategies and techniques will ultimately promote an efficient balance between the basic objectives of the Service, together with a good economic performance. The results presented in chapter 5 show, however, that even when a formal quality management programme is established the view of quality is neither a consensus among organisational members, nor a consensus among different organisations submitted to the same programme.

In the Brazilian case quality is pursued through the accomplishment of formal legal procedures in relation to specific set of prisoners' rights and the emphasis put on the custodial role of the prison. This is well accepted within the organisation. However, there is no strong consensus among specific elements of quality definition in the BPS-SC as well. It varies between organisational groups according to their specific objectives.

The results then suggest that quality, even as a managerial strategy, cannot be taken as an universal concept or as a formal pre-established package applicable everywhere. It will vary in relation to specific characteristics of groups and organisations.

The use of the term "customer" as a category for defining quality and for guiding organisational quality practices seems to be problematic when the public service is considered. This statement is largely discussed in the specialised literature on quality and public sector management. The findings of this research support the argument that the "customer" in the public sector is not easy to define and identify. Moreover, they suggest that the imposition of the term customer to all kinds of organisation, even to the ones where it seems to be problematic, is a specific managerialist form of thinking and acting. The concept was imposed on the SPS by the group of managers as part of a total programme of quality management, regardless of its suitability. In the BPS-SC, where there is no managerialist rationale involved in defining quality, it was not even mentioned. When asked specifically about the issue, members of the BPS-SC appointed the general public as whom the organisation is ultimately accountable.

2) the impact of a formal quality management programme on the job structure: the literature presents divergent opinions on the subject. Some studies based on empirical evidence demonstrate that quality management enhances the worker's autonomy, enabling a re-skilling process through enrichment of the tasks, and creating a participative environment based on trust relations. Others argue the opposite, that is, that quality management enhances management's control over labour, and that the re-skilling process is illusive.

However, the results of this research conducted in the SPS support the arguments and findings of a third group of researchers. Quality management can provide a degree of job enrichment and contributes to a re-skilling process. The need for a broader understanding of the function and for more managerial skill was verified on different levels of the organisation. The delegation process, however, is accompanied by the establishment of targets and performance measures defined in the higher levels of the hierarchy. Therefore, it can be argued that the control that management has over organisational activities changed in form, but not in degree.

Quality management also seems to provide a higher degree of job satisfaction among most of the organisational members, since they are involved in more activities which increase their scope of decision making. However, it does not necessarily contribute to an environment of trust relations, since a high degree of uncertainty was noted with regard to the future of the jobs in the organisation, due to the introduction of the quality management programme (see chapter 5). It is likely that a more open and well defined policy in the area would help the creation of such an environment.

The results also show that the extent to which changes affect jobs varies according to groups of professions and tasks performed. In the cases studied governors and prison officers were the most affected groups, while the technicians were not affected significantly.

There is a clear attempt to create a stronger identification with management values and goals. This is being achieved by a massive training programme and by changes in the profile of the new employees. There is an initial training package on quality management which is introduced to the staff, followed by specific training for each of the main points of the quality ideology of the organisation. As some authors have already suggested, quality management can work as a cultural control device when it incorporates a human resources management policy.

3) the significance of objectives and groups for quality perceptions and initiatives: some studies have suggested so far that structural characteristics are important in determining quality perception in organisations. These studies, however, are very few, since quality has been mostly dealt with by the literature in terms of the analysis of formal programmes, or in terms of customers' perceptions of quality. This research provides strong evidence of such a relationship. In the Brazilian case, where there is no formal quality management programme, an alternative form to analyse quality was conducted, based on the concepts of operative objectives and organisational groups. Three organisational groups were chosen for the study: governors, technicians and prison officers. The results suggest that there is a degree

of correlation between objectives and quality definition among organisational groups. Quality perception in each group varies according to their specific objectives. The governors have defined quality through a variety of elements which emphasise the DIAP's general guidelines, as well as objectives of custody and rehabilitation. The lack of consensus among the governors towards a quality definition can be explained by differences in their educational and professional backgrounds, by the lack of a strategic philosophy for the Service as a whole, and by the short term period in which they occupy such positions, since these positions are filled according to political criteria. Technicians relate quality primarily to the re-habilitation objectives of the prison. A quality prison would, therefore, be one that would provide the necessary conditions to rehabilitate the inmates for their return to society. The results of this research suggest that the implementation of this vision of quality is constrained mainly by the emphasis given to custodial objectives within the Service and by the social legitimacy of custody as a main objective of the prison. Prison officers' perception of quality in a prison is related to custodial objectives. Although they argue that they also perform rehabilitation activities, it is always done through custodial, and even punishment, practices.

These three groups interact within the organisation trying to impose their own objectives and therefore their quality perception. Prison officers are the most successful concerning the organisational daily activities in the context of the Brazilian prisons studied. Their success is related to the extent to which they can keep a large number of prisoners from escaping as well as by the legitimacy of their social role. This result supports the argument of other authors that social legitimacy is an important element in the setting of organisational goals.

The link between quality and objectives of organisational groups seems to be particularly prevalent where there is no strategic initiative, no well defined mission statement, and conflicting objectives. However, even in the Scottish case, where a formal quality management programme provided a strategic vision and a well defined

mission statement for the Service, different organisational groups seemed to perceive quality in different ways, again, according to their objectives. Other structural characteristics also seem to affect quality perceptions like size, professions and the nature of organisational activities.

Based on some studies on objectives, groups and power in organisations, it is possible to suggest that, if there is a link between quality perceptions and objectives of groups, the overall quality image of the organisation and its initiatives towards quality practices will vary according to the interchanges of organisational groups in the power positions.

4) the significance of institutional contexts in explaining quality initiatives and perceptions: the literature has been presenting a series of studies presenting initial evidence that organisational characteristics are, to a certain extent, determined by the characteristics of the institutional environment in which the organisation operates (Pollitt and Bouckaert 1995; Zeitz and Mittal 1993; Farnham and Horton 1993a; Benson, Saraph and Schroeder 1991). This research suggests such a link. The results presented and discussed in chapter 7 indicate that quality definition, and therefore the rationale of quality definition, varies between organisations in different institutional contexts. There are indications that the variation on quality perceptions and definitions in different contexts are, to a certain degree, determined by the characteristics of the institutional environment in which the organisations operate, particularly by professional, political and ideological issues. These indications are consistent with the arguments and findings of the studies based upon institutional theory.

In both contexts studied a managerialist discourse in the political and governmental arena was identified. However, such a discourse found the grounds to be established and made operational in Britain, but not in Brazil.

The managerialist approach to quality in the SPS is related to a general policy for the public sector administration. Such a policy is based on the application of

management principles of the private sector, particularly those related to economic efficiency, to the management of the public sector.

The legalist approach to quality, together with an emphasis on the custodial role of the prison in the BPS-SC, is related to the formalist and patrimonialist nature of the public administration in that context. Formalism and patrimonialism favour the lack of managerial vision in the Service in a strategic sense, as well as a high degree of personalism in the organisational practices.

Having drawn the main conclusive issues of this research, I shall propose some points for further studies in this area. It seems appropriate to stress here that the suggestions that follow were developed from different phases of the research. Some of them have emerged during the period of fieldwork, others during the analysis and interpretation of data. It is also important to emphasise that the suggestions below do not represent the entire set of issues related to the subject of this thesis. However, they do seem to represent interesting points of investigation.

It would be interesting, for example, to find out how quality is defined in organisations that are and those that are not involved in a formal quality management programme and in organisations in the same institutional environment. It would add to the understanding of quality in organisations as a more general concept rather than those limited to formal programmes, or based only on customers' perceptions. It would also be interesting to investigate such an issue in organisations in different sectors of activity (manufacturing and service organisations, as well as public and private ones). It could provide, for example, clearer assumptions on what specific characteristics of organisations would be linked to specific dimensions of quality definition, which would assist in the clarification of the use of the concept, and the understanding of initiatives towards quality improvements.

In terms of the relationship between quality management practices, job structure and control in organisations, it would be interesting to continue the

investigations into the impact of the introduction of such practices on specific dimensions of organisational structure and processes. The issue of the impact of management techniques and new technologies on the work practices is central in organisation studies. Specifically in terms of quality management, most of the studies available are still theoretical. Empirical evidence is minimal and mostly based on case studies. The case studies though have already provided some useful results. However, the results offered point to contradictory interpretations. This fact points out the need for more empirical investigation with perhaps the use of different methods of research, such as organisational surveys or controlled experiments (e.g. Latin Square Design with Repetitive Measures [Neter, Wasserman and Kutner 1990]).

Another area of this research that could provide interesting future study would be to analyse the relationship between quality perceptions and groups in organisations. This research already provides evidence of the existence of such a relationship. However, the study was conducted in an organisation with conflicting objectives. How would quality perceptions be formed by groups in organisations with strong corporate cultures and with well defined and less conflicting objectives? Would it have a more uniform definition of quality? Would the practices of different organisational groups be less conflictive? Studies of this nature would provide some insight into what extent these variables are correlated.

In the present situation in which the globalisation of the economy is a reality, to pursue more studies on a cross-cultural comparative basis seems to be even more important. They can help to understand to what extent various concepts and ideas considered universal to a certain extent, can be affected by cultural and institutional differences between societies. Moreover, it could offer an insight into the implementation and adaptation of concepts and techniques in different countries.

The results of this research are limited to the cases studied due to the nature of the methodology used. However, I believe that these results provide useful information to be added to the existing knowledge on the subject. They also provide

a platform for new studies in both established and new areas of investigation. In practical terms, this research can be used to inform organisations on some relevant issues to be taken into consideration on the implementation of quality management programmes in Scotland and in Brazil, particularly in the public sector.

References

- Alasuutari, P. *Researching Culture: Qualitative Method and Cultural Studies*. London: Sage, 1995.
- Anderson, C., Zeithaml, C. P. Stage of the Product Life Cycle, Business Strategy, and Business Performance, *Academy of Management Journal*, v.27, p.5-24, 1984.
- Barker, J. R. Tightning the Iron Cage: Concertive Control in Self-Managing Teams, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.38, p.408-437, 1993.
- Binns, D. Total Quality Management, Organisation Theory and the New Right: a Contribution to the Critique of Bureaucratic Totalitarianism, *Ocasional Papers in Business, Economy and Society*, n.11, University of East London, 1993.
- Blau, P. M., and Scott, R. *Formal Organizations: a Comparative Approach*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1963.
- Benson, P. G., Saraph, J. V., Schroeder, R. G. The Effects of Organizational Context on Quality Management: an Empirical Investigation, *Management Science*, v.37, p.1107-1124, 1991.
- Birley, S. Corporate Strategy and the Small Firm. In: D. Asch and C. Bowman (eds.) *Readings in Strategic Management*. London: MacMillan, 1989.
- Booms, B. H., Bitner, M. J. Marketing Strategies and Organization Structures for Service Firms. In: J. Donnelly and W. George (eds.) *Marketing of Services*. Chicago: American Marketing, 1981.
- Brasil. *Programa Brasileiro de Qualidade e Produtividade (PBQP), Termo de Referência*. Presidência da República, Diário Oficial, 28 de junho de 1990, fls. 12456-8.
- Brasil. *Lei de Execução Penal*. Organização dos Textos, Notas Remissivas e Índices por Juarez Oliveira. 2 ed. São Paulo: Saraiva, 1986.
- Braverman, H. *Labor and Monopoly Capital: the Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century*. New York: Monthly Review Press, 1974.
- Bryman, A. *Research Methods and Organisation Studies*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Burris, B. H. Technocratic Organization and Control, *Organization Studies*, v.10, p.1-22, 1989.

- Cardoso, F. H. O Estado na América Latina. In: P. Pinheiro (ed.) *O Estado na América Latina*. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 1977.
- Carmem, J. M., Langeard, E. Growth Strategies of Service Firms, *Strategic Management Journal*, v.1, p.7-22, 1980.
- Carvalho, C. A. P. Objetivos Versus Conflito nas Organizações: um Estudo de Caso, *Anais do 16º ENANPAD* (Encontro Anual de Programas de Pós-Graduação em Administração), Salvador, BA, Brasil, v.9, p.87-101, 1993.
- Casate, M. L. *Isonomia Salarial: um Estudo em Universidades Federais Brasileiras*. Dissertação de Mestrado, Programa de Pós Graduação em Administração, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Florianópolis, SC, Brasil, 1990.
- Child, J. *Organisation: a Guide to Problems and Practice*. 2nd ed. London: Harper & Row, 1984.
- Clegg, S. *Modern Organizations: Organization Studies in the Postmodern World*. London: Sage, 1990.
- Clegg, S., Dunkerley, D. *Organization, Class and Control*. London: Routledge, 1980.
- Coyle, A. *Inside: Rethinking Scotland's Prisons*. Edinburgh: Scottish Child, 1991.
- Crosby, P. B. *Quality Without Tears*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1984.
- Crozier, M. *The Bureaucratic Phenomenon*. London: Tavistock, 1964.
- Cyert, R. M., March, J. G. *A Behavioral Theory of the Firm*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1963.
- DaMatta, R. *O Que Faz o Brasil, Brasil?* 6 ed. Rio de Janeiro: Rocco, 1993.
- DaMatta, R. *A Casa e a Rua: Espaço, Cidadania, Mulher e Morte no Brasil*. Rio de Janeiro: Guanabara, 1987.
- DaMatta, R. *Carnavais, Malandros e Heróis: para uma Sociologia do Dilema Brasileiro*. 4 ed. Rio de Janeiro: Zahar, 1983.
- DaMatta, R. Avaliação: uma Perspectiva Sociológica, *Revista de Administração Pública*, v.13, p.115-124, 1979.
- Dawson, P., Palmer, G. Total Quality Management in Australian and New Zealand Companies: some Emerging Themes and Issues, *International Journal of Employment Studies*, v.1, p.115-136, 1993.
- Dawson, P., Webb, J. New Production Arrangements: the Totally Flexible Cage?, *Work, Employment and Society*, v.3, p.221-238, 1989.

- Deming, W. E. *Out of the Crisis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
- DIAP. *Relatório Anual de Atividades*. Florianópolis, SC, Brasil, Dezembro, 1993.
- DiMaggio, P. J., Powell, W. W. Introduction. In: W. W. Powel and P. J. DiMaggio (eds.) *The New Institutionalism in Organisational Analysis*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- DiMaggio, P. J., Powell, W. W. The Iron Cage Revisited: Institutional Isomorphism and Collective Rationality in Organizational Field, *American Sociological Review*, v.48, p.147-160, 1983.
- Dixon, B. R., Bouma, G. D., Atkinson, G. B. J. *A Handbook of Social Science Research*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991.
- Drucker, P. F. *The Practice of Management*. London: Hinemman, 1961.
- Edwards, R. C. The Social Relations of Production at the Point of Production. In: M. Zey-Ferrel and M. Aiken (eds.) *Complex Organizations: Cultural Perspectives*. Glenview, IL: Scott Foreman, 1981.
- Faoro, R. *Os Donos do Poder: Formação do Patronato Brasileiro*. 8 ed. São Paulo: Globo, 1989.
- Farnham, D., Horton, S. *Managing the New Public Services*. London: MacMillan, 1993a.
- Farnham, D., Horton, S. Managing Private and Public Organisations. In: D. Farnham and S. Horton (eds.) *Managing the New Public Services*. London: MacMillan, 1993b.
- Farnham, D., Horton, S. The New Public Service Managerialism: an Assessment. In: D. Farnham and S. Horton (eds.) *Managing the New Public Services*. London: MacMillan, 1993c.
- Fayol, H. *General and Industrial Management*. London: Pitman, 1949.
- Feigenbaum, A. V. *Total Quality Control*. 3rd ed. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1983.
- Ferrándiz, V. R. Plan de Calidad Total en el Sistema Sanitario: Gestion de la Calidad Total, *Revista Indicadores da Qualidade e Produtividade*, IPEA, Brasília, v 5, p.106-123, 1992.
- Foucault, M. *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1977.
- Galbraith, J.K. *The New Industrial State*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1967.

- Garvin, D. A. Competing on the Eight Dimensions of Quality, *Harvard Business Review*, v.65, p.101-109, 1987.
- Garvin, D. A. Quality on the Line, *Harvard Business Review*, v.61, p.65-73, 1983.
- Georgiou, P. The Goal Paradigm and Notes Towards a Counter-Paradigm, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.18, p.291-310, 1973.
- Goffman, E. *Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and Other Inmates*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1968.
- Hackman, J. R., Wageman, R. Total Quality Management: Empirical, Conceptual, and Practical Issues, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.40, p.309-342, 1995.
- Hage, J. An Axiomatic Theory of Organizations, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.10, p.289-320, 1965.
- Hickson, D. A Convergence in Organization Theory, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.11, p.224-235, 1966.
- Hickson, D., Pugh, D. S. *Management Worldwide: the Impact of Societal Culture on Organizations around the Globe*. London: Penguin, 1995.
- Hill, S. How do You Manage a Flexible Firm: the Total Quality Model, *Work, Employment and Society*, v.5, p.395-415, 1991a.
- Hill, S. Why Quality Circles Failed But Total Quality Management might Succeed, *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, v.29, p.541-568, 1991b.
- Hoffmann, M. E. *A Organização Prisional Frente aos seus Objetivos de Reabilitação: um Estudo de Caso na Penitenciária de Florianópolis*. Dissertação de Mestrado, Programa de Pós Graduação em Administração, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Florianópolis, SC, Brasil, 1992.
- Hood, C. A Public Management for All Seasons?, *Public Administration*, v.69, p.3-19, 1991.
- Ishikawa, K. *What is Total Quality Control? The Japanese Way*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1985.
- Jepperson, R. L. Institutions, Institutional Effects, and Institutionalism. In: W. W. Powell and P. J. DiMaggio (eds.) *The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- Juran, J. M. *Quality Control Handbook*. 3rd ed. New York: McGraw Hill, 1979.
- Kanter, R. M. *When Giants Learn to Dance*. London: Unwin Hyman, 1990.

- Kanter, R. M. *The Change Masters*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1983.
- Karnøe, P. Institutional Interpretations and Explanations of Differences in American and Danish Approaches to Innovation. In: W. R. Scott and S. Christensen (eds.) *The Institutional Construction of Organisations*. London: Sage, 1995.
- Kerfoot, D., Knights, D. Empowering the 'Quality Worker'?: the Seduction and Contradiction of the Total Quality Phenomenon. In: A. Wilkinson and H. Willmott (eds.) *Making Quality Critical: New Perspectives on Organizational Change*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Kerfoot, D., Knights, D. *Managerial Evangelism: Quality Management in Financial Services*. Paper presented in the 11th Annual Labour Process Conference, Blackpool, England, March 1993.
- Kohn, M. L. *Cross-National Research in Sociology*. London: Sage, 1989.
- Kouzmin, A. Control and Organization: Towards a Reflexive Analysis. In: P. Boreham and G. Dow (eds.) *Ideology and Control in the Capitalist Labour Process*. Melbourne: McMillan, 1980.
- Leonard, F. S., Sasser, W. E. The Incline of Quality, *Harvard Business Review*, v.60, p.163-171, 1982.
- Lewis, B. R., Mitchell, V. Defining and Measuring the Quality of Customer Service, *Marketing, Intelligence and Planning*, v.8, p.11-17, 1990.
- Likert, R. *New Patterns of Management*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1961.
- Litwak, E. Models of Bureaucracy which Permit Conflict, *American Sociological Review*, v.67, p.177-184, 1961.
- Machado-da-Silva, C. L., Fonseca, V. S. *Patterns of Meaning: Institutionalization and Contingencies*. Paper presented at the 11th EGOS (European Group for Organization Studies) Colloquium, Paris, July, 1993.
- March, J. G., Simon, H. A. *Organizations*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1958.
- Martin, J. Breaking up the Mono-Method Monopolies in Organisational Analysis. In: J. Hassard and D. Pym (eds.) *The Theory and Philosophy of Organisations: Critical Issues and New Perspectives*. London: Routledge, 1990.
- Mattos, P. L. Racionalização Administrativa x Concepções Patrimonialistas do Estado no Provimento de Pessoal no Serviço Público Federal: o Ministério da Educação e Cultura entre 1960 e 1985, *Anais do 14º ENANPAD* (Encontro Anual de Programas de Pós-Graduação em Administração), Belo Horizonte, MG, Brasil, v.8, p.77-92, 1990.

- McGregor, D. *The Human Side of Enterprise*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1960.
- Meyer, J. W., Rowan, B. Institutionalized Organizations: Formal Structures as Myth and Ceremony, *American Journal of Sociology*, v.83, p.340-363, 1977.
- Meyer, J. W., Scott, W. R. *Organizational Environments: Ritual and Rationality*. Updated Edition. London: Sage, 1992.
- Meyer, J. W., Scott, W. R., Deal, T. E. Institutional and Technical Sources of Organizational Structure: Explaining the Structure of Educational Organizations. In: J. W. Meyer and W. R. Scott (eds.) *Organizational Environments: Ritual and Rationality*. Updated Edition. London: Sage, 1992.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M. *Qualitative Data Analysis*. 2nd ed. London: Sage, 1994.
- Mintzberg, H., Waters, A. A. Of Strategies, Deliberate and Emergent. In: D. Asch and C. Bowman (eds.) *Readings in Strategic Management*. London: MacMillan, 1989.
- Morgan, G. *Beyond the Method*. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1983.
- Munro-Faure, L., Munro-Faure, M. *Implementing Total Quality Management*. London: Pitman, 1992.
- Neter, J., Wasserman, W., Kutner, M. H. *Applied Linear Statistical Models: Regression, Analysis of Variance, and Experimental Designs*. Boston: Irwin, 1990.
- Oakland, J. S. *Total Quality Management*. London: Heinemann, 1989.
- Ouchi, W. G. A Conceptual Framework for the Design of Organizational Control Mechanisms, *Management Science*, v.25, p.833-848, 1979.
- Ouchi, W. G. The Relationship Between Organizational Structure and Organizational Control, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.22, p.95-113, 1977.
- Ouchi, W. G., Maguire, M. A. Organizational Control: Two Functions, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.20, p.559-569, 1975.
- Palmer, G., Allan C. Yet Another Panacea? The Quality Management Movement in Australia. In: J. Marceau (ed.) *Reworking the World: Organizations, Technologies, and Cultures in Comparative Perspectives*. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1992.

- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L. A Conceptual Model of Service Quality and Its Implications for Future Research, *Journal of Marketing*, v.49, p.41-50, 1985.
- Penitenciária de Chapecó. *Recomendações para o Bom Andamento do Trabalho*. Chapecó, SC, Brasil, 1993.
- Penitenciária de Florianópolis. *Pesquisa Realizada Junto aos Agentes Prisionais da Penitenciária de Florianópolis*. Florianópolis, SC, Brasil, 1992.
- Perrow, C. *Complex Organizations: a Critical Essay*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1986.
- Perrow, C. The Analysis of Goals in Complex Organizations. In: Y. Hasenfeld and R. A. English (eds.) *Human Service Organizations*. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1978.
- Petelin, G. Quality: a Higher Level of Mediocrity?, *Australian Journal of Communication*, v.19, p.140-152, 1992.
- Peters, T., Waterman, R. *In Search of Excellence*. New York: Harper and Row, 1982.
- Piore, M., Sabel, C. *The Second Industrial Devide: Possibilities for Prosperity*. New York: Basic Books, 1984.
- Pollert, A. The Orthodoxy of Flexibility. In: A. Pollert, (ed.) *Farewell to Flexibility*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1991.
- Pollert, A. The Flexible Firm: Fixation or Fact?, *Work, Employment and Society*, v.2, p.218-316, 1988.
- Pollitt, C. *Managerialism and the Public Services: Cuts or Cultural Change in the 1990s?* 2nd ed. Oxford: Blackwell, 1993.
- Pollitt, C., Bouckaert, G. Defining Quality. In: C. Pollitt and G. Bouckaert (eds.) *Quality Improvements in European Public Services*. London: Sage, 1995.
- Procter, S. J., Rowlinson, M., McArdle, L., Hassard, J., Forrester, P. Flexibility, Politics and Strategy: in Defence of the Model of the Flexible Firm, *Work, Employment and Society*, v.8, p.221-242, 1994.
- Pugh, D. S., Hickson, D. J. *Organizational Structure in its Context: the Aston Programme I*. London: Saxon House, 1976.
- Pugh, D. S., Hinings, C. R. *Organizational Structure: Extentions and Replications; the Aston Programme II*. London Saxon House, 1976.

- Rago, W. V. Adapting Total Quality Management (TQM) to Government: Another Point of View, *Public Administration Review*, v.54, p.61-64, 1994.
- Ramos, A. G. *A Nova Ciência das Organizações: uma Reconceituação da Riqueza das Nações*. Rio de Janeiro: FGV, 1983a.
- Ramos, A. G. *Administração e Contexto Brasileiro: Esboço de uma Teoria Geral da Administração*. 2 ed. Rio de Janeiro: FGV, 1983b.
- Rees, J. L. Managing Quality in Public Services. In: C. Duncan (ed.) *The Evolution of Public Management: Concepts and Techniques for the 1990s*. London: MacMillan, 1992.
- Riggs, F. W. *Administration in Developing Countries: the Theory of Prismatic Society*. Boston, Mass.: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1964.
- Rosen, M., Baroudi, J. Computer-Based Technology and the Emergence of New Forms of Managerial Control. In: D. Knights and H. Willmott (eds.) *Skill and Consent: Contemporary Studies in the Labour Process*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Sander, B. *Educação Brasileira: Valores Formais e Valores Reais*. Rio de Janeiro: Pioneira, 1977.
- Seibel, E. J. Cultura Política, Ética e Gestão Pública. *Anais do 17º ENANPAD* (Encontro Anual de Programas de Pós-Graduação em Administração), Curitiba, PR, Brasil, 1994.
- Seibel, E. J. Administração e Cultura Ético-Política, *Sequência*, v.14, p.59-63, 1993.
- Scott, W. R. Symbols and Organizations: from Barnard to the Institutionalists. In: O. E. Williamson, (ed.) *Organization Theory: from Chester Barnard to the Present and Beyond*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Scott, W. R. Introduction: from Technology to Environment. In: J. W. Meyer and W. R. Scott (eds.) *Organizational Environments: Ritual and Rationality*. Updated Edition. London: Sage, 1992.
- Scott, W. R. *Organizations: Rational, Natural and Open Systems*. 3rd ed. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1992.
- Scott, W. R., Christensen, S. *The Institutional Construction of Organizations*. London: Sage, 1995.
- Scott, W. R., Meyer, J. W. *Institutional Environments and Organizations: Structural Complexity and Individualism*. London: Sage, 1994.

- Scott, W. R., Meyer, J. W. The Organization of Societal Sectors. In: J. W. Meyer and W. R. Scott (eds.) *Organizational Environments: Ritual and Rationality*. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1983.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Shaping the Future of The Scottish Prison Service*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1994a.
- Scottish Prison Service. *The Prison Survey*. Edinburgh: SPS Occasional Papers Report n.10, 1994b.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Scottish Prison Service Agency Framework Document*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1993a.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Guidance for the 1994 Strategic Planning Round*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1993b.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Corporate Plan*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1993c.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Defining Quality in a Public Service*. Speech given by the Head of Planning and Development Services of the SPS at the Second Quality Network Meeting, Edinburgh, September, 1993d.
- Paper presented at the 11th EGOS (European Group for Organization Studies) Colloquium, Paris, July, 1993.
- Scottish Prison Service. *The Prison Survey*. Edinburgh: SPS Occasional Papers n.1, 1992.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Opportunity and Responsibility: Developing New Approaches to the Long Term Prison System in Scotland*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1990a.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Organising for Excellence*. Edinburgh: SPS, 1990b.
- Scottish Prison Service. *Training and Organisational Development Service: Facing the Future*. Edinburgh: SPS, n/d.
- Selznik, P. *Leadership in Administration*. New York: Harper and Row, 1957.
- Selznik, P. *TVA and the Grass Roots*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1949.
- Sewell, G., Wilkinson, B. Someone to Watch Over Me: Surveillance, Discipline and the Just-In-Time Labour Process, *Sociology*, v.26, p.271-289, 1992.
- Souza, M. J. C. *O Discurso e a Prática da Política de Recursos Humanos: um Estudo na Administração Direta do Estado de Santa Catarina*. Dissertação de Mestrado em Administração, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Florianópolis, SC, Brasil, 1991.

- Storey, J., K. Sisson K. Looking to the Future. In: J. Storey (ed.) *New Perspectives on Human Resource Management*. London: Routledge, 1989.
- Schwartzman, S. *Bases do Autoritarismo Brasileiro*. 3 ed. Rio de Janeiro: Campus, 1988.
- Swiss, J. E. Adapting Total Quality Management (TQM) to Government, *Public Administration Review*, v.52, p.356-362, 1992.
- Tannembaum, A. S. *Control in Organizations*. New York: McGraw Hill, 1968.
- Taylor, F. W. *Scientific Management*. New York: Harper, 1947.
- Thompson, A. *A Questão Penitenciária*. 2 ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forence, 1980.
- Thompson, P. Postmodernism: Fatal Distraction. In: J. Hassard and M. Parker (eds.) *Postmodernism and Organizations*. London: Sage, 1993.
- Thompson, V. A. Bureaucracy and Innovation, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, v.10, p.1-20, 1965.
- Tomaney, J. The Reality of Workplace Flexibility, *Capital and Class*, 1990.
- Walsh, K. Quality Through Markets: the New Public Sector Management. In: A. Wilkinson and H. Willmott (eds.) *Making Quality Critical: New Perspectives on Organizational Change*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Webb, J. Quality Management and the Management of Quality. In: A. Wilkinson and H. Willmott (eds.) *Making Quality Critical: New Perspectives on Organizational Change*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Weber, M. *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1948.
- Wilkinson, A. Managing Human Resources for Quality. In: B. G. Dale (ed.) *Managing Quality*. 3rd ed. London: Prentice-Hall, 1993.
- Wilkinson, A., Allen, P., Snape, E. TQM and the Management of Labour, *Employee Relations*, v.13, p.24-31, 1991.
- Wilkinson, A., Marchington, M., Goodman, J. Total Quality Management and Employee Involvement, *Human Resource Management Journal*, v.2, p.1-20, 1992.
- Wilkinson, A., Willmott, H. Introduction. In: A. Wilkinson and H. Willmott (eds.) *Making Quality Critical: New Perspectives on Organizational Change*. London: Routledge, 1995.

- Wilson, D. C. *A Strategy of Change: Concepts and Controversies in the Management of Change*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Yin, R. K. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. London: Sage, 1994.
- Zeithaml, V. A. How Consumer Evaluation Process Differ Between Goods and Services. In: J. Donnelly and W. George (eds.) *Marketing of Services*. Chicago: American Marketing, 1981.
- Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L., Parasuraman, A. Communication and Control Process in the Delivery of Service Quality, *Journal of Marketing*, v.52, p.35-48, 1988.
- Zeitz, G., Mittal, V. *Total Quality Management - The Deming Method as a New Managerial Ideology: Institutionalization Patterns in the United States*. Paper presented at the 11th EGOS (European Group for Organization Studies) Colloquium, Paris, July, 1993.
- Zucker, L. G. The Role of Institutionalization in Cultural Persistence, *American Sociological Review*, v.42, p.726-743, 1977.

Appendix 1: Basic Interview Schedule for the Scottish Organisations

1. Can you please describe your job?
2. What is your professional background? (educational background and past professional experience)
3. In your opinion, what is quality in the prison service?
4. How was the idea of quality management introduced here? How did it start being implemented?
5. Is the quality management approach (way of management) affecting your job? How?
 - 5.1. Do you think in terms of a customer-supplier relationship in your job?
 - 5.2. Who are the customers?
 - 5.3. Is your job more or less demanding now? Comment, please.
 - 5.4. Did the introduction of the quality approach increase, decrease or did not change significantly:
 - the need for a broader understanding of your function.
 - the requirements for your managerial skills.
 - the decision-making process (e.g. centralisation/decentralisation and nature of decisions).
 - the level of overall job satisfaction (yours and the staff's in general).
 - the morale of the staff (yours and the staff's in general).
6. Do you take part in some kind of team-working activity? Can you describe it, please? (items: who takes part; what is it for; problem-solving and propose ideas) In your opinion, has it been useful?
7. Who are your subordinates? How do you check their performance?
8. To whom do you have to report your activities? How is it done?
9. Are there any rules and regulations to be followed for the development of your activities? Are they written?
10. How do you know that you are providing a quality service?
11. Could you please comment on the relationship between quality and value for money?

Appendix 2: Roteiro Básico de Entrevista para as Organizações Brasileiras

1. Qual é a formação profissional do Sr(a).? (educacional e/ou prática profissional)
2. O Sr(a). poderia descrever o seu trabalho?
3. Quais são, na opinião do Sr(a)., as principais características do estilo administrativo desta organização, ou seja, o que o Sr(a). destacaria como principais focos de atenção da atual administração da organização?
4. Existem documentos que estipulam que atividades devem ser desenvolvidas pela organização? Quais? E no que se refere ao desenvolvimento das atividades internas?
5. Como é o processo de seleção de pessoal? (incluir aspectos relativos à promoção e treinamento no DIAP e nas penitenciárias)
6. Quem são as pessoas diretamente subordinadas ao Sr(a). na estrutura hierárquica da organização? Como o Sr(a). verifica e avalia o desempenho dessas pessoas?
7. A quem o Sr(a). tem que reportar as suas atividades? Como isso é feito?
8. Que tipo de decisão está envolvido no desempenho das suas funções? (abordar questões relativas ao tipo, amplitude e participação na tomada de decisão em níveis superiores da hierarquia)
9. Como o Sr(a). definiria um serviço penal de qualidade?
10. Pode-se considerar que esta organização oferece serviços de qualidade? Por quê? (exemplo)
11. Quem o Sr(a). considera como clientes ou consumidores em relação às atividades que a organização desenvolve?
12. Como funciona a questão do orçamento do DIAP e das penitenciárias? (repasse de recursos: forma, periodicidade, montante médio etc)
13. Custa muito caro administrar esta organização?
14. O Sr(a). poderia fazer um comentário sobre a relação entre qualidade e recursos financeiros? (Ex.: é preciso uma alta quantia de recursos financeiros para oferecer serviços de qualidade?)

Translation: Basic Interview Schedule for the Brazilian Organisations

1. What is your professional background? (educational background and past professional experience)
2. Can you please describe your job?
3. Which are, in your opinion, the main characteristics of the administrative style of this organisation, that is, what would you stress as the main focus of attention of the actual administration?
4. Are there written documents that guide the organisational activities? What are they? How about the development of internal activities?
5. How is the selection process performed? (include aspects related to training and promotion at DIAP and in the prisons)
6. Who are your subordinates? How do you check their performance?
7. To whom do you have to report your activities? How is it done?
8. What kind of decision-making is involved in your activities? (include issues on type of decision and participation in the decision-making process on the higher levels of the hierarchy)
9. How would you define a quality prison service?
10. Is it possible to consider that this organisation provides a good service? Why?
11. Who do you consider to be the customers of the organisation?
12. Could you explain to me the procedures related to the budget of the DIAP and of the prisons?
13. Is it expensive to run the organisation?
14. Could you please comment on the relationship between quality and financial resources? (e.g. Is it necessary to be allocated a high level of financial resources in order to offer good quality services?)